MINUTES OF THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE HISTORICAL COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WORCESTER

October 1, 2015

LEVI LINCOLN CHAMBER - CITY HALL

Commission Members Present: Andrew Shveda, Vice-Chair

Timothy McCann, Clerk

Robyn Conroy Randolph Bloom Devon Kurtz

Cheryll Holley, Alternate

Commission Members Absent: Kevin Provencher, Chair

Karl Bjork, Alternate

Staff Members Present: Stephen Rolle, Division of Planning & Regulatory Services

Marlyn Feliciano, Division of Planning & Regulatory Services

Approval of the Minutes: 8/6/2015 & 9/17/15

Upon a motion by Mr. Shveda and seconded by Mr. McCann, the Board voted 6-0 to hold the minutes to another meeting.

Andrew Shveda was chairing the meeting.

OLD BUSINESS

1. 660 Main Street (HC-2015-065)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver

Petitioner: Community Renewal, Inc.

Present Use: Multi-Unit apartment building

Year Built: Circa 1897

Historic Status: MACRIS-listed, NRIND (National Register Individual Property,

NRMRA (National Register Multiple Resource Area) fka Hotel

Aurora

Petition Purpose: Replace curved double hung windows with non-curved fixed

windows

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: October 16, 2015

Zan Bross from The Community Builders, Inc. appeared on behalf of the application.

Mr. Shveda stated that at the last meeting the commission asked Mr. Bross to look at the cost analysis of double hung windows at the center of the bays.

Mr. Bross stated that the commission stated concern with putting aluminum windows next to the wood double hung in the center. He stated that they analyzed the cost for the wood option and confirmed that they can get the product and that it will fit into their budget. They are proposing to replace the entire front façade with wood window replicating what is there. Everything from the second floor up will be historically accurate. The other elevations will be aluminum historically accurate windows.

Mr. Shveda stated that will make for a better project.

Mr. Bross asked if they reserve the right to do the previously approved elevations in wood if they can make the project fit their budget.

Mr. Rolle stated that the decision was written in such a way that it allows for either aluminum or wood as long as the mutton patterns are replicated.

Mr. Shveda stated that only Vice-Chair Shveda, Secretary McCann, Commissioners Conroy, and Kurtz can vote on this item.

Jo Hart, Worcester resident, stated that she was pleased with the results.

Upon a motion by Mr. McCann and seconded by Ms. Conroy, the Commission voted 4-0 to approve the replacement of the wood windows on the front façade with wood windows that replicate the mutton pattern.

Exhibit A: Application for Building Demolition Delay Waiver received August 3, 2015 and

dated August 3, 2015

Exhibit B: Continuation form, received electronically September 11, 2015 and dated

September 11, 2015.

NEW BUSINESS

2. 58 May Street (HC-2015-070)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver

Petitioner: Sinh Le & Van Vu
Present Use: Two Family residence

Year Built: 1870

Historic Status: MACRIS-listed-formerly fka Rufus Dodge House

Petition Purpose:

• Repair roof with like material

• Repair siding with like material

• Repair awning with like material

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: October 17, 2015

Trang Le, representing her father, Sinh Le, was present on behalf of the application.

Ms. Le stated that the property's exterior needs repair, which is why they want to replace the existing wood siding and repaint. Also, the roof needs to be replaced and the awnings, which are the hip roofs over the porch and the back door as well.

Vice-Chair Shveda stated that it is odd to have siding on the mansard roof portion and asked if it was an original feature of the building since that would normally be covered in shingles.

Ms. Le stated that she didn't know but everything would be the same materials as what is currently on the property.

Secretary McCann stated that he had no concerns about the petition since it was in kind replacement for roof and repair.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Bloom and seconded by Commissioner Kurtz, the commission voted 4-0 that the proposed demolition is not detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the city.

Exhibit A: Application for Building Demolition Delay Waiver received September 2, 2015 and dated September 1, 2015.

