Commission on Disability

ADA Hearing Minutes

Tuesday August 12th, 2014, 4PM

Levi Lincoln Chamber, Worcester City Hall

Please note: The video of the hearing can be viewed on the city of Worcester website, in the video archives: http://view.earthchannel.com/PlayerController.aspx?PGD=worcema&eId=183

Members Present: Francesca Abbey, Rachel Shannon Brown, Nancy Garr-Colzie, Herbert Cremer, Paul Keister, Elizabeth Myska, Stephen Stolberg, Susan Swanson

Members absent: Charles Hiamah, John Nah, Lynne Towler

Staff: Jayna Turchek, Dawn Clark

Consultants: Executive Director Valerie Fletcher and Architectural Director Emmanuel Andrade from Institute for Human Centered Design

The Chairperson called the meeting to order and established quorum.

The Commission on Elder Affairs did not have a quorum and were invited to sit with the audience.

The Human Rights Commission did not have a quorum and they were invited to sit with the audience.

The hearing continued as a hearing of the Commission of Disabilities.

Jayna Turchek introduced Executive Director Valerie Fletcher and Architectural Director Emmanuel Andrade to present the Draft Report by Institute for Human Centered Design.
Presentation began

- Took 6 months to complete the project.
- Introduction on the project itself
  o Project to inspect vertical aspects of city buildings. There will be another to review the horizontal aspects.
  o Buildings did not include sidewalks, streets, conservation land, or schools.
  o Did however review the access points leading to the property.
  o Included evaluation of programs (not website review)
  o Evaluation of facilities
  o Community and staff evaluation
  o Draft of self-evaluation report until the commission, city, and public have reviewed it.

- 3 Deliverables.
  o Self-evaluation report
  o Transition plan database
    ▪ Excel spreadsheet given to city departments.
  o GIS Database
    ▪ Satellite data to, along with photos and descriptions, provide specific information regarding certain areas, parking spaces, structures, etc.
- Basis for self-evaluation
  o 2010 ADA Standards
  o MAAB (2006)
    ▪ State level sometimes more stringent than the federal ADA mandate.

Valerie now has the floor
- ADA (Americans with Disabilities Act)
  - Built upon Civil Rights Act of 1964.
    - Established people with disabilities as a protected class. Most comprehensive mandate in the world. Most comprehensive infrastructure.
    - First nation in the world to have a mandate protecting those with disabilities (1973)
    - Defined accessible design as a human right.
  - Title I – Employment somewhat, but especially Title II – State and local government (Worcester’s responsibility) of ADA are the primary focus.
  - Conducting a self-evaluation is the fourth of five action steps required to bring public entity into legal compliance with regulations

Emmanuel now has the floor.

- Evaluation of Facilities
  - 11 municipal buildings and 3 library facilities were evaluated.
  - 1 police station.
  - 10 fire stations
  - 20 open spaces.
  - Aging buildings tend to be the least compliant. Pose many barriers.
  - Key facilities that are completely inaccessible
    - DPW Administrative building
    - Water operations
    - Administration building at Hope cemetery
    - Great Brook Valley Library and some fire stations.
- Vast majority are functionally accessible, but not in full compliance.
- Evaluation of Programs
  - Designation of responsible employee.
  - Adequate complaint procedures.
  - Reasonable modification of policies, practices, and procedures.
  - Employment and accommodation.
  - Auxiliary aids and services.
  - Emergency Preparedness, Evacuation plans, and emergency shelter access.

- Program Accessibility
  - Evaluating the access to programs, services, and criteria using these priorities:
    - Approach and entrance
    - Access to goods and services
    - Toilet rooms
    - Additional access

- City Hall
  - Problems with parking, doorways, assembly areas, floor surfaces with mats that affect wheelchairs and walkers, high counters, toilet rooms, ramps, clear signage, public telephones.

- DPW Headquarters
  - Door knobs, small elevators, problems with sloped parking, entrance accessibility, high counters, toilet rooms, floor surfaces, and signage.

