

**MINUTES OF THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE
HISTORICAL COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WORCESTER
August 29, 2013**

LEVI LINCOLN CHAMBER – CITY HALL

Commission Members Present: Timothy McCann, Chair
Kevin Provencher, Vice-Chair
Meagen Mulherin
Andrew Shveda
Karl Bjork

Commission Members Absent: Erika Dunn, Clerk

Staff Members Present: Marlyn Feliciano, Division of Planning & Regulatory Services

REGULAR MEETING (5:30 PM)

CALL TO ORDER:

Chair McCann called the meeting to order at 5:33 p.m.

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES:

The minutes for 6/27/13, 8/15/13 were held.

UNFISNISHED BUSINESS:

1. 200 Heard Street (HC-2013-035):

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver

Petitioner: City of Worcester

Present Use: Heard Street Elementary School

Year Built: Circa 1932

Historic Status: MACRIS-listed property (Massachusetts Cultural Resource Information System)

Petition Purpose: (1) Recover existing flat membrane roof with new membrane
(2) Provide additional attic ventilation and rain water drainage
(3) Replace original slate shingles with matching synthetic shingles

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: September 28, 2013

Chuck Burritt was present for this matter. He stated that, as requested by the commission, the contractor evaluated the condition of the slate and recommended that the roof needs to be replaced. The letter from the contractor stated that “My professional opinion is that the existing slate roof has lived its life expectancy and is in need of 100% replacement due to the following factors observed on 8/29/13. The existing slate has several hairline cracks, broken corners and failed sealant. The sealant repair at the slate joints may be preventing the water from existing the slate.”

Mr. Burritt stated that replacing the roof with natural slate would cost \$98,000 for the slate tiles alone but synthetic slate will cost \$56,000.

Mr. McCann stated that he believed the roof was architecturally significant so they were considering this petition under economic hardship.

Mr. Provencher asked if the slate roof is leaking and Mr. Burritt responded that it is leaking throughout that is why they had tried sealing the roof in the 90s. Mr. Provencher stated that he believed the letter and photographic evidence was enough to convince him that the roof needed to be replaced.

Upon a motion by Mr. Provencher and seconded by Mr. Shveda, the Commission voted 0-5 (all commissioners voting against) that the proposed was not detrimental to the architectural resources of the City. The motion failed.

Upon a motion by Mr. Shveda and seconded by Mr. Provencher, the Commission voted 5-0 that the denial of the petition would cause an unfair economic hardship. The motion passed and the petition was approved.

LIST OF EXHIBITS:

- Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application for 200 Heard Street; received June 27, 2013; prepared by City of Worcester School Department.
- Exhibit B: Map and Images; undated February 14, 2013.
- Exhibit C: Memorandum from the City of Worcester Division of Planning & Regulatory Services to the Worcester Historical Commission; re: 200 Heard Street – Building Demolition Delay Waiver; dated June 27, 2013.
- Exhibit D: MACRIS Form B – 200 Heard Street; WOR.2297; accessed on June 28, 2013.
- Exhibit E: Memorandum and attachments from Clark Burritt – Principal Architect/Director, Architectural Services Division, City of Worcester Department of Public Works & Parks to the Worcester Historical Commission; re: Heard Street Roof Replacement – Additional Information for Waiver Application; dated August 7, 2013.
- Exhibit F: Letter from Titan Roofing, Inc. prepared by Jon Bates; dated and received August 29, 2013.

NEW BUSINESS:

2. 25 Catherine Street (HC-2013-041):

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: South Middlesex Non-Profit Housing Corporation
Present Use: Rooming house
Year Built: Circa 1890
Historic Status: MACRIS-listed property (Massachusetts Cultural Resource Information System), National Register Individual Property (NRID) and National Register Multiple Resource Area (MRMRA), historically known as Lois Pasteur Hospital
Petition Purpose: Strip and replace porch roof shingles with GAF Lifetime Timberline Ultra HD Fox shingles

BBDW Constructive Grant Deadline: 9/13/13

Mike Comiskey, representing South Middlesex Non-Profit Housing Corporation, was present for this item. He stated that the petition was to replace the porch roof because it is leaking. Currently there are two layers of asphalt shingles on it and they just want to remove them and replace with 30 year architectural shingles.

Mr. Shveda asked if the flares on the second floor porch were once covered in shakes and Mr. Comiskey stated that he didn't know and that the building was purchased in the spring in the current condition it's in.

Mr. Provencher asked if the roof shape would be reconfigured and Mr. Comiskey stated that he would not.

Upon a motion by Mr. Provencher and seconded by Ms. Mulherin, the Commission voted to 5-0 that the demolition is not detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the City.

LIST OF EXHIBITS:

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application for 25 Catherine Street; dated July 25, 2013; received July 30, 2013.

