

**MINUTES OF THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE
HISTORICAL COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WORCESTER**

November 7, 2019

LEVI LINCOLN CHAMBER, ROOM 309 – CITY HALL

Commission Members Present: Mark Wamback
Randolph Bloom, Vice-Chair
Robyn Conroy, Clerk
Diane Long
Janet Theerman
Cathryn E. Jerome-Mezynski, Alternate

Commission Members Absent: Tomi Stefani
Devon Kurtz

APPROVAL OF MINUTES – OCTOBER 3, 2019 & OCTOBER 17, 2019 –

Minutes from October 3, 2019 held until November 21, 2019 meeting

Upon a motion by Commissioner Theerman and seconded by Commissioner Long the Commission voted 4-0 to approve the minutes of October 17, 2019.

OLD BUSINESS

BUILDING DEMOLITION DELAY WAIVER

1. 5 Richards Street – HC-2019-072 (MBL 04-024-32-02)

Petitioner: Tony Nguyen
Year Built: ca. 1829
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, fka Deacon David Richards House

Petition Purpose:

- Demolish House

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: December 22, 2019

Tony Nguyen appeared upon behalf of the application. He stated that he purchased the house two months ago, and wanted to fix the house. After seeing the interior structure, which was damaged by a fire, he determined that it could not be fixed. He want to move forward with demolishing the house and plans to build a four-unit structure in its place. Mr. Nguyen indicated that he has spoken with a structural engineer and the structure cannot be saved.

Commissioners Bloom and Conroy indicated that they would like to see a report from a structural engineer that confirms that the building cannot be salvaged. Commissioner Theerman stated that because the house is clad in aluminum siding and has already had many of its architectural elements removed, its integrity may already be compromised. Commissioner Wamback agreed and indicated that it is clear that the building has suffered extensive damaged and likely cannot be salvaged, but a report from a structural engineer would make the decision of the Commission more straightforward. Mr. Nguyen agreed to hire a structural engineer to complete a report. He also said that any new construction at the site will be similar to the existing building.

Public Comment.

Deborah Packard of Preservation Worcester stated the Preservation Worcester has had the property on their endangered structures list, and that she would also like to see a report from a structural engineer before any decision is made.

After Public Comment

After public comment was concluded, Commissioner Bloom suggested that if the siding is aluminum, as Commissioner Theerman had mentioned, the historic fabric underneath may be uncompromised. Stephen Rolle suggested that the Commission request that a piece of the existing aluminum siding be removed and photographs of the underlying exterior wall material be presented to the Commission. He also suggested that Mr. Nguyen bring estimates detailing the costs to replace and to repair the building.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Theerman and seconded by Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 6-0 to close the public hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 6-0 to continue the Building Demolition Delay Waiver application to the November 21, 2019 meeting and set the Constructive Grant Deadline to December 16, 2019.

List of Exhibits:

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver application dated September 13, 2019, received September 13, 2019.

2. 145 Providence Street – HC-2019-076 (MBL 35-023-00049)

Petitioner: Tai M. Dinh
Year Built: c1926
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, National Register District (NRD), National Register MRA, fka Sacks Three-Decker

Petition Purpose:

- Install vinyl siding
- Install new windows and doors
- Install gutters and downspouts

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: December 22, 2019

Applicant was absent.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Long and seconded by Commissioner Bloom, the Commission voted 6-0 to continue the Building Demolition Delay Waiver application to the November 21, 2019 meeting.

List of Exhibits:

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver application dated October 9, 2019, received October 11, 2019.

Exhibit B: Request for Continuance/Constructive Approval Date Extension, received October 17, 2019.

