

**MINUTES OF THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE
HISTORICAL COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WORCESTER**

JUNE 11, 2020

LEVI LINCOLN ROOM, ROOM 309 – CITY HALL*

Commission Members Participating: Mark Wamback, Chair
Devon Kurtz, Vice-Chair
Diane Long
Randolph Bloom
Tomi Stefani
Janet Theerman
Erika Helnarski, Alternate
Cathryn E. Jerome-Mezynski, Alternate

Staff Members Participating: Stephen Rolle, Division of Planning and Regulatory Services
Michelle Johnstone, Division of Planning and Regulatory Services

*Pursuant to Governor Baker’s March 12, 2020 Order Suspending Certain Provisions of the Open Meeting Law, G.L. c. 30A, §18, and the Governor’s March 23, 2020 Order, as amended, imposing strict limitation on the number of people that may gather in one place, this meeting was conducted through remote participation. The meeting was livestreamed from the City of Worcester website and via the local cable access channel and is available for streaming online. Public participation was facilitated through a call-in number, 415-655-0001 (Access Code: 730323290#), which was publicized on the posted meeting agenda and during the video broadcast.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

May 14, 2020 – On a motion by Commissioner Theerman and seconded by Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 7-0 to approve the minutes from the May 14, 2020 meeting. Commissioner Jerome-Mezynski did not vote as she did not participate in the May 14, 2020 meeting.

May 28, 2020 – On a motion by Commission Long and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 7-0 to approve the minutes from the May 14, 2020 meeting. Vice-Chair Kurtz did not vote as he did not participate in the May 28, 2020 meeting.

OLD BUSINESS

Certificate of Appropriateness & Building Demolition Delay Waiver

1. 9 Oxford Street – HC-2019-071 (MBL 03-025-00004)

Petitioner: Helen & Dom Pham

Year Built: 1891

Historic Status: MACRIS listed; National Register Determination of Eligibility (DOE); National Register District (NRDIS); Local Historic District (LHD); State Register (SR), FKA Salem Griggs House

Petition Purpose:

- Replace windows (retroactive)

The petitioner requested that the item be postponed to the next meeting.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Long and seconded by Commissioner Kurtz, the Commission voted 6-0 to postpone the item to the June 25, 2020 meeting. Commissioner Bloom recused himself, and alternate member Commissioner Helnarski voted.

NEW BUSINESS

Building Demolition Delay Waiver

2. 12 Westland Street – HC-2020-035 (MBL 11-008-00019)

Petitioner: Jonathan Rigali

Year Built: 1897

Historic Status: MACRIS listed; National Register District (NRDIS); National Register Multiples Resource Area (NRMRA); State Register of Historic Places (SR), FKA C.A. Chandler House

Petition Purpose:

- Remove existing slate roof and replace with architectural shingles
-

Jonathan Rigali, contractor, spoke on behalf of the application. He stated the intent of the Genesis Club, who own the property, to remove the original slate roof and replace it with architectural shingle. He stated that there has been a leak in the silo (turret). He also stated that he has a rough estimate for what it would cost to repair the roof and re-roof the silo in slate, which was included in the application materials. He stated that the amount of money it would cost to do repairs and the costs down the road are not something that the owner wants to do, and they would like to move ahead with stripping in the slate and installing architectural shingle. He stated that the cost to re-roof the entire house and garage in architectural shingle would be \$29,000. To replace the entire roof of the house with new slate would cost \$72,000. To only repair the silo (turret) is \$20,000.

Commissioner Stefani stated that he thinks that the slate roof is significant to the house, and that the neighborhood is well preserved. He thinks removing the slate will alter its appearance and rob it of some of its significance. He noted that he understands the costs, but he thinks that replacing the slate with architectural shingles would be damaging to the neighborhood. He asked if alternatives have been explored. Mr. Rigali stated he had looked at Slateline shingle, which is an asphalt shingle that looks like slate. He stated that the product is a little more expensive at \$38,000, but maintains the look of slate.

There was some confusion about the pricing for slate repairs or in-kind replacement. Mr. Rigali stated that it would cost \$20,000 to repair the silo (turret).

