

**MINUTES OF THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE
HISTORICAL COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WORCESTER
April 19, 2012**

LEVI LINCOLN CHAMBER – CITY HALL

Commission Members Present: Timothy McCann, Vice-Chair
Kevin Provencher, Clerk
James Crowley
Peter Schneider
Meagen Mulherin
Andrew Shveda

Staff Members Present: Nancy Tran, Division of Planning & Regulatory Services

REGULAR MEETING (5:30 PM)

CALL TO ORDER:

Vice-Chair McCann called the meeting to order at 5:36 P.M.

MINUTES:

The Historical Commission held the minutes from the April 5, 2012 meeting.

**REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES, EXTENSIONS OF TIME, POSTPONEMENTS,
WITHDRAWALS**

UNFINISHED BUSINESS:

1. 72 (aka 66-67) Shrewsbury Street (HC-2012-004) – Building Demolition Delay Waiver

J&M Batista Family Limited Partnership, petitioner, requested that their item be held until the end of the meeting.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application submitted by J&M Batista Family, dated January 18, 2012 and received January 19, 2012.

2. 16 Wachusett Street (HC-2012-013) – Building Demolition Delay Waiver

The petitioner, Adam Gaval, requested an extension of the constructive grant deadline date of May 29, 2012 and that his item be continued to the Commission's May 24, 2012 meeting.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Schneider and seconded by Commissioner Provencher, the Commission voted 5-1 (Commissioner Crowley voted no) to extend the constructive grant deadline to May 29, 2012 and continue the item to May 24, 2012.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application submitted by Adam Gaval, dated March 8, 2012 and received March 9, 2012.

3. 31 Heroult Road (HC-2012-015) – Building Demolition Delay Waiver

Matthew Case, partner of Pickoff Properties LLC, the petitioner appeared before the Commission for 31 Heroult Road. He said he did not oversee the slate roof removal and apologized that work was done before a building permit was issued. When the petitioner discovered that the property was a Massachusetts-registered historic structure, work temporarily stopped but resumed and was completed because of an impending storm. The subcontractor also re-roofed the architectural shingles on the structure's addition without a building permit.

Commissioner Crowley clarified whether the petitioner continued work even after a cease and desist order was issued. Mr. Case said that the order was ignored. Commissioner Crowley stated that the Commission can require the petitioner to remove the present roof and re-install slate shingles. He then asked if Mr. Case brought economic hardship information to the meeting. Mr. Case brought a quote for the windows but not for the roof because it had been completed. Chair McCann said the Commission needed an estimate for the slate repair in order make an economic hardship determination.

Commissioner Schneider said the Commission made a point at the previous meeting to mitigate the historical slate roof removal through the petitioner's other building demolition delay waiver item requests. He confirmed that the petitioner still wanted to replace the structure's windows and siding with vinyl. Chair McCann said the Commission could not require slate replacement but clarified that it wanted the remaining architectural features preserved. He added that had the roof not been removed, the Commission could have considered its repair an undue economic hardship. Commissioner Crowley said the petitioner would have discovered the building was historical had a building permit been appropriately sought.

Mr. Case requested a continuance and an extension to the constructive grant deadline to prepare necessary economic hardship documents for slate roof repair.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Crowley and seconded by Commissioner Mulherin, the Commission voted 6-0 to continue the item to May 3, 2012 and extend the constructive grant deadline to May 4, 2012.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application submitted by Pickoff Properties LLC, dated February 23, 2012 and received March 9, 2012.

NEW BUSINESS:

4. 24 (aka 26-28) Mulberry Street (HC-2012-019) – Building Demolition Delay Waiver

Chris Dabek from Consigli Construction represented the petitioner, Roman Catholic Bishop of Worcester. Other representatives in attendance included Jeffrey Berthiaume of Mt. Carmel-St. Ann Church and Paul Galligan from Consigli Construction. Mr. Dabek said the petitioner was seeking Building Demolition Delay Waiver approval to make the following changes: a) Remove and replace lower metal roof with like materials; b) install a water and ice shield underneath the lower (metal) and upper (clay tile) roof; c) remove and replace copper gutters and downspouts with like materials; d) repair masonry and concrete on the north and south upper elevations.