3. 139 Vernon Street (HC-2015-071)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver

Petitioner: Lenis Figueredo

Present Use: Three Family residence

Year Built: 1916

Historic Status: MACRIS-listed-formerly fka Martin Tunney House

Petition Purpose:

- Install new siding
- Install new vinyl windows
- Close off the open first floor back porch
- Close off the door opening on the second floor
- Resize two windows on the third floor in the back of the house
- Close off bathroom windows on the side of the house

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: October 17, 2015

Lenis Aguila stated that his mother owns the property. It is a three family house and most of the work proposed is to the back of the house. They want to enclose two porches and close off the windows for the bathroom that are located on the side of the house.

Secretary McCann stated that the property is on a corner lot (Vernon St and Alcott St) and the work on the back of the house is still visible from a public way.

Mr. Aguila stated that in the front of the house there was a door on the third floor, not second, and that he was looking to close it off because it led to the roof of the second floor porch and he wants to resize two windows (make them shorter and wider). He stated that a lot of the wood windows are deteriorated and need to be replaced and lastly they need to install new siding.

Vice-Chair Shveda asked how many windows would be replaced. Mr. Aguila stated that there are 53 windows, but he wants to eliminate the three bathroom ones.

Commissioner Bloom asked why they wanted to close off those windows and the applicant stated that it allowed them to reconfigure the bathrooms and make them more efficient.

Secretary McCann asked if code allowed closing off the windows in the bathroom. Mr. Aguila stated that they do as long as you have exhaust.

Vice-Chair Shveda asked if the windows were original and what was he plan for the decorative panel above them. Mr. Aguila stated that they are original and they do not plan to replace the decorative panels as they are separate from the windows and can remain.

Vice-Chair Shveda asked if the roof was slate and how they plan to apply the siding. Mr. Aguila stated that it's a slate look alike but it's plastic and they plan to install the vinyl siding over the existing one but will match the existing profiles. They want vinyl siding due to the ease of maintenance.

Vice-Chair Shveda asked how the eaves, rake boards, brackets, and soffits will be treated. Mr. Aguila stated that they will all remain and they will be painted.

Secretary McCann asked how the corner boards and trim detail on the first floor will be treated. Mr. Aguila stated that they will try to recreate it in vinyl.

Vice-Chair Shveda asked if the applicant looked at the cost of repainting the siding rather than replacing it with vinyl.

Mr. Aguila stated that he did not. The vinyl will cost \$30,000 and will be easier to maintain. He already has the contractor and the dormers will be sided as well. He is not opposed to look at the cost of repainting instead to make a better decision. He can come back with a quote.

Commissioner Bloom stated that this was a striking Victorian house in original shape and if vinyl-sided it will alter the original appearance. Vice-Chair Shveda stated that original materials can raise the property value.

Commissioner Bloom asked how many windows were in poor shape. Mr. Aguila stated that about 70% and he brought in several contractors and they all agreed they weren't worth saving.

Secretary McCann asked if the applicant was willing to contemplate keeping the front façade in wood, either repairing what's there or replacing in kind. Mr. Aguila stated that he will look into the option.

Commissioner Bloom asked why the applicant plans to enclose the porches and how. Mr. Aguila stated that they will be covered with the same materials as what would be on the outside. The 1st floor porch will be a laundry room and the second floor will be storage because he doesn't like giving tenants access to the basement.

Mr. Aguila stated that he would like to continue the item to get the requested information to the Commission.

Vice-Chair Shveda stated that the applicant was going to come back with a quote to repaint/repair siding vs. vinyl replacement. A quote to repair/replace in kind the front façade windows; look at placement of the laundry room and storage in the basement or elsewhere inside the property.

Upon a motion by Secretary McCann and seconded by Commissioner Conroy, the commission voted 6-0 to continue the item to October 29, 2015.

Exhibit A: Application for Building Demolition Delay Waiver received September 2, 2015

and dated September 2, 2015.

Exhibit B: Window Replacement Quote prepared by A-1 Wholesale Window Co, Inc. dated

September 14, 2015 and received September 15, 2015.