NEW BUSINESS

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS & BUILDING DEMOLITION DELAY WAIVER

3. 5 Massachusetts Avenue – HC-2019-085 (MBL 20-014-00003)

- Petitioner: William Gates
- Year Built: 1901
- Historic Status: MACRIS listed; Local Historic District (LHD); National Register District (NRDIS); fka Gertrude L. McKoan House
- Petition Purpose:
- Repair, in-kind, damaged existing cedar siding
 - Repaint house and carriage house, including power washing, scraping, priming and finish painting, and caulking

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: December 10, 2019

The applicant and homeowner, William Gates appeared. He stated that he purchased the house two years ago, and that at this point in time a lot of the paint is chipping off and some second-story cedar shingles are missing and that some of the clapboard siding is rotting. Some of the columns are rotting as well. He would like to fix the wood elements, and would also like to paint the house. The applicant has been in touch with the color consultants with the Cambridge Historical Commission to research period-appropriate paint colors. He has not yet chosen a color or colors, but has chosen a color family.

There was some question over whether the Board had purview over paint color in all three Local Historic Districts, but it was confirmed that the board did have purview over paint color in all LHDs. Commissioner Bloom suggested that appropriate color combinations would be very different across each LHD, and requested assistance in coming up with a way to evaluate color choices. Commissioner Wamback suggested that he would only be concerned with colors in districts that could be seen as offensive to others in the community.

The applicant stated that he would not mind coming back after his meeting with the color specialists in Cambridge to bring his color choices before the Board. Steve Rolle suggested that to avoid a second filing just for the paint, the Board could take a vote on all work besides the paint color.

No Public Comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 6-0 to close the public hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 6-0 to partially approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver application.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 to continue the paint aspect of the Certificate of Appropriateness to the December 12, 2019 meeting.

List of Exhibits:

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver application dated October 9, 2019, received October 11, 2019.

4. 11 Oxford Street – HC-2019-087 (MBL 03-025-00005)

Petitioner: Thomas Rheault and Carmen Michel
Year Built: 1850
Historic Status: MACRIS listed; National Register Determination of Eligibility (DOE); National Register District (NRDIS); Local Historic District (LHD); fka Samuel A. Goss House

Petition Purpose:

- Window replacement
- Replacement of 2 of 4 exterior doors
- Replacement of front and main roof
- Rebuild and extend porch and exterior stair
- Repaint

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: December 15, 2019

Thomas Rheault and Carmen Michel, the applicants and homeowners, appeared before the Commission. Mr. Rheault stated that he and his wife bought the property in September and would like to replace the existing asphalt shingle roof over the main block of the house with a new asphalt shingle roof and the metal roof over the porch with a new black standing-seam metal roof. Additionally, the applicants would like to replace all of the windows in the house due to their state of disrepair and the presence of lead paint. They would like to replace both the rear door and the main door on the side of the house, neither of which are historic. They would like to replace the not original deck off of the rear of the house with a slightly larger deck. They would like to repaint the house as well.

Commissioner Wamback stated that although there is a lot of work proposed, most of it is easy to assess. He stated that there is no problem with replacing asphalt shingle with asphalt shingle, and that since it is difficult to see the porch roof from the street, there is little problem in his mind swapping the existing metal roof with the black standing-seam metal roof.

Commissioner Wamback inquired as to the visibility of the rear door. Mr. Rheault explained that the rear door is only visible to the house that is located to the rear of his. Commissioner Wamback inquired as to what kind of door the applicants plan on replacing the existing doors with. Mr. Rheault plans on installing nine-light Masonite exterior doors.

Commissioner Wamback agreed that the non-historic deck does not need to be preserved.

Commissioner Wamback stated that there needed to be discussion about the removal of the windows. Commissioner Bloom stated that the windows in the house, while old, are not original. He assessed that they were probably replaced about 1890. The applicant stated that he planned on replacing the windows with Harvey Majesty wood windows. He is open to any sash arrangements that would be acceptable to the Board. The existing storm windows will be removed and not replaced. Commissioner Bloom expressed concern over the lead on the existing windows. Commissioner Wamback echoed that concern. Commissioner Bloom wondered if there was a way to remove or eliminate the presence of lead on the portions of the windows that would create lead dust. The applicant mentioned that you could dip them or rebuild them. Commissioner Wamback expressed that since the windows are not original, nothing is really being taken away. Commissioner Conroy also noted that the applicant did not plan on removing the stained glass windows, which was nice. The new windows will be six-over-six wood sash, except for those in the addition.

