MINUTES OF THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE HISTORICAL COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WORCESTER

May 10, 2018

LEVI LINCOLN CHAMBER - CITY HALL

Commission Members Present: Andrew Shveda

Randolph Bloom Robyn Conroy Devon Kurtz Janet Theerman Diane Long

Tomi Stefani, Alternate

Commission Members Absent: Mark Wamback

Courtney Ross Escobar, Alternate

Staff Members Present: Susan Arena, Division of Planning & Regulatory Services

Call Commission to Order

The meeting was called to order by Chair Shveda at 5:30 pm.

Approval of Minutes

Review of the April 12, 2018 minutes.

Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Bloom the Commission voted 4-0 to approve the minutes of April 12, 2018.

Old Business

1. 1 Drury Lane – HC-2018-016 (MBL 20-016-01-04)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver & Certificate of Appropriateness

Petitioner: Worcester Polytechnic Institute

Present Use: Multi-family residence

Year Built: c1914

Historic Status: MACRIS Listed, and located within the Massachusetts Avenue Local

Historic District, fka Frank O. Woodland - John Jeppson House.

Petition Purpose:

Replace select windows

Michelle Tuck, Tuck and Tuck Architects; and Nick Polumbo, WPI, appeared on behalf of the application.

Ms. Tuck reviewed the project to date, noting that the replacement of two sets of French doors and restoration of all but eight second floor windows had been approved. The remaining item, replacement

of the eight windows had been continued. Based on a recommendation from the board, Ms. Tuck explored the possibility of just replacing the glass instead of the entire window. In addition they requested to modify their original application from eight windows to 10, adding two on the south elevation of the second floor.

She explained the process of installing bi-glass, and stated that the company who does the work approved these windows as a good candidate for the process. The windows will be taken out, the sash modified, repaired, and weather stripped, the surrounding area insulated, and everything reinstalled. This process will satisfy the client's goal of increasing energy efficiency and sound proofing.

Commissioner Bloom asked how the price of this process compares to replacement. Ms. Tuck stated that they don't have firm numbers yet. Chair Shveda followed up, asking whether there was anything anticipated that would prevent this project from going forward, such as the cost. Ms. Tuck replied, no, they just need the Commission's approval.

No public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 4-0 that the proposed demolition of the historic building located at 1 Drury Lane is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to deny the Building Demolition Delay Waiver application.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 4-0 that the proposed changes, consisting of the restoration of 10 second floor windows and replacement of the glass with bi-glass within the existing sash, is appropriate to the Massachusetts Avenue Local Historic District and approved the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver & Certificate of Appropriateness Application dated March 5, 2018 and received March 6, 2018.

Exhibit B: Request for Continuance form, dated March 29, 2018.

Exhibit C: Request for Continuance form, dated April 17, 2018.

Exhibit D: Bi-glass window conversion letter from Tuck and Tuck Architects, dated May 4, 2018.

2. 122 Woodland Street – HC-2018-025 (MBL 06-041-00009)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver

Petitioner: Clark University

Present Use: Commercial building / garage

Year Built: c1890 / date unknown

Historic Status: MACRIS Listed, and National Register listed as part of the Woodland Street

Historic District, fka the George Session House

Petition Purpose:

• Demolish the garage

Commissioner Conroy recused herself from the item.

Neil Dixon, Dixon Salo Architects; Dan Roderick and Lea Ann O'Neill, Clark University, appeared on behalf of the application.

Ms. O'Neill reviewed the Cost Analysis Report that had been prepared to compare rehabilitation of the existing garage with an addition, to full demolition and replacement, as had been requested by the Commission at the previous meeting. She also noted a letter of support from Preservation Worcester that had been provided. Ms. O'Neill stated that they spoke with several contractors and that she personally is very familiar with the construction business. The estimate for reuse of the existing structure was \$594,000, and the estimate for new construction was \$366,000.

Chair Shveda thanked Ms. O'Neill for provided the additional information, stating that the breakdown is very helpful.

Commissioner Long asked why the cost of full demolition is 1/3 the cost of partial demolition. Ms. O'Neill replied that with partial demolition there is extensive engineering involved. The existing structure has to be lifted up, the foundation removed and rebuilt and the structure reset. There is also a higher contingency cost with reuse because there are more unknown factors.

Commissioner Bloom noted that he has previously commented on the deterioration of the property possibly being due to neglect by the school, but now thinks that the biggest issue seems to be the foundation, which was more likely not in their control.

