MINUTES OF THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE HISTORICAL COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WORCESTER

October 11, 2018

LEVI LINCOLN CHAMBER, ROOM 309 - CITY HALL

Commission Members Present:	Robyn Conroy Devon Kurtz Janet Theerman Mark Wamback Tomi Stefani, Alternate
Commission Members Absent:	Randolph Bloom Diane Long Andrew Shveda Courtney Ross Escobar, Alternate
Staff Members Present:	Susan Arena, Division of Planning & Regulatory Services

<u>Call Commission to Order</u>

The meeting was called to order by Acting Chair Wamback at 5:40 pm.

Approval of Minutes

Review of the September 13, 2018 minutes.

Quorum was not available to vote on the minutes.

Old Business

1. 31 Louise Street - HC-2018-052 (MBL 10-005-00020)

Petition:	Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner:	Adnan Termos
Present Use:	Three-family residence
Year Built:	c1916
Historic Status:	MACRIS listed, and National Register listed, fka the John and Edward
	Johnson Three-Decker

Petition Purpose:

- Demolish front three-story porch and rebuild first floor only
- Install vinyl siding

Applicant was not present.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 4-0 to continue the item to the October 25, 2018 meeting and extend the constructive grant deadline to October 29, 2018.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated July 16, 2018 and received July 16, 2018.

Exhibit B: Request to continue form, dated August 29, 2018.

Exhibit C: Request to continue form, dated September 27, 2018.

New Business

2. 41 Elm Street – HC-2018-069 (MBL 03-033-00003)

Petition:	Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner:	Forty-one Elm Street Realty, LLC
Present Use:	Mixed-use building
Year Built:	c1884
Historic Status:	MACRIS listed, and National Register listed, fka the Joseph Davis House
Petition Purpose:	

• Replace siding

Joe Stolberg and Keith Blanchette, Forty-One Elm Street Realty, and Andy Moss, Hardi representative, appeared on behalf of the application.

Mr. Blanchette stated that he Mr. Stolberg are the owners and they purchased the property in 2011. They've had concerns about rot and deterioration for a few years and are at the point where they'd like to address the issues. Mr. Stolberg stated that their goal is to maintain the aesthetic of the building and that Hardi is a cost effective option compared to residing in cedar. Mr. Moss stated that most elements will be able to be replicated in Hardi. The areas that can't be reproduced are the hand cut sawtooth edging, and the wavy sections of shingle. Commissioner Stefani asked whether the Hardi material could be cut to match those details. In both cases, Hardi shingles would need to be hand cut individually and repainted, which greatly increases the labor costs. Commissioner Theerman asked whether the areas of rot were so extensive that repairs couldn't be done as needed. Mr. Moss responded that the deterioration is pervasive, and Mr. Blanchette followed up that shakes are falling loose, that it appears much of the siding is held on with layers of paint. Their main concern is water infiltration, which has been combated with spot repair, but continues to be an issue.

Ms. Arena noted that an additional item, replacement of six windows, was not initially advertised so would need to be held until the following meeting. With that in mind, she suggested the siding discussion also be continued and that a site visit be scheduled in the interim. The Commission and the applicants agreed that a site visit would be beneficial to see first-hand the condition of the siding.

No public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 5-0 to continue the item to October 25, 2018.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated September 10, 2018 and received September 18, 2018.

3. 96 Sagamore Road – HC-2018-070 (MBL 20-002-03+4A)

Petition:	Building Demolition Delay Waiver & Certificate of Appropriateness
Petitioner:	Adrian and Kimberly VanderSpek
Present Use:	Single-family residence
Year Built:	c1902

Historic Status: MACRIS listed, National Register listed, and located within the Montvale Local Historic District, fka the Albert Gordon House

Petition Purpose:

• Replace siding and trim

Adrian and Kimberly VanderSpek, owners, and George Kopek, contractor, appeared on behalf of the application.

Mr. VanderSpek stated that there is a lot of rot in the soffit and in some clapboards. As they'll have to pay for scaffolding to do the soffits, they'd like to replace all of the siding as well. Mr. Kopek stated that he was the contractor who worked on the house after a 2011 fire, during which time the entire roof was rebuilt and everything above the soffit was replaced using Hardi siding and PVC trim. Mrs. VanderSpek stated that although some areas are more rotted than others they felt it makes more sense to replace everything at once. Mr. Kopek stated that all elements, including the decorative window headers, will be able to be reproduced in Azek to match exactly.