- DPW Administration Building
  - New toilet rooms are good. Old toilet rooms are inaccessible.
- Problems with parking, the entrance, and protruding objects.
  - Inspectional Services
    o Accessible toilets are in the basement, but the accessible elevator is not signed clearly.
    o Problems with doorways, stairways are steep, high counters.
  - Parks Buildings
    o Cracks in the parking lot and exterior route to building are a tripping hazard.
    o Doors aren’t accessible.
    o Interior route is too narrow.
  - Senior Center
    o Parking is too steep. Same with stairways.
    o Work surfaces too high.
    o No signage on elevators.
    o Plumbing not covered in toilet room sinks.
  - Union Station
    o Not enough clearance for van space in the parking garage. Can’t get through the gate.
    o Need assistance to operate lift.
    o Bathroom door doesn’t self-close in the toilet rooms.
  - Administrative Office at Hope Cemetery
    o Entrance is very inaccessible to those with disabilities.
    o Toilet stall doesn’t close.
  - Green Hill Golf
    o Hill side parking too steep.
    o High counters.
  - DCU Center
    o Major Taylor Garage
- Elevators missing signage
- Parking spaces not painted clear enough.
  - Convention Center
    - Overall very compliant.
    - Floor surface tend to be difficult for wheelchairs and walkers.
    - Study for seating suggested.
- Worcester public library
  - High counters, protruding objects, and inaccessible public telephones.
- Francis Perkins Branch Library
  - Renovated in the mid ‘90s.
  - Converted to accessible by providing elevators and ramps.
  - However, does not comply with state law because lifts are not independently operated.
- Police Headquarters
  - Exterior route is the biggest problem.
  - Very long distance between bus stop and accessible entrance.
  - Not a single accessible cell.
- Fire Stations
  - Most of the space within the stations is not open to the public anyway.
  - No pedestrian access on McKeon road FS.
- Open Spaces
  - Many problems with toilet rooms and signage, curb ramps, stairways, drinking fountains, and parking that is either too steep or has cracked pavement.

Comments/Questions from the audience members
- There’s a viewing window at the bar of DCU center with little visual access. Was the window evaluated/reviewed?
  o Can’t call it inaccessible, but the design is poor
- At the hub/union station, it is very difficult to move between both locations. Can’t get in easily, and there is no ramp to the hub.
  o Scope was limited to Union Station, not Hub. There is a circuitous route to non-signed accessible entrance.
- 1st suggest having public survey before these studies to get ideas of what to evaluate. An example is the parking area outside of Worcester Public Library, Institute Park, and Cristofo Colombo Park. There is also a need for more social media presence on these issues.
- ADA Coordinator should be a full time position. Why weren’t Worcester’s emergency procedures mentioned in this presentation? Need to evaluate polling places for accessibility issues. Worcester Housing Authority should’ve been on the scope of services. DCU arena has no accessible pickup/drop-off. Nor are there curb cuts.
- Worcester needs to change its attitude. A lot of the necessary changes are just common sense.
- Was the front of city hall inspected?
  o No. It was under construction at the time of evaluation.
- Pleased with the progress. Been waiting for so many years as someone who care for a quadriplegic. There needs to be an evaluation of movie theaters. The stadium seating is neither fair nor comfortable.
- The brick sidewalks in the city are a poor design. Bricks are bad for the sidewalk and are not safe. Hazard for individuals in wheelchairs, walkers, canes, etc.
- At the DCU center, handicapped parking has been removed on Foster Street to make way for a bigger plaza. Transporters are responsible for the safety of the disabled individual. No simple drop-offs and pickups. Since renovation of the DCU center, no individuals in wheelchairs have season tickets to the Worcester Sharks. Used to be many at the Ice Cats games.
- What about the kitchenettes in DCU luxury suites?
  - Kitchenettes are private and used by catering companies. Not open to the public and are therefore not under the same ADA and MAAB code.
- It is very hard to get to the podium at the city council meetings because the podium is raised up on a platform.
- DPW parking signs are not fixed to the ground.
  - The signs are not compliant.
- Before renovation of DCU center, easier access was guaranteed. The opposite has happened. Formerly 3 lanes were reduced to 1 to make room for the plaza. Drop-offs hold up traffic and cause road rage.
- Post office has no logic. There are 2 entrances. Handicapped entrance is on the far side. Also, new buildings have no cover outside for bad weather.
- There are no areas in city hall that have good tables, counters, etc. for handicapped accessibility.
- City Hall has been made a lot more accessible. The keys are basics, education, and working together.
- Scope of the evaluation should be coupled with horizontal issues to make more meaningful changes. There should be a consulting service to the city. Might provide an extra aspect.
- Does the Institute have any recommendations about prioritizing?
• Don’t have to fix every problem, but can pick the inexpensive, quick, “low hanging fruits” and provide proper training.

