

**MINUTES OF THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE
HISTORICAL COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WORCESTER**

July 24, 2008

**CHASE BUILDING, 44 FRONT STREET, WORCESTER
SUITE 300 – CONFERENCE ROOM**

Commission Members Present: Peter Schneider, Chair
Thomas Constantine, Vice-Chair
Michael Theerman
Janet Merrill
James Crowley
Timothy McCann

Staff Present: Judy Stolberg, Planning and Regulatory Services
Joel Fontane, Planning and Regulatory Services

REGULAR MEETING (5:30 PM)

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Schneider called the meeting to order at 5:30 P.M.

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

The minutes from the June 26, 2008 meeting were accepted as amended.

NEW BUSINESS

- 1. 354-360 Franklin Street (HC-2008-042) – Building Demolition Delay Waiver:**
David Clark Company is seeking a Demolition Delay Waiver to demolish a smokestack that is deteriorating. Jim Ricciardi, contractor for the project, said the chimney was abandoned two years ago. He indicated that brick and mortar are falling now and the area near the chimney has been cordoned off because of the risk to people and cars below. Chair Schneider asked if it were failing from the ground up and Mr. Ricciardi responded that it was. Chair Schneider noted that it is handsome brickwork and asked if it could be documented with pictures prior to demolition with copies to the Historical Commission and Preservation Worcester. Vincent Alinas, representative from David Clark Company, said they would provide pictures. Upon reviewing the petition submitted to demolish the smokestack and all evidence provided and upon a motion by Commissioner Crowley and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 5-0 that the proposed demolition would not be detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the City of Worcester and the Building Demolition Delay Waiver was approved. Janet Merrill was not present for this hearing.

2. **1 Lucian Street (HC-2008-043) – Building Demolition Delay Waiver:** Nghia Tran and Chi Thi Pham are seeking a Building Demolition Delay Waiver to relocate three windows on the right side of the house. The petitioners' son, Na, translated for his parents and said they are remodeling the bathrooms in the three-family dwelling and need to change the location of the windows to accommodate new bath tubs. Chair Schneider asked if the contractor was preserving the window casings and matching the stucco. The petitioners said yes. Commissioner Theerman said it would make the windows slightly asymmetrical but he had no objection. Upon reviewing the petition submitted to relocate three windows on the right side of the house and all evidence provided, and upon a motion by Commissioner Crowley and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 5-0 that the proposed demolition would not be detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the City of Worcester and the Building Demolition Delay Waiver was approved. Janet Merrill was not present for this hearing.

Janet Merrill arrived at the meeting.

3. **394 Massasoit Road (HC-2008-044) – Building Demolition Delay Waiver:** Michael Norris, representing Massasoit Road LLC, is seeking to demolish the two-story dwelling to construct a new building. He said the existing structure, constructed circa 1775-1790, is a safety hazard and cannot be restored without great expense. He said the back of the building is wide open to the elements and the entire structure has deteriorated as a result. He said the structure had been moved and was never put on a proper foundation. Chair Schneider agreed the building was in bad shape and said it was an unfortunate circumstance since it is one of the oldest in the City. Mr. Norris noted that Inspectional Services wants something done with the building because it is likely to become a safety hazard. Susan Ceccacci asked about the condition of the building inside. Mr. Norris said it was gutted on the inside and there was nothing original to the house. Ms. Ceccacci said she would like the Commission to investigate further. Barring that, she asked that a company be hired for the demolition that saves the old wood and salvages it for preservation. Commissioner Constantine opined that it is impossible to save every building and Commissioner Theerman said it was a shame to lose it but it appeared it would be impossible to save it. Chair Schneider agreed saying that it has been so changed over the years that there was not much left of the original structure. Upon reviewing the petition submitted to demolish the structure and all evidence provided, and upon a motion by Commissioner Crowley and seconded by Commissioner Constantine, the Commission voted 3-3 (Commissioners Schneider, Constantine and McCann voted yes and Commissioners Crowley, Merrill and Theerman voted no) that the proposed demolition would not be detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the City of Worcester. The motion failed and the Building Demolition Delay Waiver was denied based on its historical and architectural significance. Mr. Norris said there was really nothing of the original house left and he didn't think it could be restored because it would be cost prohibitive. Upon a motion by Commissioner Theerman and seconded by Commissioner Crowley, the Commission voted 5-1 (Commissioner Merrill voted no) that the applicant had demonstrated undue economic hardship.