The applicants stated that they would come back to discuss paint color.

No Public Comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Theerman and seconded by Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 6-0 to close the public hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 6-0 to partially approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application. Approved changes include window replacement with six-over-six Harvey Majesty wood windows, door replacement, roof replacement, and the reconstruction and extension of rear porch and exterior stair

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 to partially approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application. Approved changes include window replacement in smaller window openings in the rear addition with two-over-two Harvey Majesty wood windows.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 6-0 to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver application.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 to continue the paint aspect of the Certificate of Appropriateness to the January 9, 2020 meeting.

List of Exhibits:

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver application dated October 16, 2019, received October 16, 2019.

5. 56 Olga Avenue – HC-2019-083 (MBL 16-009-00034)

Petitioner:	Enda S. Garry
Year Built:	c1912
Historic Status:	MACRIS listed; National Register Individual (NRIND); National Register MRA; fka Charles Magnuson Three-Decker
Petition Purpose:	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Replace slate roof

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: November 16, 2019

Alex Lappin of Greater Boston Roofing appeared upon behalf of the application. He stated that they had been contracted to replace the roof. Mr. Lappin stated that the roof is an approximately fifty-year-old slate roof in disrepair with damage along the valleys and some slates are brittle or broken. Additionally there is moisture damage to the wood on the interior. The homeowner wants to replace the roof with asphalt shingle. The cost of replacing the roof will be covered by Vivid Solar in order for the homeowner to be able to get solar panels installed. Solar panels cannot be installed on a slate roof, and the cost of a slate roof replacement is prohibitive to the building owner.

Commissioner Bloom requested a timeline on the project because he would like to see a comparison of cost. The applicant responded that the average cost of replacing a slate roof the size of the roof in question typically runs between \$23,000 and \$26,000; and the cost to replace with asphalt shingle assuming no decking needs to be replaced will cost approximately \$12,650.

Commissioner Bloom mentioned that it is most likely that the roof is actually original to the house, and not just fifty years old. He also mentioned that because of the height of the house and the pitch of the roof, it is difficult to see the roofing materials. He also mentioned that solar panels will be a significant plus to the homeowner and probably everyone. Commissioner Wamback concurred.

Commissioner Bloom also mentioned the heavy alterations already present on the house. He also asked if it was possible to salvage some of the slates for use on another property. Mr. Lappin explained that he has tried to salvage slate in the past and about 40%-60% of it broke in the removal process.

No public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Theerman and seconded by Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 6-0 to close the public hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Mezynski and seconded Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 6-0 that the Building Demolition Delay Waiver is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the City and voted to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver application.

List of Exhibits:

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver application dated July 2, 2019, received October 2, 2019

6. 425C Salisbury Lane – HC-2019-084 (MBL 43-01E-00078)

Petitioner: Amanda Normandin
Year Built: c1914
Historic Status: MACRIS listed; National Register District (NRDIS); National Register MRA; fka Knollwood Estate Caretaker – Servant House
Petition Purpose:

- Construct a one-story, shed-roof addition off of the east elevation

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: November 17, 2019

Commissioner Theerman recused herself.

Amanda Normandin, architectural designer; and Mr. and Mrs. Cimisliu, homeowners, appeared upon behalf of the application. Ms. Normandin explained the proposal for a 250 square foot addition off of the rear (east) elevation of the home. The materials on the addition will match the materials that exist on the original house with the exception of the roof, which will be metal instead of slate. Windows will be six-over-six. Existing stairs off of the back of the house will remain, and the soffit like on the rear of the house will be retained. An on-grade patio accessed from a sliding glass door in the addition and a concrete stoop will be added as well.

Commissioner Wamback asked how much of the addition would be visible from the road. It was determined that the only people that would see the full addition would be those on the private road beyond the house. Commissioner Bloom inquired whether the status of a road as a private road rather than a public way changes the Commission's purview. Steve Rolle explained that the under demolition delay, the Commission can make the decision of how they interpret that. Commissioner Conroy asked what exactly would be demolished. Ms. Normandin explained that a portion of the coved soffit would be removed to tie in the new roof; and the existing rear stairs would be slightly altered to accommodate the new stoop.