Chair Wambach asked Ms. Johnstone if there was a product that the Commission had approved in the past. She stated that the product is synthetic slate. Mr. Rigali stated that he could look into that product and have a discussion with the Genesis Club about whether or not that is something they would be interested in.

Commissioner Helnarski stated that she wouldn't be comfortable taking a vote until the Commission received concrete price estimates and visuals of what slate-like materials would look like. She also stated that ten years down the road when more repairs may need to be made, the Genesis Club may not even own the building.

Commissioner Theerman stated she would be more in favor of repair. Mr. Rigali stated that it's not really the slate that is the problem, but the nails that are failing and allowing the slate to move.

Commissioner Bloom stated that he would be very concerned to lose the slate roof, and that he would be curious to learn about the asphalt shingles that mimic slate. He stated that the loss of this roof would have a significant impact on the architectural heritage of the City. Mr. Rigali stated he would be happy to get together pricing and images for artificial slate and Slateline shingles for the Commission's review. He asked if the Commission would like a written estimate of the cost to do the slate repairs or an in-kind replacement. Chair Wambach stated that that is something the Commission typically likes to see.

Commissioner Theerman state that the house at 2 Massachusetts Avenue has a slate-like roof, if the Commissioners were interested in seeing what it might look like.

No public comment.

On a motion by Commissioner Long and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0, with all regular members voting, to continue the application to the June 25, 2020 meeting.

Exhibits

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver dated May 11, 2020, received May 13, 2020.

Building Demolition Delay Waiver

3. 950 Main Street – HC-2020-036 (MBL 08-003-00001)

Petitioner: A&M Construction Co., Inc.

Year Built: 1957

Historic Status: MACRIS listed; National Register District (NRDIS); National Register Multiple Resource Area (NRMRA); State Register of Historic Places (SR), Clark University Science Building

Petition Purpose:

- Install 3 additional access points to basement main piping supply "crawl" space
- Install access point for make-up air unit and dehumidification systems
- Replace natural gas lines

Mark Roberts of A&M Construction, Gardner Peters of Clark University, and Rob Troccoli of IFDI spoke on behalf of the application. Mr. Peters gave an overview of the application. He stated that the subterranean crawl space that has a very low ceiling and there is currently one very unsafe way to get into the space. He stated that all the building's piping is in that space. They propose installing a bulkhead to get into the space; a concrete pad and approach for a new make-up air unit; and install two other means of egress into the space. They also plan on replacing the natural gas lines.

Commissioner Long stated that she thought all of that sounded fine. Chair Wamback agreed, stating that he had nothing further to add. No other commission members commented.

No public comment.

On a motion by Commissioner Theerman and seconded by Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 6-0, with all regular members voting, to close the public hearing.

On a motion by Commissioner Long and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0, with all regular members voting, that the proposed demolition at 950 Main Street would not be detrimental to the historic or architectural resources of the City of Worcester and approved the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.

Exhibits

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver dated and received May 18, 2020.

COMMUNICATIONS

- A. 1. Letter from MHC to Worcester Department of Public Works & Parks re: receipt of Doherty High School PNF and preliminary comments
2. Letter to MHC from Lamoreux Pagano Associates, Architects, re: response to MHC preliminary comments on Doherty High School PNF

The Commission had no comment on the above items, and no action was required.

- B. Request for finding of effect from the WRA re: Section 106 Compliance for Center Platform Project, Worcester Union Station

Ms. Johnstone stated the request, which was submitted by the FTA, was made as a part of Section 106 Compliance. She stated that the Commission had voted to issue a finding of no effect based on a technical memo that was prepared for the MBTA, however the center platform piece of the overall project was omitted from that memo. She stated that they did, however, review this portion of the project as a Building Demolition Delay Waiver application. Mr. Rolle further explained the request.

On a motion by Chair Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0, with all regular members voting, to issue a finding of no adverse effects to historical resources as a result of the Center Platform Project.

ADJOURNMENT

Upon a motion by Chair Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the meeting was adjourned at 6:40 PM.