

**MINUTES OF THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE
HISTORICAL COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WORCESTER**

JUNE 25, 2020

LEVI LINCOLN ROOM, ROOM 309 – CITY HALL*

Commission Members Participating: Randolph Bloom
 Diane Long
 Tomi Stefani
 Janet Theerman
 Erika Helnarski, Alternate

Commission Members Not Participating: Mark Wamback, Chair
 Devon Kurtz, Vice-Chair
 Cathryn E. Jerome-Mezynski, Alternate

Staff Members Participating: Stephen Rolle, Division of Planning and Regulatory Services
 Michelle Johnstone, Division of Planning and Regulatory Services

*Pursuant to Governor Baker’s March 12, 2020 Order Suspending Certain Provisions of the Open Meeting Law, G.L. c. 30A, §18, and the Governor’s March 23, 2020 Order, as amended, imposing strict limitation on the number of people that may gather in one place, this meeting was conducted through remote participation. The meeting was livestreamed from the City of Worcester website and via the local cable access channel and is available for streaming online. Public participation was facilitated through a call-in number, 415-655-0001 (Access Code: 730323290#), which was publicized on the posted meeting agenda and during the video broadcast.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

June 11, 2020 – The June 11, 2020 meeting minutes were held until the next meeting.

OLD BUSINESS

Certificate of Appropriateness & Building Demolition Delay Waiver

1. 9 Oxford Street – HC-2019-071 (MBL 03-025-00004)

Petitioner: Helen & Dom Pham

Year Built: 1891

Historic Status: MACRIS listed; National Register Determination of Eligibility (DOE); National Register District (NRDIS); Local Historic District (LHD); State Register (SR), FKA Salem Griggs House

Petition Purpose:

- Replace windows (retroactive)

The petitioner requested that the item be postponed to the next meeting.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Long and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 4-0 to postpone the item to the July 9, 2020 meeting. Commissioner Bloom recused himself.

Building Demolition Delay Waiver

2. 12 Westland Street – HC-2020-035 (MBL 11-008-00019)

Petitioner: Jonathan Rigali

Year Built: 1897

Historic Status: MACRIS listed; National Register District (NRDIS); National Register Multiples Resource Area (NRMRA); State Register of Historic Places (SR), FKA C.A. Chandler House

Petition Purpose:

- Remove existing slate roof and replace with architectural shingles
-

Commissioner Bloom stated that the Commission had requested additional information for roofing alternatives and pricing at the last meeting.

Jonathan Rigali, contractor, spoke on behalf of the application. He stated that the cost to replace the house and garage roofs with architectural shingles would be \$29,000. The cost to replace with Slateline shingle would be \$43,000. The cost to replace with synthetic slate would be \$65,000. The repair of the silo (turret) would be \$19,000. He stated that he spoke with two companies that work with slate and that was the number he received, but nobody has had time to put together a written estimate for him.

Commissioner Theerman stated that these numbers do not give an estimate on what it would cost to repair the entirety of the existing roof. Mr. Rigali stated that it is not the slate that is bad, but the nails that are rotting out and allowing the slate to move. Mr. Rigali reiterated that the Genesis Club (the owner) did not want to have to keep doing repairs, but instead wants to move forward with a full, lower cost install.

Commissioner Long state she doesn't think that the question of whether or not the roof might need to be repaired in the future does not justify replacing it now. She also stated that she doesn't see enough of a difference in the cost estimates that would constitute a financial hardship. Commissioner Theerman agreed. Commissioner Stefani also agreed, and stated that the Commission still has not been given all the estimates they need. He asked for some clarification on the different products they had received estimates for, and Mr. Rigali explained.

Mr. Rigali asked if the Commission would need something from the Genesis Club stating that they planned on staying in the building in the coming years. Commissioner Stefani stated he does not think that would be binding, and removing the slate would be detrimental to the neighborhood. Mr. Rigali also stated that many houses surrounding the property have asphalt shingle. Commissioner Bloom stated that the Commission doesn't typically look at houses surrounding subject properties, and that would not come into play. He stated that the Commission is believes that the slate roof is significant, and the look of it should be maintained.

The Commission and Mr. Rigali discussed having a slate tradesperson come out to look at the roof and give a better estimate.

Commissioner Helnarski stated that she didn't think removing the slate roof was justified, when it's not easy to say when the roof will need to be completely repaired and what the financial position of a future owner might be. She also stated that she doesn't know for sure if maintenance has been kept up with. Commissioner Theerman agreed, stating it might be helpful to speak with someone from Genesis Club to learn more about the history of repairs on the building.

Mr. Rolle stated that it seems as though an estimate and assessment of the viability of the roof is missing, and it would be helpful to see the cost of repairs on the existing roof over a fifteen-year period, which is about half the life of an asphalt shingle roof, to allow for a better apples-to-apples comparison. Commissioner Bloom stated he thinks that would be helpful.

Mr. Rigali stated that he would be amenable to participating in the next meeting along with someone from the Genesis Club.