3. 39-41 Irving Street (HC-2013-042):

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver & Certificate of Appropriateness
Petitioner: George C. Valeri
Present Use: Multi-family residential dwelling
Year Built: Circa 1888

Historic Status: MACRIS-listed property (Massachusetts Cultural Resource Information System), located in the Crown Hill Local Historic District and historically known as the George S. Clough Multi-Family House

Petition Purpose:

- Exterior masonry repairs
- Install solar array panels
- Cap the unused chimneys
- Install a parapet brace (high parapet)
- Install parapet coping (low parapets)
- Install EPDM wrapped up from roof to backside of the high parapet
- Remove, salvage, refinish and reset balcony doors
- Install balcony deck and railing system at each floor
- Remove, reframe and replace lower infill windows with panels
- Install new frame shed awning with new branding
- Remove, salvage, refit, refinish and reinstall entry doors
- Seal stone entry steps
- Remove and replace windows with TRACO/Arch Approved Equal commercial windows

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: 9/15/13

COA Constructive Grant Deadline: 9/30/13

Charbel Najem, from Capstone Construction, and architect Joseph McPhee were present for this matter. Mr. McPhee stated that this was historically a boarding house and it was fire damaged a year and a half ago. The roof collapsed and it is presently being repaired and now they are attempting to:

- Fix the parapet (by bracing it and placing a new membrane roof)
- Exterior masonry repairs (fix holes made to fight the fire and structural cracks)
- Install solar array panels on the roof
- Cap the 5 unused chimneys
- Rebuild and install balcony deck and railing system at each floor
- Remove, salvage, refinish and reset balcony doors
- Remove, reframe and replace lower infill windows with panels
- Install new frame shed awning
- Remove, salvage, refit, refinish and reinstall entry doors (left door will be repaired, right door will be rebuilt because it was too severely damaged by the fire)

- Remove and replace windows with TRACO/Arch Approved Equal commercial windows

Mr. McPhee also stated that they are applying for rehabilitating tax credits. They presented samples to the board of the aluminum clad wood windows proposed. Mr. McPhee stated that they are considering a sandalwood or dark bronze color and presented color samples to the commission. Mr. Najem stated that they will match the coping color to the color of the windows for uniformity. The commission stated they did not have an issue with either color as they were both appropriate for the district.

Mr. McPhee stated that the solar panels will be low profile and well below the parapet and will not be visible. He also stated that the balcony railings will be made of pressure treated wood with decking to match trim color.

Mr. Provencher stated that the dark bronze would make it look more like wrought iron.

Mr. McPhee stated that they will continue to use it as a boarding house once its complete. They also plan to clean the masonry after done.

Upon a motion by Mr. Shveda and seconded by Mr. Provencher, the commission voted 5-0 that the proposed work is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city.

Upon a motion by Mr. Provencher and seconded by Mr. Mulherin, the commission voted 5-0 that the proposed work is appropriate and compatible with the preservation and protection of the Crown Hill Local Historic District.

LIST OF EXHIBITS:

- Exhibit A: Certificate of Appropriateness & Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application; received August 1, 2013; prepared by Geroge C. Valeri.
- Exhibit B: Plans – Rebuild of Fire Damaged Historic Boarding House, 39 Irving Street; prepared by J. McPhee Architects, Inc.; dated June 10, 2013, revised July 10, 2013 and received August 1, 2013.
- Exhibit C: Memorandum from the City of Worcester Division of Planning & Regulatory Services to the Worcester Historical Commission; re: 39 Irving Street (MBL: 03-018-0023A); August 27, 2013.
- Exhibit D: Form B. WOR.2306 for 39 Irving Street.

4. 3 Hitchcock Road (HC-2013-043):

- Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
- Petitioner: Juana & Saturnino Rivera
- Present Use: Three-family residence
- Year Built: Circa 1911
- Historic Status: MACRIS-listed property (Massachusetts Cultural Resource Information System, historically known as the Uriah Stone Estate Area
- Petition Purpose: Complete restoration of home due to fire

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: 9/15/13

Charbel Najem, Capstone General Construction, stated that the purpose was to restore the home. It was 80% damaged during a fire that went through the walls and up the attic. The building has to be stripped to the studs both outside and inside. The entire roof rafter system has to be removed because they obtained heavy soot damage and were not up to code but the foundation is intact. The front porches will be replicated with newer materials. The columns and balusters will also be replicated in a composite material.

Mr. Shveda asked about the ornamental brackets and eaves and Mr. Najem stated that those would be replaced as well with the composite material. The house currently has architectural shingles in the roof and he plans to replace it with the same type. Mr. Najem stated that the exterior siding has sustained a lot of damage. The first floor of the property is vinyl sided but the remaining cedar shakes are cracked and peeling. They plan to do imitation cedar shakes in the front and vinyl siding on the rest of the home.