Valerie now takes the floor

- There is easy access to decision makers in this city. They can adapt attitude. Problem-solving is continuous. Law requires the minimum, but Worcester is a place that can do more. The law isn’t that robust.

Audience takes the floor again

- The role and incorporation of technology can improve the lives of many individuals with disabilities.

Jayna Turchek takes the floor for closing comments.

- The City Manager and former City Manager insisted on this plan and wanted to know what could be done.
- There will be further opportunities to voice opinions about this evaluation and accessibility.
- Next Commission on Disability meeting will be August 19th.

Meeting adjourned
City of Worcester Self-Evaluation (basis for ADA Transition Plan)

August 12, 2014

Valerie Fletcher, Executive Director
Emmanuel Andrade, Architectural Designer
Institute for Human Centered Design

An international education and design non-profit dedicated to enhancing the experiences of people of all ages and abilities through excellence in design.

www.HumanCenteredDesign.org
IHCD Scope of Services
Regional, National, International

Consulting & design services on Accessibility and Universal Design (International)
- Built environments
- Products
- Information + Communication Technology
- Service design

Technical Assistance
- Nat’l Fair Housing Accessibility Design & Construction Resource Center
- New England Americans with Disabilities Act Center

Education & Training on Accessibility and Universal Design (International)
- Lectures, workshops, seminars, courses, symposia
- Internships, fellows program
- Educational “publications” – print & web-based

Research – User/Expert Lab, observation & contextual inquiry

www.HumanCenteredDesign.org
Institute for Human Centered Design
Technical Assistance Projects

New England ada Center

One of ten national centers providing information, guidance and training on the Americans with Disabilities Act.

800-949-4232 v/tty

A member of the ada National Network

FAIR HOUSING ACCESSIBILITY FIRST

A program of the US Department of Housing and Urban Development providing information on the Fair Housing Act design and construction requirements.

888-341-7781 v/tty

www.HumanCenteredDesign.org
“Integrated setting” – the conceptual heart of US requirements for accessibility

“Separate benefit/integrated setting. A primary goal of the ADA is the equal participation of individuals with disabilities in the "mainstream" of American society. The major principles of mainstreaming are –

1) Individuals with disabilities must be integrated to the maximum extent appropriate.

2) Separate programs are permitted where necessary to ensure equal opportunity. A separate program must be appropriate to the particular individual.

3) Individuals with disabilities cannot be excluded from the regular program, or required to accept special services or benefits.”
Scope of Work

Bid Number: 6023-1-J3

Vertical Aspects

• Evaluation of Programs
  (does not include website review)

• Evaluation of Facilities

• Community & Staff Evaluation/ Involvement
Deliverables

DRAFT for review and feedback

Self-Evaluation Report + GIS Database + Transition Plan Database

www.HumanCenteredDesign.org
The American with Disabilities Act (ADA)

- Built on the Civil Rights Act of 1964
- Established a new ‘protected class’ of people with disabilities
- Overarching Goals: equal participation & equal benefit
- Most comprehensive mandate in the world with the most comprehensive infrastructure to support voluntary compliance
The American with Disabilities Act (ADA)

- **Titles I** – Employment
- **Title II** – State and local government
- **Title III** – Access to “places of public accommodation” & commercial facilities
- **Title IV** – Telecommunications
- **Title V** – Miscellaneous
The American with Disabilities Act (ADA)

Title II of the Americans with Disabilities Act requires that state and local government entities do not discriminate against people with disabilities in their programs, services, and activities.

