

**MINUTES OF THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE
HISTORICAL COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WORCESTER**

August 16, 2018

LEVI LINCOLN CHAMBER – CITY HALL

Commission Members Present: Andrew Shveda
Randolph Bloom
Robyn Conroy
Diane Long
Janet Theerman
Mark Wamback
Tomi Stefani, Alternate

Commission Members Absent: Devon Kurtz
Courtney Ross Escobar, Alternate

Staff Members Present: Susan Arena, Division of Planning & Regulatory Services
Stephen Rolle, Division of Planning & Regulatory Services

Call Commission to Order

The meeting was called to order by Chair Shveda at 5:30 pm.

Approval of Minutes

Review of the June 7, 2018 minutes.

Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Theerman the Commission voted 4-0 to approve the minutes of June 7, 2018.

Review of the July 12, 2018 minutes.

Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Wamback the Commission voted 3-0 to approve the minutes of July 12, 2018.

Old Business

1. 31 Elizabeth Street – HC-2018-047 (MBL 01-028-00102)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: Anthony Palacios
Present Use: Condominium building
Year Built: c1893
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, and National Register listed, fka Elizabeth Street Schoolhouse
Petition Purpose:

- Replace windows

Anthony Palacios, owner; and Jack Perrara, Liberty Construction, appeared on behalf of the application.

Chair Shveda reviewed the application stating that the applicant would like to replace the windows because they are drafty and the owners just had a baby. Staff confirmed that two other units had previously been approved for replacements. Mr. Ferrara stated that he did not know the manufacturer of the previous replacements, but that the proposed replacements will match the existing in color and grid pattern, in accordance with the condo association standards.

Staff stated that during the site visit it was difficult to differentiate the original windows from replacements as they all retain the same storm windows. It did appear that the original windows were double hung with triple hung storms over them, and the existing replacements were triple hung as well. The applicant stated that the replacements will be triple hung with a fixed upper sash.

No public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Bloom and seconded by Commissioner Wamback, the Commission voted 7-0 to close the hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 7-0 that the demolition of the historic building located at 31 Elizabeth Street is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated July 6, 2018 and received July 11, 2018.

2. 85 Granite Street – HC-2018-050 (MBL CO-NDO-02051)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: Min Jiang, Catherine Manning & George Dargan, and Francisca Goldsmith
Present Use: Condominium building
Year Built: c1918
Historic Status: MACRIS listed
Petition Purpose:

- Replace the front porches

Francisca Goldsmith and Cathy Manning, owners of two of the units, appeared on behalf of the application.

Chair Shveda noted the porches to be architecturally interesting and largely intact despite being wrapped in vinyl. Ms. Manning stated that due to the installation of the siding there has been ongoing issues with water being trapped on the porches leading to extensive rot and compromised structural stability. Chair Shveda explained that the Commission does not have purview over the new design, but are concerned with the loss of historic elements. They requested that the applicants provide additional quotes for reconstruction of the porches, including an option to rebuild it to match the historic appearance.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Wamback, the Commission voted 7-0 to continue the item to the August 30, 2018 meeting.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application undated and received July 13, 2018.

New Business

3. 31 Louise Street – HC-2018-052 (MBL 10-005-00020)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: Adnan Termos
Present Use: Three-family residence
Year Built: c1916
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, and National Register listed, fka the John and Edward Johnson Three-Decker

Petition Purpose:

- Demolish front three-story porch and rebuild first floor only
- Install vinyl siding

Adnan Termos, owner, appeared on behalf of the application.

Chair Shveda noted several violation notices from Inspectional Services, including one regarding the condition of the porches. Mr. Termos stated that he had contractors look at the porches and they agreed that they are not salvageable. Chair Shveda reviewed quotes provided by the applicant: approximately \$36,000 for rebuilding just the first floor porch in pressure treated wood and adding vinyl siding; approximately \$55,000 for rebuilding all porches in pressure treated wood and adding vinyl siding; approximately \$82,000 for rebuilding porches to match historic look and installing vinyl siding. Mr. Termos said he'd like to remove the windows on the left side of the first floor porch, and rebuild with just open columns across. The Commission was agreeable to that. Regarding siding, they suggested keeping the brackets along the eaves intact, and only running siding over the side and rear elevations where there is currently clapboard and restoring the wood siding on the front. Chair Shveda highlighted the variation on the siding across the front, which, combined with the porches make the house particularly notable.

The Commission and Mr. Termos could not come to an agreement regarding the specifics of the proposed porch replacement and the extent of the siding installation. Mr. Termos agreed to meet with staff prior to the next meeting to discuss options.

No public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wambach and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 7-0 to continue the item to the August 30, 2018 meeting.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated July 16, 2018 and received July 16, 2018.

4. 3 Pitt Street – HC-2018-053 (MBL 07-039-05+16)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: Gilberto Benitez
Present Use: Three-family residence
Year Built: c1918
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, and National Register listed, fka the Andrew McCarron Three-Decker

Petition Purpose:

- Install vinyl siding

Gilberto Benitez, son of the owner; and Joel Malaver, contractor, appeared on behalf of the application.