Mr. Provencher asked if the structure had lead paint. Mr. Najem stated that the building was lead positive in both the interior and the exterior. After the renovation is complete the building will be lead free.

Mr. Provencher asked about siding the property with cedar shakes and Mr. Najem stated that the owners only have the money the insurance company provided. Siding with cedar shakes will be double the cost of siding the structure alone.

The Commission also asked about window replacement and Mr. Najem stated that the windows on the house currently are all vinyl replacement windows and they will replace it with the same type but they will try to salvage the fixed windows on the stairwells.

Mr. Provencher stated that he recognized the historic value of the siding but the lead abatement cost would be an undue economic hardship.

Upon a motion by Mr. Provencher and seconded by Mr. Shveda, the commission voted 3-2 (Mr. Provencher and Mr. McCann voting no) that the proposed was not detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the city.

LIST OF EXHIBITS:

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application for 3 Hitchcock Road; dated July 29, 2013; received August 1, 2013.

5. 104 Vernon Street (HC-2013-044):

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: Mary Fierro and Monica & Adam Cohen
Present Use: Two-family home
Year Built: Circa 1880

Historic Status: MACRIS-listed property (Massachusetts Cultural Resource Information System), historically known as the George L. Robbins House

Petition Purpose: Remove existing roofing and install new architectural roofing shingles

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: 9/15/13

Adam Cohen, owner, and Paul Magdelia, contractor, were present for this matter. Mr. Cohen stated that he is looking to replace the roof. Currently there is asphalt shingles over a slate roof. The slate is destroyed as the previous contractors nailed directly through the slate. The decking does not need to be replaced. The chimneys look to be in good condition and no gutter work is proposed.

Upon a motion by Ms. Mulherin and seconded by Mr. Shveda, the commission voted 5-0 that the proposed demolition was not detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the city.

LIST OF EXHIBITS:

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application for 104 Vernon Street; received August 1, 2013.

Exhibit B: Contractor Quote prepared by John the Roofer Co. dated August 6, 2013 and received August 27, 2013.

Exhibit C: Pictures of 104 Vernon Street; received August 29, 2013.

6. 16 Alden Street (HC-2013-045):

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver

Petitioner: Margaret Middaugh

Present Use: Single family residence

Year Built: Circa 1888

Historic Status: MACRIS-listed property (Massachusetts Cultural Resource Information System), historically known as the Alvan S. Pratt House

Petition Purpose:

- Repair roof; replace asphalt shingles with similar materials
- Remove aluminum siding
- Paint unlying clapboards
- Frame windows (wood)
- Remove chimney from front left portion of residence
- Removing siding over porch

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: 9/15/13

Margaret Middaugh, owner, and Andy Howarth, Worcester Community Housing Resources, were present for this matter. Mr. Howarth stated that Ms. Middaugh received grant funds to

make exterior improvements to her property. She is looking to replace the roof, eliminate aluminum siding and restore the clapboard, trim the windows to replicate the original look, install a fixed light stairway window, and repair the back porch.

Ms. Mulherin asked about the chimney. Mr. Howarth stated that they are proposing to cap the auxiliary, non-decorative chimney to below the roofline since it's no longer in use. Ms. Mulherin, Mr. Provencher, and Mr. McCann stated this was a great project.

Upon a motion by Mr. Shveda and seconded by Ms. Mulherin, the Commission voted 5-0 that the proposed demolition is not detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the city.

LIST OF EXHIBITS:

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application for 16 Alden Street; dated July 30, 2013; received August 1, 2013.

Exhibit B: Letter from Andy Howarth of Worcester Community Housing Resources, Inc. dated and received August 29, 2013.

7. 8 Euclid Avenue (HC-2013-046):

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver

Petitioner: Viet Le

Present Use: Three-family dwelling

Year Built: Circa 1912

Historic Status: MACRIS-listed property (Massachusetts Cultural Resource Information System), NRIND (National Register District) and NRMRA (National Register Multiple Resources Area)

Petition Purpose:

- Remove chimney down to roof decking and rebuild with like material
- Install new lead to the new chimney

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: 9/20/13

Me Ai Le, representing Viet Le, stated that Mr. Le was before the commission for the roof replacement but forgot to include the chimney work on the first application so she had to return and re-apply. She stated that the chimney is falling apart; it is not capped and needs to be rebuilt. It will look the same.

Upon a motion by Mr. Shveda and seconded by Mr. Provencher, the commission voted 5-0 that the proposed demolition is not detrimental to the architectural or historical resources of the city.

LIST OF EXHIBITS:

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application for 8 Euclid Avenue; dated August 1, 2013; received August 6, 2013.