Commissioner Conroy asked what the cost comparison was to completing the work in cedar. Mr. Kopek stated that it would be about twice as much. Mrs. VanderSpek added that though there is still a lot of labor involved, there will be significant maintenance savings. She stated that they spent \$35,000 in 2011 to have the whole house painted. Replacing portions of the siding with Hardi wouldn't make sense because the sections that are still wood would need to be repainted more frequently.

Public comment: Dean Alexandrou, 12 Monadnock Road stated he is in support of the petition.

Bernie Witmor, 11 Monadnock Road stated that he supports the request; that based on previous work done he trusts their ability.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Kurtz, the Commission voted 5-0 to close the hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 4-1 (Commissioner Theerman voting against) that the proposed demolition of the historic building located at 96 Sagamore Road is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Kurtz, the Commission voted 4-1 (Commissioner Theerman voting against) that the proposed changes at 96 Sagamore Road, consisting of the replacement of all siding with Hardi board and replacement of all trim with PVC products to match the existing features, are appropriate to the Montvale Local Historic District, and approved the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated September 19, 2018 and received September 20, 2018.

4. 140 Elm Street - HC-2018-071 (MBL 06-002-00013)

Petition:	Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner:	Stephen Manzi
Present Use:	Multi-family residence
Year Built:	c1910
Historic Status:	MACRIS listed, and National Register listed, fka the Bowker – Mailman
	Three-Decker

Petition Purpose:

• Replace select front porch elements

Stephen Manzi, owner, and Charles Wilmot, contractor, appeared on behalf of the application.

Mr. Wilmot stated that the lower part of the posts on each level of the front porch are rotting and getting spongy. In addition, the lower horizontal rails are in poor condition. They'd like to replace the section of posts that are rotted, and other damaged elements as needed. They'll use poplar or some other hard wood, and it will be painted to match.

No public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Kurtz the Commission voted 5-0 to close the hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Kurtz and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 5-0 that the proposed demolition of the historic building located at 140 Elm Street is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated September 20, 2018 and received September 20, 2018.

5. 116 Mower Street – HC-2018-072 (MBL 40-014-00001)

Petition:	Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner:	Josh and Poppy Gray
Present Use:	Single-family residence
Year Built:	c1810
Historic Status:	MACRIS listed, National Register listed, and a National Historic
	Landmark, fka Liberty Farm

Petition Purpose:

• Install rooftop solar panels

Josh and Poppy Gray, owners, and Craig Orn, SunRun Solar, appeared on behalf of the application.

Mr. Orn stated that there will be 22 panels total, 10 on one side and 12 on the other, each measuring 5' x 3', with a 2.5" profile. Installation consists of a rail system mounted to the rafters with the panels then attached to the rails. He stated that no other suitable location could be found on the property.

Commissioner Conroy noted that this is probably one of the most historically important properties in the city and she is reluctant to support any exterior changes. Commissioner Kurtz observed that the roof material is asphalt shingle, so not a historic material, and the location of the panels is unobtrusive.

Mr. Gray stated that this portion of the house is not original. Ms. Arena stated that she had been in the house and recalled modern framing in that section, as at the least it had been heavily remodeled at some point.

Public comment: Acting Chair Wamback read into the record a letter of opposition from Preservation Worcester.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Conroy the Commission voted 5-0 to close the hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Kurtz and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 3-2 (Commissioners Theerman and Conroy voting against) that the proposed demolition of the historic building located at 116 Mower Street is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application undated, and received September 20, 2018.

Exhibit B: Letter from Preservation Worcester dated and received October 11, 2018.

Communications

a. Communication from MHC re: FY2019 Survey and Planning Grant cycle – dated September 26, 2018 and received October 1, 2018.

No comment.

Other Business

I. Demolition Delay Waiver application revision

The Commission reviewed revisions Ms. Arena incorporated based on comments from the previous meeting. Upon a motion by Commissioner Kurtz and seconded by Commissioner Conroy the Commission voted 5-0 to approve the new application.

Adjournment

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Conroy, the Commission voted 5-0 to adjourn the meeting at 7:15 p.m.