

**MINUTES OF THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE
HISTORICAL COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WORCESTER**

January 30, 2020

ESTHER HOWLAND CHAMBERS, ROOM 302 – CITY HALL

Commission Members Present: Randolph Bloom, Vice-Chair
Robyn Conroy, Clerk
Devon Kurtz
Diane Long
Tomi Stefani
Janet Theerman

Commission Members Absent: Cathryn E. Jerome-Mezynski, Alternate
Mark Wamback, Chair

APPROVAL OF MINUTES – JANUARY 9, 2020

Upon a motion by Commissioner Theerman and seconded by Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 5-0 to approve the minutes of January 9, 2020.

OLD BUSINESS

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS AND BUILDING DEMOLITION DELAY WAIVER

1. 9 Oxford Street – HC-2019-071 (MBL 03-025-00004)

Petitioner: Helen & Don Pham

Year Built: 1891

Historic Status: MACRIS listed; National Register Determination of Eligibility (DOE); National Register District (NRDIS); Local Historic District (LHD); State Register (SR), FKA Salem Griggs House

Petition Purpose:

- Replace windows (retroactive)

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: February 7, 2020

The applicant requested a postponement.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 to continue the Building Demolition Delay Waiver application to the February 6, 2020 meeting and set the Constructive Grant Deadline to February 21, 2020.

List of Exhibits:

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver application dated September 11, 2019, received September 12, 2019.

Exhibit B: Request for Continuance/Constructive Approval Date Extension, received October 17, 2019.

Exhibit C: Request for Continuance/Constructive Approval Date Extension, received November 4, 2019.

Exhibit D: Request for Continuance/Constructive Approval Date Extension, received November 21, 2019.

Exhibit E: Request for Continuance/Constructive Approval Date Extension, received January 9, 2019.

2. 115 Pleasant Street– HC-2019-090 (MBL 03-029-00022)

Petitioner: Fred Koza

Year Built: c1925

Historic Status: MACRIS listed, FKA the Sheraton Apartment House; within the Crown Hill Local Historic District

Petition Purpose:

- Replace existing storefront windows with new glass and repair and replace damaged wood trim with similar material
- Replace front door with insulated glass door

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: January 25, 2020

Fred Koza, general contractor; Salah Asfoura of AA Design Services; and Mark Goldstein appeared on behalf of the application. Mr. Koza reiterated the intent of the petition, which is to replace the doors and windows on the Pleasant Street elevation.

Mr. Asfoura stated that the front doors, windows, and one side door will be replaced. He stated that the existing wood and glass is damaged. New, insulated doors and windows with metal frames to match the appearance of what is existing are proposed. Additionally, a new wood ceiling panel in a recessed exterior entrance will be installed to replace an existing rotted panel.

Commissioner Bloom inquired as to whether or not the cast stone scrolls at the window corners would be retained. Mr. Asfoura affirmed that they would be retained.

Commissioner Kurtz asked whether the stonework would be cleaned. Mr. Koza stated he was unsure whether that was in the scope, but if it is needed it will likely be done.

Commissioner Long stated that she drove by the property, and noted that one of the doors, although pretty, was very damaged and likely not original.

No Public Comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Theerman and seconded by Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 5-0 to close the public hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 5-0 to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 115 Pleasant Street as proposed.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 5-0 to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver for 115 Pleasant Street.

List of Exhibits:

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver application dated November 6, 2019, received November 26, 2019.

Exhibit B: Request for Continuance/Constructive Approval Date Extension, received December 12, 2019.

Exhibit C: Request for Postponement/Constructive Approval Date Extension, received January 23, 2020.

NEW BUSINESS

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS & BUILDING DEMOLITION DELAY WAIVER

3. 28 Crown Street – HC-2020-004 (MBL 03-024-00022)

Petitioner: Kenneth Wolanin o/b/o Johanny Done

Year Built: 1860

Historic Status: MACRIS listed; State Register (SR); National Register District (NRDIS); National Register Multiple Resource Area (MRA); Local Historic District (LHD); FKA Edward P. Drury House

Petition Purpose:

- Replace existing roof covering with architectural shingles
- Remove chimney
- Repair fascia, rake & soffit trim and flashing where necessary
- Remove gutters
- Install new vent pipe boots
- Install handrail to code on second floor deck

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: February 14, 2020

Ken Wolanin, City of Worcester employee, appeared on behalf of the application. He stated the work proposed, but informed the board that chimney work was added to the scope in error, and asked that it be removed from the application. Additionally, he asked that the replacement of an exterior existing steel door be added to the application. The door to be replaced is at the rear of the house, not visible from the public-right-of-way, and will be replaced with a Therma-Tru door.

Commissioner Kurtz asked Mr. Wolanin what color the new roofing material would be. Mr. Wolanin stated that a color has not been chosen. Commissioner Bloom stated that color is a concern in a Local Historic District. Michelle Johnstone stated that in Local Historic Districts, the Commission would typically request a similar-to-existing color be chosen. Commissioner Bloom caveated that this is only the case if the existing material color is historically appropriate.