Mr. Dabek said the petitioner would reuse present materials where possible and utilize in-kind or matching replacement materials.

Chair McCann expressed content with the proposed activities and said that the Commission cannot require the replication of original features. He added that since the petitioner would not be removing any original work, replacement with in-kind materials is acceptable.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Crowley and seconded by Commissioner Provencher, the Commission voted 5-1 (Commissioner Schneider voted no) that the a) lower metal roof removal and replacement with like materials; b) water and ice shield underneath the lower (metal) and upper (clay tile) roof installation; c) removal of copper gutters and downspouts and replacement with like materials; d) masonry and concrete repair on the north and south upper elevations would not be detrimental to the architectural or historical resources of the City of Worcester; therefore, the Building Demolition Delay Waiver was approved.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application submitted by Roman Catholic Bishop of Worcester, dated March 13, 2012 and received March 16, 2012.

5. 22 Suburban Road (HC-2012-020) – Building Demolition Delay Waiver

Kaleena Harrington, Lead Abatement Program Manager at the City of Worcester, represented the petitioner, Christopher Cain. Ms. Harrington said the petitioner sought to remove and replace 21 windows with vinyl replacements with grids matching original windows' grids for the purpose of lead abatement. She stated that the work needed to be completed to receive compliance letters from the Department of Housing and Urban Development. She said the property has an outstanding order to correct the lead and that it must be resolved.

Ms. Harrington said the owner, a licensed contractor, possesses low-moderate risk abatement certification and would reduce project costs by completing all but high-risk lead removal work. She added that off-site dipping of all high-risk windows has been considered but its cost would be too high.

Christopher Cain approached the Commission to sit with Ms. Harrington. He said he purchased the home in 2010 and that the previous owner had replaced the lower front windows with vinyl material. Commissioner Crowley asked the cost difference between window dipping and replacement. Ms. Harrington replied that she did not have exact price but estimated that it would cost \$4,000 more to dip the windows.

Commissioner Schneider stated that he had no objection with the replacement of rear windows as they would not be publicly visible. He then suggested that the front windows be delead and repaired to preserve historical features. Mr. Cain said he was amenable to dipping the three second-story front windows, and replacement of the rest.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Crowley and seconded by Commissioner Provencher, the Commission voted 4-2 (Commissioners Crowley and Schneider voted yes) that dipping the front upper three windows and replacement of the remaining 18 would not be detrimental to the architectural or historical resources of the City of Worcester; therefore, the Building Demolition Delay Waiver was approved.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application submitted by Christopher Cain, dated March 22, 2012 and received March 22, 2012.

6. 23 Watt Road (HC-2012-021) – Building Demolition Delay Waiver

The petitioner, Neil Medin, said he wanted to remove a portion of the building in the rear to allow for a proposed expansion. He said the Commission previously approved construction of a rear deck and front porch enclosure with the condition that porch lattice work be preserved. The proposed work would remove a 1950's rear protruding addition, lengthen the addition and construct a second floor. The project will maintain the structure's characteristic lines, rafter tails and utilize cement fiberboard that match original asbestos siding patterns.

Mr. Medin said the only issue was joining the addition to the structure's existing slate roof. He indicated he wanted to create a penny copper valley for the tie-in and considered the use of synthetic slate or architectural asphalt shingles. He added that, if sufficient, slate salvaged from removing the triangle overhang will be used on the addition's roof, otherwise, the slate will be reused for an eave.

Commissioner McCann asked about the color and cost of the synthetic slate. Mr. Medin said he the slate would be a mixture of colors and costs \$4 per tile. He added that the reroofing with synthetic slate would be \$8000, two times more than architectural asphalt shingles.

Mr. Medin said he was also seeking approval to remove the existing porch and reattach it when the addition is completed. Commissioner Schneider said the Commission did not have purview over it because it was not historic and original to the home.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Schneider and seconded by Commissioner Shveda, the Commission voted 6-0 that the partial removal of the rear building to allow for proposed expansion would not be detrimental to the architectural or historical resources of the City of

Worcester. The Building Demolition Delay Waiver was approved with the condition that all removed slate is salvaged, kept on site and made available to future owners.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application submitted by Neil and Carey Medin, dated March 29, 2012 and received March 29, 2012.

