

Regulation of the Worcester Board of Health Restricting the Sale of Tobacco Products

A. Statement of Purpose:

Whereas there exists conclusive evidence that tobacco smoking causes cancer, respiratory and cardiac diseases, negative birth outcomes, irritations to the eyes, nose and throat¹;

Whereas the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services has concluded that nicotine is as addictive as cocaine or heroin² and the Surgeon General found that nicotine exposure during adolescence, a critical window for brain development, may have lasting adverse consequences for brain development,³ and that it is addiction to nicotine that keeps youth smoking past adolescence.⁴

Whereas a Federal District Court found that Phillip Morris, RJ Reynolds and other leading cigarette manufacturers “spent billions of dollars every year on their marketing activities in order to encourage young people to try and then continue purchasing their cigarette products in order to provide the replacement smokers they need to survive” and that these companies were likely to continue targeting underage smokers⁵;

Whereas more than 80 percent of all adult smokers begin smoking before the age of 18, more than 90 percent do so before leaving their teens, and more than 3.5 million middle and high school students smoke;⁶

Whereas 18.1 percent of current smokers aged <18 years reported that they *usually* directly purchased their cigarettes from stores (i.e. convenience store, supermarket, or discount store) or gas stations, and among 11th grade males this rate was nearly 30 percent;⁷

Whereas the Institute of Medicine (IOM) concludes that raising the minimum age of legal access to tobacco products to 21 will likely reduce tobacco initiation, particularly among adolescents 15 – 17, which would improve health across the lifespan and save lives⁸.

Whereas cigars and cigarillos can be sold in a single “dose;” enjoy a relatively low tax as compared to cigarettes; are available in fruit, candy and alcohol flavors; and are popular among youth⁹;

Whereas research shows that increased cigar prices significantly decreased the probability of male adolescent cigar use and a 10% increase in cigar prices would reduce use by 3.4%¹⁰;

¹ Center for Disease Control and Prevention, (CDC) (2012), *Health Effects of Cigarette Smoking Fact Sheet*. Retrieved from: http://www.cdc.gov/tobacco/data_statistics/fact_sheets/health_effects/effects_cig_smoking/index.htm.

² CDC (2010), *How Tobacco Smoke Causes Disease: The Biology and Behavioral Basis for Smoking-Attributable Disease*. Retrieved from: http://www.cdc.gov/tobacco/data_statistics/sgr/2010/.

³ U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. 2014. *The Health Consequences of Smoking – 50 Years of Progress: A Report of the Surgeon General*. Atlanta: U.S. National Center for Chronic Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, Office on Smoking and Health, p. 122. Retrieved from: <http://www.surgeongeneral.gov/library/reports/50-years-of-progress/full-report.pdf>.

⁴ *Id.* at Executive Summary p. 13. Retrieved from: <http://www.surgeongeneral.gov/library/reports/50-years-of-progress/exec-summary.pdf>

⁵ *United States v. Phillip Morris, Inc., RJ Reynolds Tobacco Co., et al.*, 449 F.Supp.2d 1 (D.D.C. 2006) at Par. 3301 and Pp. 1605-07.

⁶ SAMHSA, Calculated based on data in 2011 National Survey on Drug Use and Health and U. S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHA).

⁷ CDC (2013) Youth Risk Behavior, Surveillance Summaries (MMWR 2014: 63 (No SS-04)). Retrieved from: www.cdc.gov.

⁸ IOM (Institute of Medicine) 2015. *Public Health Implications of Raising the Minimum Age of Legal Access to Tobacco Products*. Washington DC: The National Academies Press, 2015.

⁹ CDC (2009), *Youth Risk Behavior, Surveillance Summaries* (MMWR 2010: 59, 12, note 5). Retrieved from: <http://www.cdc.gov/mmwr/pdf/ss/ss5905.pdf>.