Therefore, the motion passed and the Demolition Delay Waiver was granted based on hardship.

4. 23 Maywood Street (HC-2008-045) – Building Demolition Delay Waiver: Paul Bottis, representing Clark University, said they are seeking to remove and replace the roof with synthetic architectural shingles. He said two dormers were re-roofed with asphalt shingles but the main body of the roof is slate. Chair Schneider said there is confusion about the address. Mr. Fontane said the hearing has been advertised correctly and there was proper abutter notification. He indicated that for tax purposes the property is listed as 21 Maywood Street, however, there is a single-family dwelling located in the front of the property (23 Maywood Street) and another dwelling in the rear (21 Maywood Street). Chair Schneider said he thought the slate roof appeared to be in good condition and could be repaired. Mr. Bottis said the roof is leaking. He indicated that previous owners had removed the dental work from the house and covered it with siding with the result being that the roof could not breathe causing the plywood to deteriorate to the point where all new plywood is needed. He said it would cost around \$39,000.00 to remove the slate, repair the rafter tails and install new sheeting, and install new architectural shingles in a period color. He said it was just too costly to replace the roof with slate. Commissioner Constantine asked if simulated slate had been considered. Mr. Bottis responded that it was even more expensive than genuine slate and was of inferior quality. He also said that slate was labor intensive which would drive up the cost. Upon reviewing the petition submitted to remove and replace the slate roof with synthetic architectural shingles and all evidence provided, and upon a motion by Commissioner Crowley and seconded by Commissioner Constantine, the Commission voted 3-3 (Commissioners Theerman, Constantine and McCann voted yes and Commissioners Crowley, Merrill and Schneider voted no) that the proposed demolition would not be detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the City of Worcester. The motion failed and the Building Demolition Delay Waiver was denied. Upon a motion by Commissioner Crowley and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 that the applicant had demonstrated undue economic hardship. Therefore, the motion passed and the Demolition Delay Waiver was granted based on hardship.

5. 22 Catharine Street (HC-2008-046) – Building Demolition Delay Waiver: Steven Hart, representing Worcester East Side Community Development Corporation, is seeking to demolish the existing 2½-story dwelling to construct a new two-family dwelling. Commissioner Merrill asked why the CDC had purchased the property and he said the existing structure was officially condemned in 1997 and had been an eyesore and blight on the neighborhood for more than ten years. He said the CDC purchases such properties in neighborhoods to provide safe affordable homeownership opportunities for low and moderate income residents. Chair Schneider asked if there were structural damage and Mr. Hart responded that there was considerable structural damage in the rear of the building and the roof has caved in. Commissioner Constantine noted that the back up information noted the structure had been under a demolition order for eleven years. Commissioner Merrill asked if there would be separate ownership of the two units and Mr. Hart said one person

would own both units and would occupy one unit and rent the second unit. Upon reviewing the petition submitted to demolish the structure and all evidence provided, and upon a motion by Commissioner Constantine and seconded by Merrill, the Commission voted 1-5 (Commissioner Constantine voted yes and Commissioners Schneider, Crowley, Merrill, Theerman and McCann voted no) that the proposed demolition would not be detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the City of Worcester. The motion failed and the Building Demolition Delay Waiver was denied. Chair Schneider asked Mr. Hart to provide a cost comparison for rehabilitation and demolition and new construction to give the Commission an idea of the balance of the costs. Commissioner Crowley asked how much it would cost for an estimate of rehab costs. Mr. Hart said it would be around \$10,000.00. Commissioner Crowley asked Mr. Hart to provide a rough number the Commission can work with. Commission Theerman asked if the Commission could go inside the building. Mr. Hart said that could be arranged. Mr. Fontane noted that it would have to be posted as a meeting if four or more members attended the tour. The Commission agreed to tour the building at 5:00 P.M. on Thursday, July 31, 2008. Mr. Hart asked for a continuance to August 14, 2008 in order to gather the requested information the Commission requested relative to economic hardship. Upon a motion by Commissioner Theerman and seconded by Commissioner Crowley, the Commission voted 6-0 to continue the hearing to August 14, 2008.