State and local government must take steps to examine their programs and establish a plan for compliance with the law.
The following are the five action steps required to bring a public entity into compliance with the regulations:

**STEP 1:** Designate a responsible employee

**STEP 2:** Provide notice of ADA requirements

**STEP 3:** Establish a Grievance Procedure

**STEP 4:** Conduct a Self-Evaluation

**STEP 5:** Develop a Transition Plan

Worcester is here!
Program Accessibility Standard

• Ensure that each program, service and activity, when viewed in its entirety, is accessible to people with disabilities.

• Does not necessarily require a public entity to make each of its existing facilities accessible.

• Does not require a public entity to take any action that it can demonstrate would result in undue financial and administrative burdens.
Evaluation of Programs

• Designation of Responsible Employee
• Complaint Procedures
• Notice
• Reasonable Modification of Policies Practices and Procedures
• Employment and Reasonable Accommodation
• Auxiliary Aids and Services
• Emergency Preparedness, Evacuation Plans, and Emergency Shelters
Evaluation of Facilities

11 Municipal Buildings:
• City Hall
• DPW Administrative Building - Water Operations
• DPW Administrative Building - Headquarters
• DPW Administrative Building - Customer Service
• Inspectional Services
• Parks Building
• Senior Center
• Union Station
• Administration Building at Hope Cemetery
• Green Hill Golf
• DCU Center
Evaluation of Facilities

3 Libraries:
• Public Library
• Frances Perkins Branch Library
• Great Brook Valley Branch Library
Evaluation of Facilities

1 Police Station:
• Police Headquarters

www.HumanCenteredDesign.org
Evaluation of Facilities

10 Fire Stations:

- Fire Department Headquarters
- Burncoat Street Fire Station
- Franklin Street Fire Station
- Greendale Fire Station
- McKeon Road Fire Station
- Park Avenue Fire Station
- South Division Fire Station
- Southeast Fire Station
- Tatnuck Square Fire Station
- Webster Square Fire Station
Evaluation of Facilities

20 Open Spaces:
- Beaver Brook Park
- Bell Hill Beach
- Coes Pond Beach
- Crompton Park
- Elm Park
- Farber Field
- Green Hill Farm
- Greenwood Park
- Hadwen Park
- Harrington Field
- Harry-Sherry Field
- Indian Lake Beach
- Kendrick Field
- Lake Park
- Logan Field
- Mulchay Field
- Rockwood Field
- Shore Park Beach
- Ty Cobb Field
- Vernon Hill Park

www.HumanCenteredDesign.org
Evaluation of Facilities

- Union Station
- Public Library
- Webster Square FS
- Splash Park at Greenwood
- DPW Admin Bldg – HQ (partial)
- Franklin Street FS
- Pool at Crompton
- DCU Center
- Fire Academy at HQ
- Vernon Hill

www.HumanCenteredDesign.org
Evaluation of Facilities

• Large number of aging buildings and facilities that pose barriers to residents and employees with disabilities.

• When looked at in their entirety, the number of mostly or entirely inaccessible facilities throughout the City create a challenge in ensuring access to all programs, services, and activities.

• Key facilities throughout the City such as the DPW Administrative Building: Water Operations, Administration Building at Hope Cemetery, Great Brook Valley Branch Library, and many fire stations are completely inaccessible.
Evaluation of Facilities

• The vast majority of buildings and facilities are “functionally accessible” meaning that they are generally usable by people with disabilities but are not in full compliance with current accessibility requirements, though they may have been compliant when they were built or last renovated – before 1991.