¹⁰ Ringel, J., Wasserman, J., & Andreyeva, T. (2005) *Effects of Public Policy on Adolescents' Cigar Use: Evidence from the National Youth Tobacco Survey*. American Journal of Public Health, 95(6), 995-998, doi: 10.2105/AJPH.2003.030411 and cited in *Cigar*,

Whereas 59% of high school smokers in Massachusetts have tried flavor cigarettes or flavored cigars and 25.6% of them are current flavored tobacco product users; 95.1 % of 12 – 17 year olds who smoked cigars reported smoking cigar brands that were flavored;¹¹

Whereas the Surgeon General found that exposure to tobacco marketing in stores and price discounting increase youth smoking;¹²

Whereas the federal Family Smoking Prevention and Tobacco Control Act (FSPTCA), enacted in 2009, prohibited candy- and fruit-flavored cigarettes,¹³ largely because these flavored products were marketed to youth and young adults,¹⁴ and younger smokers were more likely to have tried these products than older smokers¹⁵, neither federal nor Massachusetts laws restrict sales of flavored non-cigarette tobacco products, such as cigars, cigarillos, smokeless tobacco, hookah tobacco, and electronic devices and the nicotine solutions used in these devices;

Whereas the U.S. Food and Drug Administration and the U.S. Surgeon General have stated that flavored tobacco products are considered to be “starter” products that help establish smoking habits that can lead to long-term addiction;¹⁶

Whereas the U.S. Surgeon General recognized in his 2014 report that a complementary strategy to assist in eradicating tobacco related death and disease is for local governments to ban categories of products from retail sale;¹⁷

Whereas the U.S. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention has reported that the current use of electronic cigarettes, a product sold in dozens of flavors that appeal to youth, among middle and high school students tripled from 2013 to 2014;¹⁸

Cigarillo and Little Cigar Use among Canadian Youth: Are We Underestimating the Magnitude of this Problem?, J. Prim. P. 2011, Aug; 32(3-4):161-70. Retrieved from: www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/21809109.

¹¹ Massachusetts Department of Public Health, 2015 Massachusetts Youth Health Survey (MYHS); Delneve CD et al., *Tob Control*, March 2014: Preference for flavored cigar brands among youth, young adults and adults in the USA.

¹² U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. 2012. *Preventing Tobacco Use Among Youth and Young Adults: A Report of the Surgeon General*. Atlanta: U.S. National Center for Chronic Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, Office on Smoking and Health, p. 508-530, www.surgeongeneral.gov/library/reports/preventing-youth-tobacco-use/full-report.pdf.

¹³ 21 U.S.C. § 387g.

¹⁴ Carpenter CM, Wayne GF, Pauly JL, et al. 2005. “New Cigarette Brands with Flavors that Appeal to Youth: Tobacco Marketing Strategies.” *Health Affairs*. 24(6): 1601–1610; Lewis M and Wackowski O. 2006. “Dealing with an Innovative Industry: A Look at Flavored Cigarettes Promoted by Mainstream Brands.” *American Journal of Public Health*. 96(2): 244–251; Connolly GN. 2004. “Sweet and Spicy Flavours: New Brands for Minorities and Youth.” *Tobacco Control*. 13(3): 211–212; U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. 2012. *Preventing Tobacco Use Among Youth and Young Adults: A Report of the Surgeon General*. Atlanta: U.S. National Center for Chronic Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, Office on Smoking and Health, p. 537, www.surgeongeneral.gov/library/reports/preventing-youth-tobacco-use/full-report.pdf.

¹⁵ U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. 2012. *Preventing Tobacco Use Among Youth and Young Adults: A Report of the Surgeon General*. Atlanta: U.S. National Center for Chronic Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, Office on Smoking and Health, p. 539, www.surgeongeneral.gov/library/reports/preventing-youth-tobacco-use/full-report.pdf.

¹⁶ Food and Drug Administration. 2011. *Fact Sheet: Flavored Tobacco Products*, www.fda.gov/downloads/TobaccoProducts/ProtectingKidsfromTobacco/FlavoredTobacco/UCM183214.pdf; U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. 2012. *Preventing Tobacco Use Among Youth and Young Adults: A Report of the Surgeon General*. Atlanta: U.S. National Center for Chronic Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, Office on Smoking and Health, p. 539, www.surgeongeneral.gov/library/reports/preventing-youth-tobacco-use/full-report.pdf.