6. **9 Goulding Street (HC-2008-047) – Building Demolition Delay Waiver:** James Girouard, stated he is seeking to enclose the second and third floor porches, repair the roof and match the color of the existing vinyl siding. Chair Schneider asked what would happen to the brackets and gable. Mr. Girouard said they will remain as they are. Upon reviewing the petition submitted to enclose the second and third floor porches, repair the roof and match the color of the existing vinyl siding and all evidence provided, and upon a motion by Commissioner Crowley and seconded by Commissioner Constantine, the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed demolition would not be detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the City of Worcester and the Building Demolition Delay Waiver was approved.
7. **3 Goulding Street (HC-2008-048) – Building Demolition Delay Waiver:** James Girouard, stated he is seeking to repair sections of the roof with like materials; repair siding with like materials; remove and rebuild the porch to the same style and size utilizing like materials; and remove and replace soffit with like materials. Upon reviewing the petition submitted to repair sections of the roof with like materials; repair siding with like materials; remove and rebuild the porch to the same style and size utilizing like materials; and remove and replace soffit with like materials and all evidence provided, and upon a motion by Commissioner Crowley and seconded by Commissioner Constantine, the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed demolition would not be detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the City of Worcester and the Building Demolition Delay Waiver was approved.
8. **190 Salisbury Street (HC-2008-049) – Certificate of Appropriateness:** Building Demolition Delay Waiver was taken contemporaneously. Attorney Robert Longden

summarized briefly what had transpired over the past year that finally resulted in the American Antiquarian Society, petitioner, reaching consensus with neighbors resulting in the project proposal submitted to the Commission. The proposal includes the conversion of 9 Regent Street into housing for scholars and 190 Salisbury Street into office space with an addition to connect the two buildings, he said. Mr. Longden indicated an easement has been obtained from Mary Lambert, owner of 90 Park Avenue, to provide access from Park Avenue to the parking area. Daniel Benoit, architect for the project, provided details of the plan including pervious paving, lighting, trees, landscaping and other construction specifics. Commissioner Constantine asked if trees would be removed. Mr. Benoit answered that scrubby pines on the site will be removed and replaced with American Beech and Sugar Maples. Commissioner Constantine then asked what kind of lighting would be used. Mr. Benoit said low post decorative lighting commonly used for residential areas that would not spill over onto abutting properties would be utilized. Chair Schneider asked if the lighting would be left on all night. Mr. Benoit said they could be timed to turn off and on. He also said foot lighting would be used on walkways. Mr. Fontane said the lighting would be carefully reviewed by the Planning Board during site plan review. Commissioner Crowley asked about the windows and which will be repaired and which will be replaced. Mr. Benoit said they would be all wood double-hung, double-pane thermal windows (historic simulated divided lite). He continued that no determination had been made to date as to which will be repaired and which will be replaced. Commissioner Crowley indicated that he would need to see some sort of definitive plan for the windows. He suggested that the petitioner should come back when they have such a plan. Commissioner Theerman said it was a good architectural plan for adaptive re-use of a building that will never be used as a single-family home again. Commissioner Constantine agreed saying they are maintaining the integrity of the original building and matching the addition well. Susan Ceccacci offered her opinion that, given the quality of the building, she would like to see the petitioners use fieldstone on the proposed retaining wall on the west side of the Salisbury Street driveway. Mr. Benoit said they would propose that a simulated fieldstone product on the retaining wall and a wrought iron fence to be used to maintain the historic character. Commissioner Crowley asked what the view of the lot from Montvale Avenue would be. Mr. Benoit said it would remain the same as it is presently. Commissioner Crowley then asked about the view from Park Avenue. Mr. Benoit said the trees will provide a natural screen. Commissioner Crowley acknowledged that the neighbors have seen the plan and Mr. Benoit had made a presentation to the neighbors. He said they were comfortable with this plan. Kevin Quinn, engineer for the project, submitted a revised plan dated July 23, 2008 that addressed the issues raised by the Division of Planning and Regulatory Services in Edgar Luna's memo dated July 18, 2008 except for his recommendation that the fence be made of wood materials. The Commission agreed with the applicant's proposal for a wrought iron fence. Upon a motion by Commissioner Theerman and seconded by Commissioner Constantine, the Commission voted 6-0 to determine that the proposed exterior work as specified below is appropriate and compatible with the preservation and protection of the local historic district as it relates to the historic and

architectural value and significance of the site, building, and structure and approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for the following:

