

**MINUTES OF THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE
HISTORICAL COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WORCESTER
May 24, 2012**

LEVI LINCOLN CHAMBER – CITY HALL

Commission Members Present: J. Thomas Constantine, Chair
Timothy McCann, Vice-Chair
Kevin Provencher, Clerk
Peter Schneider
Meagen Mulherin
Andrew Shveda

Staff Members Present: Joel Fontane, Division of Planning & Regulatory Services
Nancy Tran, Division of Planning & Regulatory Services

REGULAR MEETING (5:30 PM)

CALL TO ORDER: 5:30

Commission Site Views:

Requests for Continuances, Postponements, Withdrawals

Approval of the Minutes: 04-05-2012, 04-19-2012, 05-03-2012

Chair Constantine asked if there were any comments or corrections.

Commissioner Provencher stated he had comment regarding item #3, 31 Heroult Road in the April 19, 2012 minutes. The second paragraph stated that Commissioner Crowley had stated that the Commissioners can require the petitioner to remove the roof and re-install the slate shingles but in the following paragraph it states that Chair McCann stated that the Commission cannot require slate replacement so there seems to be a contradiction in what the Commission was telling the petitioner.

Commissioner Provencher stated he also had a comment on Item #4 under new business, last paragraph, first sentence the Commission voted 5-1 to vote yes with Commissioner Schneider voting yes. Commissioner Crowley asked if that should be Commissioner Schneider voting no.

Chair Constantine asked Commissioner Schneider if he voted to approve that item.

Commissioner Schneider stated he believed he voted no.

Chair Constantine stated it should read then it would have been five yes votes and one no vote and asked that the correction be made.

Commissioner Provencher stated on item #7 on page 5 stated that mansard had been spelled wrong and that would need to be corrected and later on item #7 it states there was a motion by Commissioner Provencher and seconded by Commissioner Provencher. Commissioner Provencher stated he did not make the motion and second and that would need to be double checked.

Commissioner Provencher stated that last sentence last page it should state Commissioner Provencher expressed his dismay and that correction would need to be made.

Vice-Chair McCann stated that in the same paragraph it stated 31 Salisbury Street and not Lane.

Upon a motion the Commission voted 6-0 to approve the minutes as amended for April 19, 2012. The minutes for April 5, 2012 and May 3, 2012 were not approved.

New Business:

1. 2 Ionic Avenue (HC-2012-023) Building Demolition Delay Waiver

Jim Levin, owner of Whiz Kid Development, appeared on behalf of the applicant. Mr. Levin stated they are asking for building demolition delay waiver as they do not have the capacity to complete the project as they intended and they are proposing a complete demolition of the building. Mr. Levin stated they spent a year trying to find someone to come in to do a combination of affordable housing and commercial space but they have not been able to do that.

Mr. Levin stated he had appeared before the Commission before and was granted a partial demolition delay but it has become clear that due to cost they cannot complete the project. Mr. Levin stated one of the biggest problem was that there was not sufficient parking and therefore he is looking for permission to tear the building down and does understand that the City is in opposition to doing that.

Mr. Levin stated the building has been reassessed and it will cost more economically for him as there will be an \$11,000 increase in their taxes.

Vice-Chair McCann asked if Mr. Levin intended to present any economic hardship evidence tonight.

Mr. Levin stated his hope is that with the year delay he intends to search for a buyer to the property so he did not intend to provide any information on economic hardship tonight.

Chair Constantine stated he had a letter from Joel Fontane, Director of Planning & Regulatory Services (Exhibit C) stating the city's objections to tearing the building down.

Deborah Packard, Executive Director, Preservation Worcester stated she would like to be put on record as to their organization's objection to a building demolition delay and they would encourage the owner to try and find a buyer and also asked for city for assistance in helping him.

Joel Fontane stated the City is recommending denial of the complete demolition delay waiver being presented tonight as it would be detrimental to the historic and cultural resources of the city as this is a historically significant building. It was slated to be redeveloped and an additional year may allow for a new developer to come in.