¹⁷ See fn. 3 at p. 85.

¹⁸ Centers for Disease Control & Prevention. 2015. “Tobacco Use Among Middle and High School Students — United States, 2011–2014,” *Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report (MMWR)* 64(14): 381–385;

Whereas 5.8% of Massachusetts youth currently use e-cigarettes and 15.9% have tried them;¹⁹

Whereas the Massachusetts Department of Environmental Protection has classified liquid nicotine in any amount as an “acutely hazardous waste”;²⁰

Whereas in a lab analysis conducted by the FDA, electronic cigarette cartridges that were labeled as containing no nicotine actually had low levels of nicotine present in all cartridges tested, except for one²¹;

Whereas according to the CDC’s youth risk behavior surveillance system, the percentage of high school students in Massachusetts who reported the use of cigars within the past 30 days is 10.8% in 2013;²²

Whereas data from the National Youth Tobacco Survey indicate that more than two-fifths of U.S. middle and high school smokers report using flavored little cigars or flavored cigarettes;²³

Whereas the sale of tobacco products is incompatible with the mission of health care institutions because these products are detrimental to the public health and their presence in health care institutions undermine efforts to educate patients on the safe and effective use of medication, including cessation medication;

Whereas educational institutions sell tobacco products to a younger population, who is particularly at risk for becoming smokers and such sale of tobacco products is incompatible with the mission of educational institutions that educate a younger population about social, environmental and health risks and harms;

Whereas the Massachusetts Supreme Judicial Court has held that “. . . [t]he right to engage in business must yield to the paramount right of government to protect the public health by any rational means”²⁴.

Now, therefore it is the intention of the Worcester Board of Health to regulate the sale of tobacco products.

B. Authority:

This regulation is promulgated pursuant to the authority granted to the Worcester Board of Health by Massachusetts General Laws Chapter 111, Section 31 which states "Boards of health may make reasonable health regulations".

C. Definitions:

For the purpose of this regulation, the following words shall have the following meanings:

¹⁹ Massachusetts Department of Public Health, 2015 Massachusetts Youth Health Survey (MYHS)

²⁰ 310 CMR 30.136

²¹ Food and Drug Administration, *Summary of Results: Laboratory Analysis of Electronic Cigarettes Conducted by FDA*, available at: <http://www.fda.gov/newsevents/publichealthfocus/ucm173146.htm>.

²² See fn. 7.

²³ King BA, Tynan MA, Dube SR, et al. 2013. “Flavored-Little-Cigar and Flavored-Cigarette Use Among U.S. Middle and High School Students.” *Journal of Adolescent Health*. [Article in press], www.jahonline.org/article/S1054-139X%2813%2900415-1/abstract.

²⁴ Druzik et al v. Board of Health of Haverhill, 324 Mass.129 (1949).

Adult-only retail tobacco store: An establishment that is not required to possess a retail food permit whose primary purpose is to sell or offer for sale but not for resale, tobacco products and tobacco paraphernalia, in which the sale of other products is merely incidental, and in which the entry of persons under the minimum legal sales age is prohibited at all times, and maintains a valid permit for the retail sale of tobacco products as required to be issued by the Worcester Board of Health.

Business Agent: An individual who has been designated by the owner or operator of any establishment to be the manager or otherwise in charge of said establishment.

Characterizing flavor: A distinguishable taste or aroma, other than the taste or aroma of tobacco, menthol, mint or wintergreen, imparted or detectable either prior to or during consumption of a tobacco product or component part thereof, including, but not limited to, tastes or aromas relating to any fruit, chocolate, vanilla, honey, candy, cocoa, dessert, alcoholic beverage, herb or spice; provided, however, that no tobacco product shall be determined to have a characterizing flavor solely because of the provision of ingredient information or the use of additives or flavorings that do not contribute to the distinguishable taste or aroma of the product.