8. 20 Hawley Street (HC-2013-47):

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: Louis Abreu
Present Use: Three-family residence
Year Built: Circa 1918
Historic Status: MACRIS-listed property (Massachusetts Cultural Resource Information System), historically known as the Isadore Kumin-David Chafetz Three Decker

Petition Purpose:

- Replace portion of roof near back staircase with like materials (30 year shingles)
- Replace box cornice with like materials
- Replace fascia board with like materials

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: 9/20/13

Francisco from Francisco Roofing, Louis Abreu, owner, and Andy Howarth, Worcester Community Housing Resources, were present for this matter. Mr. Howarth stated that they needed to amend the request to include the installation of vinyl siding over the asbestos siding. Mr. McCann stated that anything that was left out of the application would need to be added to a new application and advertised before the commission could take it up. Ms. Feliciano stated that if no demolition is occurring the applicant can request a compliance certificate from the Planning and Regulatory Services office.

Mr. Howarth stated that the roof is leaking in several places. The rafters are severely deteriorated, and there are barely any soffits or fasciae remaining intact on the structure.

Upon a motion by Mr. Provencher and seconded by Mr. Shveda, the commission voted 5-0 that the proposed demolition is not detrimental to the architectural or historical resources of the city.

LIST OF EXHIBITS:

- Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application for 20 Hawley Street; dated August 2, 2013; received August 6, 2013.
- Exhibit B: Quote prepared by Francisco Roofing; dated and received August 19, 2013.
- Exhibit C: Pictures of 20 Hawley Street; received August 6, 2013.

9. 3 Meade Street (HC-2013-49):

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: V&J LLC
Present Use: Two-family residence

Year Built: Circa 1875
Historic Status: MACRIS-listed property (Massachusetts Cultural Resource Information System), historically known as the John Pilat O'Connor Stanley House

Petition Purpose:

- Replace portion of roof near back staircase with like materials (30 year shingles)
- Replace box cornice with like materials
- Strip all old roofing shingles and re-shingle with lifetime architectural shingles
- Apply aluminum drip edge on all edges of roof
- Apply ice and water shield six feet up from all edge of roof and in valleys
- Apply roofing felt paper to remainder of roof
- Re-flash all chimneys with 12" lead flashing and all brick surfaces along roof
- Re-shingle porch area with roll roofing
- Install ridge vent along roof ridge

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: 9/22/13

Mr. McCann stated that because of the large scope of the work he did not feel comfortable taking up the item without someone present to explain the project. This item was postponed to September 12, 2013 because no one was present.

LIST OF EXHIBITS:

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application for 3 Meade Street; received June 27, 2013; prepared by City of Worcester School Department.

10. 50 Water Street (HC-2013-50):

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: Bay State Investment Fund
Present Use: Two-story office and warehouse building
Year Built: Circa 1875
Historic Status: MACRIS-listed property (Massachusetts Cultural Resource Information System), historically known as the Williams Central Supply Building

Petition Purpose:

- Replace boarded up store fronts on first floor with glass
- Remove metal wrap on facade
- Replace windows with light green window
- Replace garage door with glass window

- Remove and replace rubber roof
- Install window on the second floor

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: 9/23/13

Ed Murphy, manager of Bay State Investment Fund, owner of the building, stated that they are proposing to construct 3 luxury one bedroom loft apartments on the second floor of the building. The first floor will be occupied by a real estate office. Mr. Murphy stated that they plan to eliminate the entrance from Harding Street because it has not been well maintained and is not ADA accessible. He presented the commission with the style of garage door and windows he is proposing. He also stated that the metal wrap on the façade will be removed.

Mr. Murphy stated that he will be applying again to repoint the brick on the entire building but wanted to get approved to remove the metal façade first to then account for how much work would need to be done. He stated that he wanted to add a window on the side of the building facing the parking lot. Mr. McCann stated that the creation of an opening in the masonry was not clearly stated in the legal ad and this item should be included in the next application the applicant plans to submit.

Jo Hart asked where the two egresses from the building would be located. Mr. Murphy stated one would be on Water Street and one on Pond Street.

Upon a motion by Mr. Shveda and seconded by Ms. Mulherin, the commission voted 5-0 that the proposed demolition is not detrimental to the architectural or historical resources of the city.

LIST OF EXHIBITS:

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application for 50 Water Street; dated and received August 9, 2013.

OTHER BUSINESS:

11. Communication Received:

- a. Letter from the MHC re: Worcester Regional Airport, Rectrix Fixed-Base Operator, Building, Hangar and Fuel Farm Replacement Projects. MHC #RC.1846; dated August 6, 2013 and received August 8, 2013.

The commission had no comment.

ADJOURNMENT:

Upon a motion by Ms. Mulherin the meeting was adjourned at 7:34 p.m.