• City Hall: accessible parking, one accessible entrance facing the plaza, one accessible entrance, accessible toilet rooms on levels 1 and 3, and has accessible routes through most of the building, yet the few drinking fountains provided are inaccessible, many offices cannot be reached via an accessible route (including the Mayor’s Office) because of doorway issues, and virtually none of the service counters are accessible.
Evaluation of Facilities

- Number of accessibility-related renovations in recent years are, fortunately, compliant with current accessibility standards.
- Worcester has hired an ADA Coordinator, Jayna Turchek.
- Worcester is updating ADA self-evaluation and transition plan.
- Worcester has solicited bids to evaluate Public Rights-of-Way.
- Worcester’s Parks, Recreation & Cemetery Division has hired a consultant to evaluate open spaces throughout the City.
- Worcester has established a Commission on Disabilities.
Program Accessibility

Relocation of programs, services and activities within current facility

DPW Administrative Building – Headquarters

www.HumanCenteredDesign.org
Program Accessibility

Relocation of programs, services and activities to another facility

DPW Administrative Building – Water Operations

Great Brook Valley Branch Library

www.HumanCenteredDesign.org
Program Accessibility

Renovations to ensure access to programs, services and activities

- **Priority 1** - Approach & Entrance
- **Priority 2** - Access to Goods & Services
- **Priority 3** - Toilet Rooms
- **Priority 4** - Additional Access
DPW Admin Bldg - Headquarters

Parking

Entrance

Floor Surfaces

Doors

Counters

Signage

Elevator

Toilet Rooms

Toilet Rooms
DPW Admin Bldg – Customer Service

www.HumanCenteredDesign.org
DPW Admin Bldg – Customer Service

Parking

Entrance

Toilet Room

Signage

Protruding Object
Inspectional Services

Doors

Counters

Stairways

Signage
Parks Building
Parks Building

Parking

Exterior Route

Doors

Interior Route

Signage
Senior Center

Parking

Interior Route

Work Surfaces

Elevator

Stairways

Kitchenette

Toilet Rooms
Union Station
Union Station

Parking

Lift

Toilet Rooms

Signage

www.HumanCenteredDesign.org
Admin Office at Hope Cemetery

www.HumanCenteredDesign.org
Admin Office at Hope Cemetery

Parking

Entrance

Toilet Rooms
Green Hill Golf

Parking

Counter
DCU Center
Major Taylor Municipal Garage

www.HumanCenteredDesign.org
Convention Center

Floor Surfaces

Signage

Toilet Rooms

www.HumanCenteredDesign.org
Arena

Seating

Dining Surfaces

Dining Surfaces

Toilet Rooms

Toilet Rooms

Toilet Rooms

Signage

Signage

Drinking Fountains

www.HumanCenteredDesign.org
Public Library
Public Library

Counter

Protruding Object

Public Telephone

www.HumanCenteredDesign.org
Francis Perkins Branch Library

www.HumanCenteredDesign.org
Police Headquarters
Police Headquarters

Exterior Route

Parking

Toilet Rooms

Drinking Fountain

Counters

Holding Cells
Fire Stations – Parking

Southeast Division FS

McKeon Road FS

Franklin Street FS
Fire Stations – Entrances

Burncoat Street FS
Park Avenue FS
South Division FS
Tatnuck Square FS
Fire Stations – Counters

McKeon Road FS

Fire HQ
Fire Stations – Toilet Rooms

- Fire HQ Office
- Park Avenue FS
- Southeast Division FS
Staff-only Areas

- Kitchens and/or Staff Lounges: municipal buildings and fire stations
- Toilet rooms: most fire stations
- Locker rooms: Parks Building, Public Library and fire stations
- Offices without public interface: most facilities
Open Spaces – Parking

- Parking Surfaces
  - Unpaved
  - slope > 2%
  - Slope > 4%
- Striping
- Accessible Parking Spaces
  - not provided
  - provided, non-compliant
  - insufficient number
  - van-designated
- Access Aisles
- Parking Signage
  - not provided
  - provided, non-compliant
- Curb Ramps at Parking
Open Spaces – Toilet Rooms

- Minor Modifications
- Major Modifications
- Signage

Elm Park
Mulchay Field
Crompton Park
Rockwood Park
Logan Field
Vernon Hill Park
Open Spaces – Others

- Curb Ramps
- Pedestrian Access
- Ramps
- Stairways
- Drinking Fountains
- Concession Counters

Beyond Minimum Compliance:
- On-street Parking
- Crosswalks
- Beach Access

www.HumanCenteredDesign.org
Thank you!

Questions?