Cigar: Any roll of tobacco that is wrapped in leaf tobacco or in any substance containing tobacco with or without a tip or mouthpiece not otherwise defined as a cigarette under Massachusetts General Law, Chapter 64C, Section 1, Paragraph 1.

Component part: Any element of a tobacco product, including, but not limited to, the tobacco, filter and paper, but not including any constituent.

Constituent: Any ingredient, substance, chemical or compound, other than tobacco, water or reconstituted tobacco sheet, that is added by the manufacturer to a tobacco product during the processing, manufacturing or packaging of the tobacco product. Such term shall include a smoke constituent.

Coupon: Any card, paper, note, form, statement, ticket or other issue distributed for commercial or promotional purposes to be later surrendered by the bearer so as to receive an article, service or accommodation without charge or at a discount price.

Distinguishable: Perceivable by either the sense of smell or taste.

Employee: Any individual who performs services for an employer.

Employer: Any individual, partnership, association, corporation, trust or other organized group of individuals that uses the services of one (1) or more employees.

Flavored tobacco product: Any tobacco product or component part thereof that contains a constituent that has or produces a characterizing flavor. A public statement, claim or indicia made or disseminated by the manufacturer of a tobacco product, or by any person authorized or permitted by the manufacturer to make or disseminate public statements concerning such tobacco product, that such tobacco product has or produces a characterizing flavor shall constitute presumptive evidence that the tobacco product is a flavored tobacco product.

Liquid Nicotine Container: A bottle or other vessel which contains nicotine in liquid or gel form, whether or not combined with another substance or substances, for use in a tobacco product, as defined herein. The term

does not include a container containing nicotine in a cartridge that is sold, marketed, or intended for use in a tobacco product, as defined herein, if the cartridge is prefilled and sealed by the manufacturer and not intended to be open by the consumer or retailer.

Listed or non-discounted price: The higher of the price listed for a tobacco product on its package or the price listed on any related shelving, posting, advertising or display at the place where the tobacco product is sold or offered for sale plus all applicable taxes if such taxes are not included in the state price, and before the application of any discounts or coupons.

Minimum Legal Sales Age (MLSA): The age an individual must be before that individual can be sold a tobacco product in the municipality.

Permit Holder: Any person engaged in the sale or distribution of tobacco products who applies for and receives a tobacco product sales permit or any person who is required to apply for a Tobacco Product Sales Permit pursuant to these regulations, or his or her business agent.

Person: Any individual, firm, partnership, association, corporation, company or organization of any kind, including but not limited to, an owner, operator, manager, proprietor or person in charge of any establishment, business or retail store.

Schools: Public or private elementary or secondary schools.

Smoke Constituent: Any chemical or chemical compound in mainstream or sidestream tobacco smoke that either transfers from any component of the tobacco product to the smoke or that is formed by the combustion or heating of tobacco, additives or other component of the tobacco product.

Smoking Bar: An establishment that occupies exclusively an enclosed indoor space and that is primarily engaged in the retail sale of tobacco products for consumption by customers on the premises; derives revenue from the sale of food, alcohol or other beverages that is incidental to the sale of tobacco products; prohibits entry to a person under the minimum legal sales age in Worcester during the time when the establishment is open for business; prohibits any food or beverage not sold directly by the business to be consumed on the premises; maintains a valid permit for the retail sales of tobacco products issues by the Worcester Board of Health and, where required by Mass. General Law Ch. 270, §22, maintains a valid permit to operate a smoking bar issued by the Massachusetts Department of Revenue. "Smoking bar" shall include, but not be limited to, those establishments that are commonly known as "cigar bars", "hookah bars", "vape bars" or "vape lounges".