4. 141 Providence Street (HC-2015-069)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver

Petitioner: South Middlesex Non-Profit Non Housing

Present Use: Multi Family residence

Year Built: 1926

Historic Status: MACRIS-listed, NRD (National Register District), NRMRA

(National Register Multiple Resource Area) and fka John Johnson

Three-decker

Petition Purpose:

 Remove existing siding and replace with vinyl shake and horizontal siding

- Wrap all windows and doors with white aluminum
- Replace basement windows with similar style

BDDW Constructive Grant Deadline: October 15, 2015

Aurelien Alphe, Project Manager for South Middlesex Non-Profit Housing (SMOC), stated that SMOC bought the building in 2013 and would like to replace the siding with vinyl while mimicking the existing profiles.

Vice-Chair Shveda asked if they were going to be able to match the impressions on the siding on the first floor because they are really deep. Mr. Alphe stated that they will match it with the 6.5" impression that is the deepest available from CertainTeed.

Vice-Chair Shveda asked if the applicant looked at painting rather than replacing with vinyl. Mr. Alphe stated that they did not because they are a non-profit and they are using grants to cost the project. One of which comes from St. Gobain but the grant specified that they have to use their products for vinyl and insulation. St. Gobain owns CertainTeed and they provided the grant that supplies all the materials. The other grant comes from the Fletcher Foundation, which will give grant funds for labor for weatherization.

Vice-Chair Shveda asked how they will treat the eaves, brackets, square columns, hand rails on porches, etc. Mr. Alphe stated that they will not be touched as they will stop the vinyl where the current wooden trim ends. He stated that they also wanted to wrap the windows and doors in aluminum.

Secretary McCann asked how the corner boards and trim detail on the first floor will be treated. Mr. Alphe stated that they will be replicated in vinyl.

Commissioner Bloom stated that if they maintain the horizontal trims then the project might work.

Secretary McCann stated that he was concerned with matching the red color in vinyl since it is prone to fading. He stated that the applicant could change the color choices as long as the applicant chose contrasting colors for the first floor and the upper floors.

Mr. Alphe stated that he had no objections to changing the color. He only chose the proposed ones because he thought he needed to match the existing colors.

Vice-Chair Shveda stated that the applicant stated that they will maintain the window casings and sills, the horizontal trim pieces, the trim on the façade, molding on the eaves, etc.

Mr. Alphe stated that they will remove the current siding and then install the vinyl. He also stated that he will not wrap the windows and doors and will instead repaint them.

Secretary McCann asked if there was lead they had to deal with. Mr. Alphe stated that there were no children on the property since it was a recovery lodging house for males. Also, he stated that they weren't sure if they would replace the 10 existing vinyl basement windows but asked the commission to vote on it just in case.

Upon a motion by Mr. McCann and seconded by Ms. Conroy, the commission voted 6-0 that the proposed removal of the existing siding and replacement with vinyl shake and horizontal siding and replacement of the vinyl basement windows with similar style was not detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the city as long as the porches, columns, railings, fascia, and soffits remained intact.

Exhibit A: Application for Building Demolition Delay Waiver received August 30, 2015 and dated August 30, 2015.

OTHER BUSINESS

5. Preservation Plan Update

Mr. Rolle stated that the Request for Proposal for the Historic Preservationist had closed and there was only one applicant. Staff is reviewing it now and will meet with the selection committee to determine if the contract will be awarded to them.

6. Letter from Department of Army, re: City of Worcester Elm Park Project; dated September 8, 2015 and received September 16, 2015.

Vice-Chair Shveda stated that this was just an informational item but they seemed to be missing pages from it and asked staff to put it on the next agenda and resend the communication so they can review it thoroughly.

7. Letter from EBI Consulting, re: 35 Hamilton Street; dated September 8, 2015 and received September 10, 2015.

Vice-Chair Shveda stated that this was just communication on cell tower replacement at 35 Hamilton Street. The commission had no comment.

8. Letter from Massachusetts Historical Commission; re: Worcester Common WWII Memorial Fountain; dated September 4, 2015 and received September 4, 2015. – No Comment

ADJOURNMENT

Upon a motion the commission voted to adjourn at 6:56 p.m.