Commissioner Stefani asked if it was true that the gutters will be removed. Mr. Wolanin said that they would be removed while the work was being done and then reinstalled.

Commissioner Kurtz asked if the molding at the roofline would be impacted. Mr. Wolanin said no, unless there was damage, in which place the molding would be repaired in-kind.

No Public Comment

Upon a motion by Commissioner Theerman and seconded by Commissioner Kurtz, the Commission voted 6-0 to close the public hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 6-0 to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 28 Crown Street, with approved work to include the replacement of the existing roof shingles with a color to match existing; repair of the fascia, soffit trim and flashing where necessary; removal of the gutters for the duration of the project and reinstallation of the gutters at the completion of the project; installation of new vent pipe boots; and installation of a handrail to code on the second floor deck.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Kurtz, the Commission voted 6-0 to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver for 28 Crown Street.

List of Exhibits:

Exhibit A: Certificate of Appropriateness and Building Demolition Delay Waiver application dated January 7, 2020, received January 7, 2020.

Exhibit B: Request for Postponement/Constructive Approval Date Extension, received January 22, 2020.

Building Demolition Delay Waiver

4. 4 Stowell Avenue – HC-2020-001 (MBL 13-005-0014A)

Petitioner: Ryan Sabatalo

Year Built: ca. 1900

Historic Status: MACRIS listed, Benjamin H. and Estella Clough House

Petition Purpose:

- Remove clapboard siding and replace with vinyl siding
- Remove three existing windows and install vinyl replacement windows

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: February 16, 2020

Laura and David Lajoie, homeowners, appeared on behalf of the petition. Mrs. Lajoie reiterated the scope of the project, and said that the house has water damage and the exterior materials are rotting. She stated that they propose to wrap and vinyl side the house.

Commissioner Bloom stated that typically the Commission would request cost comparisons. Mrs. Lajoie stated that those were submitted. She stated that the cost of replacing the siding with vinyl is approximately \$28,000, and the cost to replace with in-kind materials is \$120,000 before painting and maintenance for the life of the siding.

Commissioner Kurtz asked how the decorative windows on the third floor would be treated. Mrs. Lajoie said that they ordered oval windows to replace them, and they also ordered shingle-style vinyl shake siding to be installed where there are currently wood shingles. Commissioner Kurtz also asked about proposed treatment of the existing window surrounds around the oval windows, to which Mrs. Lajoie responded that recreating those elements in vinyl would cost several thousand more dollars. Commissioner Long asked whether the window surrounds could be kept in their current state. Mrs. Lajoie responded that the element is rotted. Commissioners Kurtz and Conroy both noted that the decorative elements around the windows are key architectural features. Commissioner Kurtz noted that he might be willing to compromise on the side windows, but not the front. Commissioner Bloom concurred. Mrs. Lajoie said that she understood. Mr. Lajoie stated that they are trying very hard and that it is not easy.

Commissioner Kurtz noted that a carpenter, or their contractor, could recreate the decorative elements in question using PVC.

Commissioner Long inquired as to whether the cost estimate to recreate the decorative window surrounds included only one or all. Mrs. Lajoie stated that the estimate to recreate all the decorative elements on the house was \$5500.

Commissioner Stefani asked whether it was a possibility to replace the glass and retain the wood frame. Mrs. Lajoie stated that the frame is rotted.

Commissioner Bloom stated that it seemed as though the applicants would not feel comfortable recreating the decorative elements on the front of the house. Mrs. Lajoie stated that she did not ask for a quote to only recreate the elements on the front of the house. Commissioner Conroy stated that it seemed to her that recreating the decorative elements on the front of the house seemed like a viable option for approval, and asked whether that is something the applicants would be willing to do. Mrs. Lajoie stated that they would be willing if that was there option, but did not want to spend \$5000 to replace all the elements.

Commissioner Stefani asked which three windows are being proposed to be replaced. Mrs. Lajoie stated it was the three attic oval windows.

Ms. Johnstone stated that the Commission might want to continue the item to the following week to give the applicants time to prepare a quote for the cost to recreate the decorative elements on the front of the house. Mrs. Lajoie stated that they would like to get the house sided before the wet season. Commissioner Bloom stated that the Commission is trying to give them an option to wait another week rather than another year [at which point the demolition delay period would expire]. Mrs. Lajoie stated that they would be willing to retain the elements on the façade.

Commissioner Bloom stated that he was also concerned about the banding detail. Mrs. Lajoie stated that she would speak to her contractor about that detail. She thinks that it would likely just require a wider piece of vinyl.

No Public Comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Theerman and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 to close the public hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Kurtz and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver on the condition that the detailing on the façade oval window be retained and that the lintel details on all of the windows be retained if possible.

List of Exhibits:

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver application dated November 21, 2019, received January 2, 2020.

Exhibit B: Request for Postponement/Constructive Approval Date Extension, received January 22, 2020.