Chair Shveda reviewed the application noting that as a reason for the proposed work the applicant had listed lead paint. Mr. Malaver then stated that it was suspected but had not been confirmed through testing. Chair Shveda noted that the owner purchased the house in 2004, and asked whether any maintenance had been done since then. Mr. Benitez replied that just some interior painting had been completed.

Chair Shveda reviewed the quotes provided by the applicant: approximately \$25,000 for vinyl and approximately \$76,000 for full replacement in wood. The Commission focused on the front elevation, noting that it was very intact and featured unusual elements such as a scalloped frame around a sunburst design in the pediment, and fluted square columns on the porch. The applicant agreed to only install vinyl siding on the side and rear elevations and paint the front to match.

No public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Bloom and seconded by Commissioner Conroy, the Commission voted 7-0 to close the hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Wamback, the Commission voted 7-0 that the proposed demolition of the historic building located at 3 Pitt Street, consisting of installing vinyl siding on the side and rear elevations and painting the front elevation, is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated June 22, 2018 and received July 18, 2018.

5. 57 Union Street – HC-2018-054 (MBL 02-004-00004)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: TDG Union LLC
Present Use: Commercial building
Year Built: Post-1922
Historic Status: MACRIS listed
Petition Purpose:

- Install metal awning

Brian Listman, Sunshine Signs, appeared on behalf of the application.

Mr. Listman assured the Commission that the awning will be anchored using minimally invasive methods that should not damage the masonry.

No public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Wamback, the Commission voted 7-0 to close the hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 7-0 that the proposed demolition of the historic building located at 57 Union Street is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated July 5, 2018 and received July 19, 2018.

Exhibit B: Rendering of proposed awning on building

6. 3 North Ashland Street – HC-2018-055 (MBL 02-039-00017)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: Ying Rizika
Present Use: Multi-family residence
Year Built: c1851-1860
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, fka the James Robinson House
Petition Purpose:

- Replace egress stairs and porches (partially retroactive)

Ying (Amy) and Daniel Rizika, owners, appeared on behalf of the application.

The side egress stairs and porch had been removed by the applicant without Historical Commission approval or a building permit. Ms. Rizika stated that they were not in good condition and the post supporting the base was not installed properly, claiming that the porches fell down. The Commission agreed that the stairs were not notable architecturally.

No public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Theerman and seconded by Commissioner Wamback, the Commission voted 7-0 to close the hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 7-0 that the demolition of the historic building located at 3 North Ashland Street is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated July 22, 2018 and received July 23, 2018.

7. 26 Cedar Street – HC-2018-056 (MBL 02-033-00041)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: Daniel Rizika
Present Use: Mixed-use building
Year Built: c1857
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, and National Register listed, fka the William A. Williams House
Petition Purpose:

- Install vinyl siding
- Build rear egress

Ying (Amy) and Daniel Rizika, owners, appeared on behalf of the application.

Mr. Rizika stated that the paint had not been tested for lead, but that both applicants had just completed their Lead Renovation Supervisors Course and were instructed to presume that anything built before 1970 contained lead paint and that they don't recommend even testing. He explained that they'd like approval to install the siding as part of the window installation project so that the lift can be used for

both items. He stated that otherwise repainting would be too expensive because the lift would be needed for a longer period. Ms. Rizika stated that she'd like to retain all the decorative elements, including the quoins, brackets and window trim, as well as the siding within the entry porch. Mr. Rizika claimed that the house could not be abated, or that it would be too expensive to do so. Chair Shveda stated that regarding this matter the Commission would need more information, including the results of a lead test and the implications of those levels in terms of abatement standards. Mr. Rizika stated that he has no intention of painting the house within the next 10 years, and claimed that the house could not be prepped to be painted. He followed up by saying that since it's a rental he's not interested in making that kind of investment.

Mr. Rizika asked how this is different from the previous application at 3 Pitt Street where they allowed the owner to install siding on the side and rear elevations. Commissioner Conroy stated that this house is much more visible from all angles, and the installation of siding would be very noticeable. Commissioner Theerman stated that based on the argument about presuming any house older than 1970 having lead, then all houses that age should be sided, which she did not agree with.

No public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Wamback, the Commission voted 7-0 to close the hearing.

*Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 7-0 that the proposed demolition of the historic building located at 26 Cedar Street, **consisting of the construction of a rear egress**, is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.*

*Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 0-7 that the proposed demolition of the historic building located at 26 Cedar Street, **consisting of the installation of vinyl siding**, is detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to deny the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.*

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 0-7 that not allowing the installation of vinyl siding at 26 Cedar Street would pose an undue economic hardship and voted to deny the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated July 22, 2018 and received July 13, 2018.

8. 47 West Street – HC-2018-057 (MBL 01-028-00102)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: Mansour Gaval
Present Use: Multi-family residence
Year Built: c1880
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, and National Register listed, fka the Abbie and Emily Williams House

Petition Purpose:

- Install vinyl siding (partially retroactive)
- Remove/replace windows (partially retroactive)
- Repair/replace front porch
- Repair roof

Mansour Gaval, owner; and Gershon Gulko, attorney, appeared on behalf of the application.