Tobacco Product: Any product containing, made, or derived from tobacco or nicotine that is intended for human consumption, whether smoked, chewed, absorbed, dissolved, inhaled, snorted, sniffed, or ingested by any other means, including, but not limited to: cigarettes, cigars, little cigars, chewing tobacco, pipe tobacco, snuff; or electronic cigarettes, electronic cigars, electronic pipes, electronic hookah, liquid nicotine, "e-liquids" or other similar products, regardless of nicotine content, that rely on vaporization or aerosolization. "Tobacco product" includes any component or part of a tobacco product. "Tobacco product" does not include any product that has been approved by the United States Food and Drug Administration either as a tobacco use cessation product or for other medical purposes and which is being marketed and sold or prescribed solely for the approved purpose.

D. Tobacco Sales to Persons Under the Minimum Legal Sales Age Prohibited:

1. No person shall sell tobacco products or permit tobacco products, as defined herein, to be sold to a person under the minimum legal sales age; or not being the individual's parent or legal guardian, give tobacco products, as defined herein, to a person under the minimum legal sales age. The minimum legal sales age in Worcester is 21.

2. Required Signage:

- a. In conformance with and in addition to Massachusetts General Law, Chapter 270, Section 7, a copy of Massachusetts General Laws, Chapter 270, Section 6, shall be posted conspicuously by the owner or other person in charge thereof in the shop or other place used to sell tobacco products at retail. The notice shall be provided by the Massachusetts Department of Public Health and made available from the Worcester Board of Health. The notice shall be at least 48 square inches and shall be posted conspicuously by the permit holder in the retail establishment or other place in such a manner so that it may be readily seen by a person standing at or approaching the cash register. The notice shall directly face the purchaser and shall not be obstructed from view or placed at a height of less than 4 feet or greater than 9 feet from the floor. The owner or other person in charge of a shop or other place used to sell tobacco products at retail shall conspicuously post any additional signs required by the Massachusetts Department of Public Health. The owner or other person in charge of a shop or other place used to sell hand rolled cigars must display a warning about cigar consumption in a sign at least 50 square inches pursuant to 940 CMR 22.06 (2) (e).
- b. The owner or other person in charge of a shop or other place used to sell tobacco products, as defined herein, at retail shall conspicuously post signage provided by the Worcester Board of Health that discloses current referral information about smoking cessation.
- c. The owner or other person in charge of a shop or other place used to sell tobacco products that rely on vaporization or aerosolization, as defined herein as "tobacco products", at retail shall conspicuously post a sign stating that "The sale of tobacco products, including e-cigarettes, to someone under the minimum legal sales age of 21 is prohibited." The notice shall be no smaller than 8.5 inches by 11 inches and shall be posted conspicuously in the retail establishment or other place in such a manner so that it may be readily seen by a person standing at or approaching the cash register. The notice shall directly face the purchaser and shall not be obstructed from view or placed at a height of less than four (4) feet or greater than nine (9) feet from the floor.

3. Identification: Each person selling or distributing tobacco products, as defined herein, shall verify the age of the purchaser by means of a valid government-issued photographic identification containing the bearer's date of birth that the purchaser is 21 years old or older. Verification is required for any person under the age of 27.

4. All retail sales of tobacco products, as defined herein, must be face-to-face between the seller and the buyer and occur at the permitted location.

E. Tobacco Product Sales Permit:

1. No person shall sell or otherwise distribute tobacco products, as defined herein, within the City of Worcester without first obtaining a Tobacco Product Sales Permit issued annually by the Worcester Board of Health. Only

owners of establishments with a permanent, non-mobile location in Worcester are eligible to apply for a permit and sell tobacco products, as defined herein, at the specified location in Worcester.