7. 240 Main Street (HC-2012-022) – Building Demolition Delay Waiver

Katie Krock, represented petitioner's Jane E. Krock (Trustee) application to 1) Remove and replace eleven (11) existing replacement windows on the 2nd, 3rd, and 4th floors with new replacement windows; 2) Remove and replace exterior exit doors on 1st and 2nd floors with steel doors, in similar style; 3) Remove and replace some mansard shingles where needed; 4) Repair existing gutters, patch existing stucco on a side of the building, and re-point brick where necessary. Ms. Krock said all second floor windows were aluminum and would be replaced with windows of similar look and size. In addition, boarded up windows on the third floor will have new glass installed.

Commissioner Schneider suggested finding old images to replicate the building's original look.

Ms. Krock stated that the vacant commercial building will be renovated and a small portion of an exterior stucco wall will be re-patched and repainted. Commissioner Shveda asked about the gutters. Ms. Krock said they were stolen and will be replaced.

With respect to the roof, Commissioner Schneider stated his preference for the applicant to utilize slate instead of the proposed synthetic slate. Kevin Parvin, contractor for the applicant, said he was uncertain whether the roof was slate. Commissioner McCann stated that the roof should be repaired with matching existing material, whether slate or asphalt.

Commissioner Crowley asked for clarification regarding the material and location of the exit door replacement. Ms. Krock said they will be steel and located in the rear and sides.

Susan Ceccacci from Preservation Worcester approached the Commission and offered assistance in locating old images of the building to help with restoring its original look.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Schneider and seconded by Commissioner Provencher, the Commission voted 6-0 that the 1) Removal and replacement of eleven (11) existing replacement windows on the 2nd, 3rd, and 4th floors with new replacement windows; 2) Removal and replacement of exterior exit doors on 1st and 2nd floors with steel doors, in similar style; 3) Removal and replacement of some mansard shingles where needed; 4) Repair existing gutters, patch existing stucco on a side of the building, and re-point brick where necessary would not be detrimental to the architectural or historical resources of the City of Worcester; therefore, the Building Demolition Delay Waiver was approved.

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application submitted by Janet E. Krock (Trustee) dated April 2, 2012 and received April 3, 2012.

8. Request for Letter of Support:

- 44-50 Portland Street – Printer’s Building – Mass. Historic rehabilitation tax credit application

Upon a motion by Commissioner Crowley and seconded by Commissioner Provencher, the Commission voted 6-0 to approve the Letter of Support request for 44-50 Portland Street.

9. Discussion

Commissioner Crowley expressed his dismay over the demolition of a single-family dwelling at 31 Salisbury Street. Commissioner Schneider said that had the structure been MACRIS-listed, the Commission would have jurisdiction over the property.

Ms. Ceccacci said that many historic buildings like 31 Salisbury were never surveyed and stressed the need for ongoing assessment. Commissioner Schneider agreed and stated that surveys should be performed focusing on buildings rather than districts. Commissioner Mulherin said that as a Historic Preservation intern, she researched other community and discovered that many established historic status for all buildings of a certain age such as 50-100 years old. Commissioner Crowley said 31 Salisbury should be certified historic as soon as possible.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Crowley and seconded by Commissioner Provencher, the Commission voted 6-0 to request that Joel Fontane, Director of Planning and Regulatory Services attend the Commission’s May 3, 2012 meeting to discuss Demolition Delay Waiver Ordinance.

Ms. Tran asked for economic hardship clarification on behalf of the applicant for 72 Shrewsbury Street. The Commission examined the window brought to the March 8, 2012 meeting and agreed that estimates for the proposed replicate windows and restoration are needed.

Ms. Ceccacci brought in brochures on guidance of wood window repair and replacement for the Commission to view.

10. 72 (aka 66-67) Shrewsbury Street (HC-2012-004) – Building Demolition Delay Waiver

J&M Batista Family Limited Partnership, petitioner, called and requested that their item be continued until the May 3, 2012 meeting.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Crowley and seconded by Commissioner Provencher, the Commission voted 6-0 to continue the item to May 3, 2012.

MEETING ADJOURNMENT:

Upon a motion by Commissioner McCann and seconded by Commissioner Provencher, the Commission voted 5-0 to adjourn the meeting at 7:21 PM.