Vinyl siding had been installed over the rear and right side elevations, the front door replaced, and multiple windows blocked off before an application for a building permit was submitted to Inspectional Services. At that time, the owner was notified of the property's historic status and instructed to apply for a Demolition Delay Waiver.

Mr. Gaval claimed that all sides except for the front already had vinyl siding. He believed that because he was just replacing old siding that he didn't need a permit. He stated that the paint is all peeling and had lead. Chair Shveda asked whether he'd had it tested. Mr. Gaval responded that yes, he had tested it himself.

Referring to Google street images from October 2017 Chair Shveda noted the severity of the violation as the work included siding over all windows on a bay window and all but one window on a sun porch. In addition, at least two second story windows had been blocked off and in the process of siding trim had been lost.

The Commission sought guidance on what their options are. Mr. Rolle responded that there is an option for a fine through the ordinance as well as through the building code. He recommended that the Commission and the applicant try to find a solution that addresses the work that's been done.

The applicant agreed to meet with staff prior to the next meeting to discuss options for remedying the unauthorized work.

No public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Wamback, the Commission voted 7-0 to continue the item to the August 30, 2018 meeting.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated July 23, 2018 and received July 26, 2018.

9. 2 (aka 10) Washington Square – HC-2018-058 (MBL 02-014-00012)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: Worcester Redevelopment Authority
Present Use: Train station
Year Built: 1911
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, and National Register listed, aka Union Station
Petition Purpose:

- Install copper cap on upper and lower parapets

Steve VanDyke, Nault Architects, appeared on behalf of the application.

Mr. VanDyke stated that a number of the problems that have been seen with the building envelope at Union Station are due to water infiltration. The sections of terra cotta along the roof ledge were originally joined by lead, many of which have failed. Some repairs have occurred over the years, but water infiltration persists. The proposal is to cap the entire ledge with copper.

No public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 7-0 to close the hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Wamback, the Commission voted 7-0 that the proposed demolition of the historic building located at 2 Washington Square is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated July 26, 2018 and received July 27, 2018.

10. 6 Chatham Street – HC-2018-059 (MBL 03-20A-00036)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: Emengini Educational Trust LLC
Present Use: Commercial building
Year Built: c1915
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, fka the Young Women’s Christian Association
Petition Purpose:

- Replace select bricks

Paul Morano, Menkiti Group, appeared on behalf of the application.

Mr. Morano stated that the replacement bricks are vented to provide exhaust for the units. Brick vents will measure 16.5” x 7” or 24” x 7” and will all be located on the rear elevation. There will be a maximum of 24 vents and Mr. Morano agreed to Chair Shveda’s request to try to align the bricks so that they don’t look scattered.

No public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 7-0 to close the hearing.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 7-0 that the proposed demolition of the historic building located at 6 Chatham Street is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated July 26, 2018 and received July 27, 2018.

Communications

- a. *Request for updated Letter of Support from Pinck and Co, Inc. re: Tax credit application for YWCA Central Massachusetts, 1 Salem Square – received electronically August 1, 2018.

Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Wamback, the Commission voted 7-0 to provide an updated letter of support for the YWCA Central Massachusetts, 1 Salem Square.

- b. *Request for updated Letters of Support from MHA Northeast re: Tax credit applications for:
- Paul Revere Life Insurance Company Building, 18 Chestnut Street
 - 98 Beacon Street
 - Quinsigamond Firehouse, 15 Blackstone River Road
 - Worcester Boys’ Club, 2 Ionic Ave.
 - Worcester Boys’ Club, Lincoln Square

- Swedish Lutheran Home for the Aged, 26 Harvard Street
– received electronically August 5, 2018.

Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 7-0 to provide an updated letter of support for Paul Revere Life Insurance Company Building, 18 Chestnut Street; 98 Beacon Street; Quinsigamond Firehouse, 15 Blackstone River Road; Worcester Boys' Club, 2 Ionic Ave.; Worcester Boys' Club, Lincoln Square; Swedish Lutheran Home for the Aged, 26 Harvard Street.

c. *Request for updated Letters of Support from VHB re: Tax credit applications for:

- Bancroft Hotel, 50 Franklin Street
- Houghton Building, 82 Franklin Street
- Park Building, 507 Main Street
- Worcester County Courthouse, 2 Main Street
- Cheney-Ballard Building, 517 Main Street

– received electronically August 6, 2018.

Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 7-0 to provide an updated letter of support for Bancroft Hotel, 50 Franklin Street; Houghton Building, 82 Franklin Street; Park Building, 507 Main Street; Worcester County Courthouse, 2 Main Street; Cheney-Ballard Building, 517 Main Street.

Other Business

i. Informal discussion re: window design at 25 Quinsigamond Ave.

Following approval for replacement of the windows at the August 6, 2018 meeting the applicant submitted a revised design for the new windows and requested the Commission's unofficial feedback. The Commission agreed that the new proposal more closely reflects the current mid-century design and voiced their support.

Adjournment

Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Wamback, the Commission voted 7-0 to adjourn the meeting at 9:20 p.m.