2. As part of the Tobacco Product Sales Permit application process, the applicant will be provided with the Worcester regulation. Each applicant is required to sign a statement declaring that the applicant has read said regulation and that the applicant is responsible for instructing any and all employees who will be responsible for tobacco product sales regarding federal, state and local laws regarding the sale of tobacco and this regulation.
3. Each applicant who sells tobacco products is required to provide proof of a current Tobacco Retailer License issued by the Massachusetts Department of Revenue, when required by state law, before a Tobacco Product Sales Permit can be issued.
4. A separate permit, displayed conspicuously, is required for each retail establishment selling tobacco products, as defined herein. The fee for which shall be determined by the Worcester Board of Health annually.
5. A Tobacco Product Sales Permit is non-transferable. A new owner of an establishment that sells tobacco products, as defined herein must apply for a new permit. No new permit will be issued unless and until all outstanding penalties incurred by the previous permit holder are satisfied in full.
6. Issuance of a Tobacco Product Sales Permit shall be conditioned on an applicant's consent to unannounced, periodic inspections of his/her retail establishment to ensure compliance with this regulation.
7. A Tobacco Product Sales Permit will not be renewed if the permit holder has failed to pay all fines issued and the time period to appeal the fines has expired and/or the permit holder has not satisfied any outstanding permit suspensions.
8. A Tobacco Product Sales Permit will not be renewed if the permit holder has sold a tobacco product to a person under the MLSA (§D.1) three times within the previous permit year and the time period to appeal has expired. The violator may request a hearing in accordance with subsection 4 of the Violations section.

F. Violations:

1. It shall be the responsibility of the establishment, permit holder and/or his or her business agent to ensure compliance with all sections of this regulation. The violator shall receive:
 - a. In the case of a first violation, a fine of one hundred dollars (\$300.00).
 - b. In the case of a second violation within 24 months of the date of the current violation, a fine of three hundred dollars (\$300.00) and the Tobacco Product Sales Permit shall be suspended for seven (7) consecutive business days.
 - c. In the case of three or more violations within a 24 month period, a fine of three hundred dollars (\$300.00) and the Tobacco Product Sales Permit shall be suspended for thirty (30) consecutive business days.
 - d. In the case of four violations or repeated, egregious violations of this regulation within a 24month period, the Board of Health shall hold a hearing in accordance with subsection 4 of this section and may permanently revoke a Tobacco Product Sales Permit.

2. Refusal to cooperate with inspections pursuant to this regulation shall result in the suspension of the Tobacco Product Sales Permit for thirty (30) consecutive business days.

3. In addition to the monetary fines set above, any permit holder who engages in the sale or distribution of tobacco products while his or her permit is suspended shall be subject to the suspension of all Board of Health issued permits for thirty (30) consecutive business days.

4. The Worcester Board of Health shall provide notice of the intent to suspend or revoke a Tobacco Product Sales Permit, which notice shall contain the reasons therefor and establish a time and date for a hearing which date shall be no earlier than seven (7) days after the date of said notice. The permit holder or its business agent shall have an opportunity to be heard at such hearing and shall be notified of the Board of Health's decision and the reasons therefor in writing. After a hearing, the Worcester Board of Health shall suspend or revoke the Tobacco Product Sales Permit if the Board of Health finds that a violation of this regulation occurred. For purposes of such suspensions or revocations, the Board shall make the determination notwithstanding any separate criminal or non-criminal proceedings brought in court hereunder or under the Massachusetts General Laws for the same offense. All tobacco products, as defined herein, shall be removed from the retail establishment upon suspension or revocation of the Tobacco Product Sales Permit. Failure to remove all tobacco products, as defined herein, shall constitute a separate violation of this regulation.

G. Non-Criminal Disposition:

Whoever violates any provision of this regulation may be penalized by the non-criminal method of disposition as provided in Massachusetts General Laws, Chapter 40, Section 21D or by filing a criminal complaint at the appropriate venue.

H. **Separate Violations:** Each day any violation exists shall be deemed to be a separate offense.

I. Enforcement:

Enforcement of this regulation shall be by the Worcester Board of Health or its designated agent(s).

Any resident who desires to register a complaint pursuant to the regulation may do so by contacting the Worcester Board of Health or its designated agent(s) and the Board shall investigate.

J. Severability:

If any provision of this regulation is declared invalid or unenforceable, the other provisions shall not be affected thereby but shall continue in full force and effect.

K. Effective Date:

This regulation shall take effect on September 1, 2016.

Jerry H. Smith, MD

A. R. De

J. De

(June 9, 2016)