No Public Comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Long and seconded by Commissioner Bloom, the Commission voted 6-0 to close the public hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 6-0 that the Building Demolition Delay Waiver is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the City and voted to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver application.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver application dated September 24, 2019, received October 3, 2019

7. 22 Front Street – HC-2019-077 (MBL 02-025-007+8)

Petitioner: 10-30 Front Street LLC
Year Built: ca. 1941
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, fka Woolworth, F.W. and Company Store
Petition Purpose:

- Façade renovation

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: November 23, 2019

Felicio Lana, owner of the property, appeared on behalf of the application. Mr. Lana explained that his plan is to remove the old façade of the mall and replace it with a glass façade. He thinks the current look of the building is very dark and needs a desperate facelift. He has hired consultants to determine if any of the existing materials such as the deco art [sic] work above the windows could be salvaged and be put inside of the mall.

Commissioner Bloom inquired about the current condition of the façade. Mr. Lana explained that structurally it is sound and safe but the amount of years of neglect and (deferred) maintenance has led to deterioration of the exterior and the roof. When he purchased the building, there were over 42 buckets on the second floor holding water from the deteriorated roof. Part of the roof has already been replaced. Mr. Lana reiterated that the exterior of the building is very weather-damaged.

Commissioner Wamback inquired as to whether or not Mr. Lana has looked into the cost of repairing the façade. Mr. Lana explained that he has not done so because he does not believe that the look of it could fit with his vision. He thinks that the look of it is to blame for the lack of tenants for the past thirty years. He also says that he has not considered repair because of damage.

Commissioner Wamback inquired as to tenants on the second floor. Mr. Lana replied that the second floor is empty.

Commissioner Conroy remarked that on Front Street, the property at 22 Front Street is the only building that has stayed the same and that she would hate to see it change.

Commissioner Bloom mentioned that we do not have many art deco facades remaining in the City, and those that have been restored look attractive. He is not sure he is comfortable in seeing it removed, and believed that total glass front buildings are past no longer visually appealing.

Mr. Lana explained that he plans on using the first floor as an urban market and the second floor as a fitness club.

Commissioner Wamback remarked that he thinks an all glass building on that street would look out of place.

Mr. Lana remarked that if he does not change the façade, he will not reach his financial goals.

Commissioner Mezynski asked whether Mr. Lana had considered installing his glass design on the first floor and keeping the art deco above. Mr. Lana said that he would be open to it. He also agreed to obtain a report that would spell out what would be needed in terms of repairs.

Commissioner Bloom asked if artificial lighting or the opening of interior spaces could contribute to making the building more attractive. Mr. Lana is worried about changing the outside of the building to give it a more attractive look from the outside to get people back in.

Mr. Lana also mentioned that he is hoping to have a rooftop restaurant and lounge at the building.

Public Comment

Deborah Packard of Preservation Worcester stated the Preservation Worcester spoken about the project and agrees that more information is needed on the cost and feasibility on the restoration of the façade. They agree that the art deco façade is important and a glass façade could be a sore thumb on that street.

Shaheen Adelinia spoke against the proposal of the façade renovations to 22 Front Street. He doesn't see a glass façade being an addition to Worcester.

John Snyder of Apex Real Estate, Mr. Lana's broker, supports the proposed glass façade. He thinks there are many other good examples of art deco around the city, and does not think that 22 Front Street needs to be preserved.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Long, the Commission voted 6-0 to close the public hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 to continue the Building Demolition Delay Waiver application to the December 12, 2019 meeting and set the Constructive Grant Deadline to January 11, 2020.

GENERAL COMMISSION BUSINESS

Commissioner Bloom requested a short discussion on the protocol of new construction in vacant lots within Local Historic Districts and what the Commission's role might be in potential new construction. Michelle Johnstone explained that any new construction in Local Historic Districts would be subject to review by the Commission.

ADJOURNMENT

Upon a motion by Commissioner by Theerman and seconded by Commissioner Conroy the Commission voted 6-0 to adjourn the meeting at 7:02 p.m.