William Breault, city resident, stated he was not supportive of building be torn down as he like to see development and reuse at the property.

Commissioner Schneider stated he believes the Commission needs extra time and applicant has not shown economic hardship tonight and he would be against the delay.

Jo Hart, city resident, stated she was in opposition as this is a good looking business and should be saved.

Vice-Chair McCann asked for clarification as to whether the building demolition delay waiver travels with the building or the owner.

Mr. Fontane stated it is with the property. Mr. Fontane reminded the Commission that this does not affect the partial delay that was previously approved by the Commission.

Upon a motion by Vice-Chair McCann and seconded by Commissioner Provencher, the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed application is detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the City of Worcester. The waiver request was denied.

- Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application submitted by Whiz Kids Development, LLC, dated and received April 19, 2012.
- Exhibit B: MACRIS Form B – 2 Ionic Avenue, dated 1977. Accessed from: <http://mhc-macris.net/Details.aspx?MhcId=WOR.1197>.
- Exhibit C: Memorandum from the City of Worcester Division of Planning & Regulatory Services to the Worcester Historical Commission; re: 2 Ionic Ave. Building Demolition Delay Waiver dated May 23, 2012.
- Exhibit D: Decision – Building Demolition Delay Waiver – 2 Ionic Avenue, dated July 21, 2011.
- Exhibit E: Meeting Minutes, July 21, 2011 Historical Commission meeting.

2. Montvale Road (HC-2012-024) - Certificate of Appropriateness & Building Demolition Delay Waiver

The applicant, Elizabeth & Aditya Tibrewal, were present for the hearing. Chair Constantine stated this was a request to paint the exterior of the house and garage a “western flax” color with white trim and black shutters.

Chair Constantine informed the Commission that Preservation Worcester believed the colors would be appropriate.

Chair Constantine asked for clarification as to it was also included on the agenda and the application about a building demolition delay waiver.

Mr. Fontane stated it would just be the certificate of appropriateness.

- Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application submitted by Aditya and Elizabeth Tibrewal, dated April 23, 2012 and received April 24, 2012.

3. 25 Sever Street (HC-2012-025) Building Demolition Delay Waiver

The applicants, Dianne Digiocomantonio and Mario Scardamaglia, were present to for the hearing. Mr. Scardamaglia stated they did not know the property was listed as a historical property until they went to pull a building permit. The application before the Commission is to Remove and replace the porch roof with roll roofing, install a new drip edge, and install a full ice barrier.

Commissioner Provencher asked what side of the house the roof on and if there was a gutter on the edge. Ms. Digiocomantonio replied that there was not.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Provencher and seconded by Commissioner Shveda, the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed work is not detrimental to the historic or architectural resources of the city.

- Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application submitted by Dianne Digiocomantonio, dated April 17, 2012 and received April 25, 2012.

4. 50-52 Queen Street (HC-2012-026) Building Demolition Delay Waiver

The application from Matthew 25 Inc. is to remove the existing shingled flat roof and replace it with a rubber flat roof. Mr. Burke was present to represent the applicant.

Commissioner Mulherin asked what type of shingles is currently on the roof.

Mr. Burke stated it looks like 15 year old cut tab and are the worse thing to prevent water leakage.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Schneider and seconded by Commissioner Provencher, the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed changes were not detrimental to the proposed architectural and historical resources of the city.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application submitted by Mathew 25 Inc., dated April 23, 2012 and received April 25, 2012.

5. 14 Congress Street (HC-2012-027) Building Demolition Delay Waiver

Mike Bedard and Daniel Boulain appeared on behalf of the applicant. The application before the Commission Remove the existing detached garage and replace with a metal garage of same size and in the same location. Mr. Bedard stated a tree had fallen on the shed and they were looking to replace with same size shed and only change would be the new one would have a wood front.

Upon a motion by Vice-Chair McCann and seconded by Commissioner Provencher, the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed changes were not detrimental to the proposed architectural and historical resources of the city.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application submitted by Mathew 25 Inc., dated April 23, 2012 and received April 25, 2012.