Public comment: Rob Para, Preservation Worcester, stated that they has been asked to visit the building and observed that it was significantly compromised. The space has always been unheated and was never intended for occupied use. Therefore, they support Clark's petition to demolish the building.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Bloom and seconded by Commissioner Kurtz, the Commission voted 5-1 (Commissioner Long voting against) that the proposed demolition of the historic building located at 122 Woodland Street is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to deny the Building Demolition Delay Waiver application.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver dated April 4, 2018 and received April 4, 2018.

Exhibit B: Request for Continuance form, dated April 26, 2018.

Exhibit C: Cost Analysis Report from Clark University, dated May 7, 2018.

Exhibit D: Letter of support from Preservation Worcester, dated May 7, 2018.

New Business

3. 14 Oxford Street – HC-2018-028 (MBL 03-022-00014)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver & Certificate of Appropriateness

Petitioner: Marc Moran

Present Use: Single-family residential

Year Built: c1846

Historic Status: MACRIS Listed, National Register listed as part of the Crown-Oxford

Historic District, and located within the Crown Hill Local Historic District, fka the Dr. Lester C. Miller–Dr. James A. Given House

Petition Purpose:

- Remove the aluminum siding
- Repair/replace clapboard and trim as necessary
- Paint house and iron fence

Install shutters

Marc Moran, owner, appeared on behalf of the application.

They would like to remove the aluminum siding, restore the wood clapboard and trim underneath and repaint the whole house, as well as the iron fence along the front yard. He believes the clapboard is in good condition for the most part. Mr. Moran stated that he and his wife recently purchased the property and have restored two other historic homes in Worcester. He has found that the older wood used in siding on houses of this era holds up very well and through initial inspection he has not found signs of rot. Chair Shveda stated that, as the applicant has worked on two other homes, he feels confident that this house will receive proper treatment as well.

At the time Mr. Moran stated that they had not settled on paint colors, but it will likely be light yellow on the body, with white trim, and red or blue for the doors. Commissioner Bloom asked about the window sashes. Mr. Moran said they would likely keep them white as that presents a more country cottage feel, as opposed to dark, which would be more formal. Regarding the iron fence, it is currently black, but Mr. Moran stated that they are considering green, depending on what color they select for the house. As this scheme is tentative the Commission was not comfortable approving the work yet. The applicant agreed to continue this item to later in the summer when they'd have a better idea of their color choices.

Mr. Moran stated that they were undecided about the reinstallation of shutters and do not have an example to share with the Commission at this time. Even though Mr. Moran stated they intend to use salvaged shutters, the Commission agreed that they'd prefer to know exactly what is being installed. Due to the uncertainty regarding this item Mr. Moran agreed it was best to withdraw it from the request.

No public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 7-0 to continue the selection of paint color to the August 2, 2018 Historical Commission meeting and extend the Constructive Grant deadline to August 6, 2018.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Bloom, the Commission voted 7-0 that the proposed demolition of the historic building located at 14 Oxford Street is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to deny the Building Demolition Delay Waiver application.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Kurtz, the Commission voted 7-0 that the proposed changes, consisting of the removal of aluminum siding and restoration of the wood siding underneath is appropriate to the Crown Hill Local Historic District and approved the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated April 6, 2018 and received April 17, 2018.

Exhibit B: Request for Continuance form, dated May 10, 2018.

Other Business

I. Announcement: MHC Annual Preservation Awards, May 16 – Worcester Historical Commission nominee, Fire Alarm and Telegraph Building to receive an award.

No comment.

II. Announcement: Chamber of Commerce Annual Awards Ceremony, May 17 – Worcester Historical Commission nominee, Queen's Cups to receive an award.

Commissioners should notify staff if they plan to attend.

III. Announcement: Historic Windows talk, May 22

Preservation Massachusetts will be hosting an educational talk, Historic Windows: Making the Case, in partnership with the City of Worcester and Preservation Worcester. The event will be on May 22 in City Hall.

IV. Creation of Worcester Preservation Awards program.

Staff have been working with Preservation Worcester to create a local Preservation Awards program. Commissioners reviewed the draft nomination form and guidance and suggested adding one more category that would include non-building structures such as bridges and monuments.

Communications

a. Communication from Commonwealth of Massachusetts re: Notice of Preservation Award for Fire Alarm and Telegraph Building – dated April 17, 2018 and received April 25, 2018.

No comment.

b. Communication from MHC re: National Register nomination comments for Dale and Ethan Allen Streets Historic District – dated April 25, 2018 and received April 30, 2018.

No comment.

Adjournment

Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Conroy, the Commission voted 7-0 to adjourn the meeting at 7:00 p.m.