Commissioner Bloom asked where the estimate for the repair of the silo (turret) came from. Mr. Rigali stated that the number came from a slate eexpert. Commissioner Bloom stated that he was confused as to why there was no repair estimate for the entire roof. Mr. Rigali stated that he could provide that at the next meeting.

No public comment.

On a motion by Commissioner Long and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 5-0 to continue the application to the July 9, 2020 meeting.

Exhibits

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver dated May 11, 2020, received May 13, 2020.

NEW BUSINESS

Building Demolition Delay Waiver

3. 1 Kelley Square – HC-2020-037 (MBL 04-022-00009)

Petitioner: Edward Murphy

Year Built: ca. 1916

Historic Status: MACRIS listed; National Register District (NRDIS), FKA Vernon Theatre Block

Petition Purpose:

- Remove and replace existing metal and wood windows
- Remove brick infill in arches
- Lower window openings by up to two feet

Edward Murphy, owner, spoke of behalf of the application. He stated that previously, a Building Demolition Delay Wavier was issued for the building, but the design has slightly changed since that waiver was issued. He explained the reasoning for the change in design, which is to allow for larger windows. He stated that the new design will mimic the existing architectural elements. He also stated that he believes, based on information from the State Archives, that the architects designed the existing infill so that it could be removed.

Commissioner Long stated that she thinks the new design looks great and will complement the building.

Commissioner Stefani asked which windows would be lowered. Mr. Murphy stated that the top of the second-floor windows are actually in the third floor of the building, so the second-story window sill needs to be lowered, and the third-floor will have a structural element, mimicking the existing infill, to tie-in to the building. Commissioner Stefani stated that he also appreciated the design.

Commissioner Bloom stated that sometimes, the Commission has to make accommodations for a building to continue to be functional. Commissioner Bloom asked for some elaboration on the original design, which allowed for the infill to be removed. Mr. Murphy stated that the information came from the State Archives in Boston. Commissioner Bloom stated that he found it interesting that the architects were so flexible in their design.

No Public Comment.

On a motion by Commissioner Long and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 5-0 to close the public hearing.

On a motion by Commissioner Long and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 5-0 that the proposed demolition at 1 Kelley Square would not be detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the City and voted to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.

Exhibits

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver dated June 4, 2020, received June 5, 2020.

Certificate of Non-Applicability

4. 67 Austin Street – HC-2020-042

Petitioner: Joe MacNeil

Year Built: ca. 1870

Historic Status: MACRIS listed; State Register of Historic Places (SR); Local Historic District (LHD)

Petition Purpose:

- Replace sections of vinyl siding damaged by fire

Ilan Carmi, owner, and Joe MacNeil, contractor, spoke on behalf of the application. He stated that there was a fire at the property, which melted the vinyl siding. He stated that the intent of the petition is to fix the siding.

Mr. Rolle stated that under the regulations for the Local Historic District, repairs for like-for-like can be made, and do not come under the Commission's purview, which is the purpose of a Certificate of Non-Applicability. He stated that the Commission will also see a subsequent Certificate of Non-Applicability for the replacement of the windows.

Commissioner Long asked if the Commission could include the replacement of like-for-like windows to be added to the petition before them. The Commission decided to include the replacement of eight like-for-like windows to the existing, after the owner and Ms. Johnstone confirmed they were exact matches to those that were damaged.

On a motion by Commissioner Long and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 5-0 that the proposed changes consisting of vinyl siding repairs and the replacement (in-kind) of eight vinyl windows does not fall under the jurisdiction of the Worcester Historical Commission and is therefore not applicable due to the fact that the work consists of like-for-like materials, and approved a Certificate of Non-Applicability.

Exhibits

Exhibit A: Certificate of Non-Applicability dated June 18, 2020, received June 23, 2020.

COMMUNICATIONS

- A. Notice from the MHC regarding a positive determination of eligibility issued by the MHC for listing of the Printer's Building in the National Register of Historic Places

Ms. Johnstone state that the MHC has determined that the Printer's Building is eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places, and will now go to the National Park Service for review.

Commissioner Bloom stated that he is impressed with the building and that he never realized what a handsome art deco building it is.

- B. Request from Stewart Dalzell, Deputy Director of Environmental Planning & Permitting, Massachusetts Port Authority, for comment on the draft Worcester Regional Airport Area Form, prepared by Epsilon Associates

Ms. Johnstone stated that the Massachusetts Port Authority is planning on potentially demolishing one of the 1946 hangars at the Worcester Regional Airport, and in planning for that, they engaged Epsilon Associates to prepare an area form for the airport. Stewart Dalzell, Deputy Director of Environmental Planning & Permitting at Massachusetts Port Authority requested that the Commission provide comments or corrections to content of the form.

On a motion by Commissioner Long and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 5-0 to not issue comment.

C. Notice from the MHC regarding a finding of no adverse effects related to the rehabilitation of 28 Crown Street

The Commission had no comment on this item.

ADJOURNMENT

On a motion by Commissioner Long and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the meeting was adjourned at 7:05 PM.