Exhibit B: Photograph example received May 24, 2012.

6. 131 Burncoat Street (HC-2012-028)

Lawrence Parks appeared on behalf of the item asking to replace some shingles. The application before the Commission is requesting remove synthetic roof shingles and replace with architectural 50-year shingles.

Vice-Chair McCann asked if the shingles he plans to put on would be wind-graded.

Mr. Parks stated they are highest graded in the industry.

Chair Constantine stated request is fairly straight forward request.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Provencher and seconded by Commissioner Shveda, the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed changes were not detrimental to the proposed architectural and historical resources of the city.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application submitted by Lawrence and Jennifer Parks, dated April 24, 2012 and received April 26, 2012.

7. 425B Salisbury Street (HC-2012-029) Building Demolition Delay Waiver

Brian Beaton on behalf of the applicant, Notre Dame Academy of Worcester, Inc. appeared to represent the applicant. The application before the Commission is to remove and replace the existing wooden entrance with like materials; to remove the existing flat roof to permit construction of the new 2nd class room; remove of the exterior concrete deck and stone foundation to allow installation of a new vertical lift.

Chair Constantine stated they would take each item one at a time and asked if anyone had any questions relative to the removal and replacing of the wooden entrance. Commissioner Schneider asked if that was the front door.

Jordan O'Connor and Amanda Normandin presented photos of what was being proposed (same images as in application submitted). Mr. O'Connor stated they are trying to create a new entry and they will need to take down a fairly small structure in order to accomplish that.

Commissioner Schneider asked if this would be visible from the public way. Mr. O'Connor stated that would correct.

Chair Constantine stated that the next request would be removing the existing flat roof and asked if that was on the picture presented.

Mr. O'Connor presented a different photograph depicting that. Mr. O'Connor stated it is existing roof in pretty poor condition and they plan replicate the material in form and color. The existing walls will remain. Mr. O'Connor stated the existing windows will remain the same size when Notre Dame purchased property replacement windows had already installed.

Mr. O'Connor also presented some floor plans of the changes that were going to be made.

Commissioner Provencher stated that the building as a whole has a masonry base and wonders if the stair replacement would replicate the masonry base. Mr. O'Connor stated instead of trying to replicate field stone they plan to continue the wall construction down with stucco to keep it tight to the ground.

Chair Constantine stated the last request in the application was to remove the exterior concrete deck and stone foundation and asked Mr. O'Connor to indicate where that would be on the photos. Mr. O'Connor showed on the photos where it was going to be located and stated it was on the west side and the deck does not appear to be original to the property.

Commissioner Provencher stated he had no concerns with the architectural solutions being proposed and he would support the project as designed.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Provencher and seconded by Vice-Chair McCann, the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed changes were not detrimental to the proposed architectural and historical resources of the city.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application submitted by Notre Dame Academy at Worcester, Inc., dated April 26, 2012 and received April 26, 2012.

8. 16 Wachusett Street (HC-2012-013) Building Demolition Delay Waiver

No one appeared for the application requesting a waiver from the building demolition delay to Wrap aluminum around the fascia of the building on the second and third floors, remove wood and detail corbels from the second and third floors and replace with soffits.

Ms. Tran reminded the Commission that they need to take action on this item. Chair Constantine asked if applicant had come to any meetings. Ms. Tran stated they had come to two meetings

Chair Constantine stated that it was unclear as to what is being proposed and due to problem with running into the constructive grant deadline the Commission needs to take action.

Commissioner Provencher stated he is inclined to deny the application.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Schneider and seconded by Vice-Chair McCann, the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed changes were detrimental to the proposed architectural and historical resources of the city. The waiver request was denied.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application submitted by Adam Gaval, dated March 8, 2012 and received March 9, 2012.

Exhibit B: Request for Continuance by Adam Gaval, dated and received April 19, 2012.

Chair Constantine stated they had received a letter from the Commonwealth of Massachusetts regarding 30 Elm Street but it was just informational.

MEETING ADJOURNMENT:

The Commission voted 5-0 to adjourn the meeting at 6:36 PM.