5. 725 Southbridge Street – HC-2020-002 (MBL 07-051-00001)

Petitioner: Douglas Vogel

Year Built: 1904

Historic Status: MACRIS listed; National Register District (NRDIS), National Register Multiple Resource Area (MRA); State Register of Historic Places (SR), FKA Whittall Mills Dye House

Petition Purpose:

- Raze a 2,000 square foot section at the south end of the building to allow for two-way traffic on Appian Way

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: February 16, 2020

Douglas Vogel and Vinny DiLeo, representatives of M.J. Whittall, appeared on behalf of the application.

Commissioner Bloom asked how the petition is different than a previous petition that came before the Board. Mr. Vogel stated that a portion of the southwest corner of 725 Southbridge Street will be removed to create enough width between the two existing buildings to allow for two-way traffic and a pedestrian walkway. Commissioner Bloom asked if the proposed work is the same work presented to the Commission previously. Mr. Vogel stated that although it is part of the same project, it is a different building.

Ms. Johnstone stated that she did a site visit to the property and can confirm that there have been several traffic accidents in the area in question, which is very small.

Commissioner Bloom asked where in relation to the Rotmans part of the property this work is being done. Mr. DiLeo said that the work is being done on the Rotmans part of the property, and went on to explain the traffic and safety concerns at the site. Commissioner Bloom stated that they would be demolishing a small portion of the building in order to save a much larger portion of the building.

Commissioner Kurtz asked how the wall would be finished after demolition was complete. Mr. DiLeo stated that the wall would have the same look and design, including the cornice detailing.

Commissioner Stefani asked if windows would be added. Mr. DiLeo stated that the openings would be kept, and any original windows would be kept in place, just moved back. Ms. Johnstone asked for clarification. The applicants reiterated that approximately 2000 square feet will be removed, and a new wall would be constructed to enclose the building. The windows would be put back in the wall.

Mr. Vogel said that the hardest part of preserving the buildings is finding a new role for them. They have found a new role, but some changes need to be made to make that new use possible.

Commissioner Stefani asked whether the new wall would be a curtain wall supported by the frame or if it would be ground-up construction. Mr. DiLeo stated that it would be a ground-up build.

No Public Comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Theerman and seconded by Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 6-0 to close the public hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver as proposed.

List of Exhibits:

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver application dated December 30, 2019, received January 2, 2020.

Exhibit B: Request for Postponement/Constructive Approval Date Extension, received January 22, 2020.

6. 3–5 Brussels Street – HC-2020-003 (MBL 07-051-00003)

Petitioner: Douglas Vogel

Year Built: 1866–1883

Historic Status: MACRIS listed; National Register District (NRDIS), National Register Multiple Resource Area (MRA); State Register of Historic Places (SR), FKA Whittall Carpet Mill #1 & #3

Petition Purpose:

- Remove existing windows and replace with simulated divided-light windows

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: February 16, 2020

Douglas Vogel and Vinny DiLeo, representatives of M.J. Whittall, appeared on behalf of the application. Ms. Johnstone informed the Commission that a lot of the work on the application was being approved retroactively.

Mr. Vogel stated that when they had come before the Commission previously to request permission for a partial demolition of the building on the site, they thought that they had satisfied the requirements for to waive the demolition delay. He explained that the building must be air conditioned and heated. Windows have already been ordered for the entire building. Most window openings were empty and covered only by plywood or corrugated metal. However, more openings than expected had original windows behind the plywood or corrugated metal. The windows that have been ordered match, in every case, the original pattern. Mr. Vogel apologized for the retroactive aspect of the application.

Ms. Johnstone said that she did a site visit, and took photographs of some in-situ windows, which were in very poor condition. Mr. DiLeo also noted that there were asbestos and lead concerns with respect to the windows.

No Public Comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Theerman and seconded by Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 6-0 to close the public hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 6-0 to approved the Building Demolition Delay Waiver as proposed.

List of Exhibits:

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver application dated January 2, 2020, received January 2, 2020.

Exhibit B: Request for Postponement/Constructive Approval Date Extension, received January 22, 2020.

COMMUNICATIONS

- a. Communication from MHC re: receipt of Main Street and Murray Avenue Historic District National Register nomination
- b. Communication from MHC re: official listing of Dale and Ethan Allen Streets Historic District to the National Register of Historic Places

OTHER BUSINESS

- a. Election of Board officers
This item was held until the February 6, 2020 meeting so that all current officers could be present. Commissioner Bloom asked if Commissioner Kurtz could be assigned a new role in absentia. Ms. Johnstone said that that could be done. Commissioner Kurtz affirmed that he would serve as needed.
- b. Selection of Worcester Historical Commission representative for the 2020 Worcester Preservation Awards
Commissioner Long volunteered herself as a representative of the Worcester Historical Commission to assist in the selection of winners for the Worcester Preservation Awards.

ADJOURNMENT

Upon a motion by Commissioner Theerman and seconded by Commissioner Long the Commission voted 6-0 to adjourn the meeting at 6:35 p.m.