- (1) Renovate portions of the Goddard-Daniels House and construct an accessible addition connecting the Goddard-Daniels House to the Carriage house
- (2) Replace asphalt shingles with architectural shingles
- (3) Install windows

Upon reviewing the petition submitted to renovate portions of the Goddard-Daniels House and construct an accessible addition connecting the Goddard-Daniels House to the Carriage house, replace asphalt shingles with architectural shingles and install windows and all evidence provided, and upon a motion by Commissioner Crowley and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed demolition would not be detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the City of Worcester and the Building Demolition Delay Waiver was approved with the following condition:

- That all alterations of the building and grounds are to be in accordance with the revised plan and elevations dated July 23, 2008, prepared by Quinn Engineering.

9. 190 Salisbury Street (HC-2008-051) – Building Demolition Delay Waiver: See number 8 above.

10. 9 Regent Street (HC-2008-050) – Certificate of Appropriateness: Daniel Benoit, architect for the project, said the American Antiquarian Society seeks to do the following: (1) renovate the house and restore the majority of it to its original architectures; (2) demolish the existing garage; (3) restore the front entry and laundry room; (4) remove second floor porch in rear; (5) remove exterior siding and replace with all cedar shingle siding; (6) remove asphalt shingle roof and replace with new architectural shingle roofing; and (7) install new windows. He said the intention is to provide a residence for 6-8 scholars. Chair Schneider indicated that the Commission prefers that windows repaired rather than replaced when the building is located within a Local Historic District. Susan Ceccacci asked if a window survey had been done and Mr. Benoit said not yet. Commissioner Crowley said this petitioner should be held to the same standard as any other applicant. He said the Commission has made other applicants repair windows rather than approving window replacement. Mr. Fontane suggested a continuance in order to allow the petitioner time to conduct a window survey quickly and, if not, then the applicant could amend any approval at a later date. Mr. Benoit said he had no idea how long it would take because he was not aware of scheduling conflicts a company that does surveys would have. Attorney Longden requested approval of the other work and said they would file an amendment when they have the information regarding the windows. Kevin Quinn, engineer for the project, submitted a revised plan dated July 23, 2008 that addressed the issues raised by Edgar Luna in his memo dated July 18, 2008. Upon a motion by

Commissioner Theerman and seconded by Commissioner Constantine, the Commission voted 6-0 to determine that the proposed exterior work as specified below is appropriate and compatible with the preservation and protection of the local historic district as it relates to the historic and architectural value and significance of the site, building, and structure and approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for the following noting the exclusion of the proposed window changes:

- (1) Renovate the house and restore the majority of it to its original architecture;
- (2) Demolish the existing garage;
- (3) Restore the front entry and laundry room;
- (4) Remove second floor porch in rear;
- (5) Remove exterior siding and replace with all cedar shingle siding;
- (6) Remove asphalt shingle roof and replace with new architectural shingle roofing;

Upon reviewing the petition submitted to renovate the house and restore the majority of it to its original architectures; demolish the existing garage; restore the front entry and laundry room; remove second floor porch in rear; remove exterior siding and replace with all cedar shingle siding; remove asphalt shingle roof and replace with new architectural shingle roofing and all evidence provided, and upon a motion by Commissioner Crowley and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed demolition would not be detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the City of Worcester and the Building Demolition Delay Waiver was approved, except the repair and replacement of windows, with the following condition:

- That all alterations of the building and grounds are to be in accordance with the revised plan and elevations dated July 23, 2008, prepared by Quinn Engineering.

11. 9 Regent Street (HC-2008-052) – Building Demolition Delay Waiver: See number 10 above.

OTHER BUSINESS

Chair Schneider adjourned the meeting at 7:45 P.M.