

**MINUTES OF THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE  
HISTORICAL COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WORCESTER**

**August 30, 2018**

**LEVI LINCOLN CHAMBER – CITY HALL**

**Commission Members Present:** Andrew Shveda  
Randolph Bloom  
Devon Kurtz  
Diane Long  
Janet Theerman  
Mark Wamback

**Commission Members Absent:** Robyn Conroy  
Courtney Ross Escobar, Alternate  
Tomi Stefani, Alternate

**Staff Members Present:** Susan Arena, Division of Planning & Regulatory Services  
Stephen Rolle, Division of Planning & Regulatory Services

**Call Commission to Order**

The meeting was called to order by Chair Shveda at 5:30 pm.

**Approval of Minutes**

Review of the August 2, 2018 minutes.

*Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Theerman the Commission voted 3-0 to approve the minutes of August 2, 2018.*

**Insubstantial Change to Prior Approval**

- i. 144 Pleasant Street – Change in garage door style

The owners of the property were approved at the August 2, 2018 meeting to replace a damaged wood garage door with a metal, paneled door with windows across the top row. Following the approval they requested to change the design to eliminate the windows.

*Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 5-1 (Chair Shveda voting against) that the change is insubstantial.*

**Old Business**

**1. 85 Granite Street – HC-2018-050 (MBL CO-NDO-02051)**

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver  
Petitioner: Min Jiang, Catherine Manning & George Dargan, and Francisca Goldsmith  
Present Use: Condominium building  
Year Built: c1918  
Historic Status: MACRIS listed  
Petition Purpose:

- Replace the front porches

Francisca Goldsmith and Cathy Manning, owners of two of the units, appeared on behalf of the application.

The applicants returned with three quotes from contractors. For historically accurate reconstruction, the quote was provided in 2015, so taking inflation into account was estimated at \$58,000. The other two, which allowed for the use of pressure treated lumber with open railings and minimal ornamental woodwork, were for \$14,500 and \$13,900. The applicants stated that they are on fixed incomes and would not be able to afford the high quote, but they emphasized their desire incorporate some historic detailing. Ms. Manning stated that they'd like to salvage decorative pieces of the existing columns and reuse them if possible.

*Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Wamback, the Commission voted 6-0 to close the hearing.*

*Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Kurtz the Commission voted 0-5 that the proposed demolition of the historic building located at 85 Granite Street is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to **deny** the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.*

*Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 5-0 that the historical accurate reconstruction of the porches at 85 Granite Street would pose an undue economic hardship and voted to **approve** the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.*

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application undated and received July 13, 2018.

## **2. 31 Louise Street – HC-2018-052 (MBL 10-005-00020)**

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver  
 Petitioner: Adnan Termos  
 Present Use: Three-family residence  
 Year Built: c1916  
 Historic Status: MACRIS listed, and National Register listed, fka the John and Edward Johnson Three-Decker

Petition Purpose:

- Demolish front three-story porch and rebuild first floor only
- Install vinyl siding

*Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 to continue the item to the September 13, 2018 meeting.*

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated July 16, 2018 and received July 16, 2018.

Exhibit B: Request to continue form, dated August 29, 2018.

## **3. 47 West Street – HC-2018-057 (MBL 01-028-00102)**

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver  
 Petitioner: Mansour Gaval  
 Present Use: Multi-family residence

Year Built: c1880  
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, and National Register listed, fka the Abbie and Emily Williams House

Petition Purpose:

- Install vinyl siding (partially retroactive)
- Remove/replace windows (partially retroactive)
- Repair/replace front porch
- Repair roof

Mansour Gaval, owner, appeared on behalf of the application.

The Commission expressed concern and dismay about the amount of work that was completed without approval or a building permit. Commissioner Bloom emphasized how important the process is so that situations like this can be avoided.

Mr. Gaval stated that the front porch is pulling away from the house by 6” and is not safe, but agreed to reconstruct it to match the existing design including retention of the column arrangement and curved brackets. He stated concern about lead paint and would like to wrap the columns in thin plastic, but agreed to attempt to strip and repaint the columns first. The railing design will be replicated, but raised to meeting building code. He also agreed to reinstall six of the windows that had been covered by vinyl siding, three on the bay window and three on the street facing side of the sunporch. The Commission noted the importance of the paneled trim around the windows and the transoms over the sunporch windows. Mr. Gaval agreed to mimic the trim in plastic, but not reinstall the transoms.

Mr. Gaval stated that the transom window over the front door still exists and was just covered up. He agreed to reveal and restore that element. For the vinyl siding to continue Mr. Gaval agreed to using flat vinyl trim pieces over the existing horizontal banding to retain the Stick Style effect of the wood siding. Lastly, it was agreed that the portion of the roof that is currently slate will be reshingled in asphalt to match the sections that were already replaced. Commissioner Theerman emphasized that the terms are a compromise and that ideally all the work should be undone.

No public comment.

*Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Wamback, the Commission voted 6-0 to close the hearing.*

*Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman the Commission voted 4-1 (Commissioner Theerman voting against) that the proposed and previous demolition of the historic building located at 47 West Street is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver provided that the following conditions are met:*

- *Reinstall three windows on the bay window with trim to mimic original design*
- *Reinstall three windows across the street facing side of the sun porch with trim to mimic original design*
- *Rebuild front porch to replicate current design using a mix of wood and composite materials, with railing height to adhere to building code*
- *Restore transom window over the front door*
- *Replace the remaining slate portion of the roof with asphalt to match existing asphalt*
- *Install vinyl siding across the remaining elevations, using flat banding on the front to mimic the existing architectural detailing*

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated July 23, 2018 and received July 26, 2018.

Exhibit B: Request to Continue form, dated August 16, 2018.

---

### **New Business**

#### **4. 203 Pleasant Street – HC-2018-060 (MBL 10-005-00020)**

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver & Certificate of Appropriateness  
Petitioner: Pierre Gelinas  
Present Use: Mixed-use building  
Year Built: 1918  
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, and located within the Crown Hill Local Historic District, fka The Westland  
Petition Purpose:

- Install new storefront sign

Pierre Gelinas, Signs by Design, appeared on behalf of the application.

Mr. Gelinas stated that his client is redoing the space, which is currently vacant, into a hair salon. He stated that it will be a 1'8" by 8' aluminum, LED illuminated sign. There is existing plywood across the area that will be reinforced and the sign mounted to it.

No public comment.

*Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 to close the hearing.*

*Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed demolition of the historic building located at 203 Pleasant Street is not detrimental to the historical and architectural resources of the city and voted to approve the Building Demolition Delay Waiver.*

*Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed changes at 203 Pleasant Street are appropriate to the Crown Hill Local Historic District, and approved the Certificate of Appropriateness.*

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated July 9, 2018 and received August 2 2018.

---

#### **5. 22 Whitman Road – HC-2018-061 (MBL 20-006-0006)**

Petition: Certificate of Appropriateness  
Petitioner: Susan Whittemore  
Present Use: Single-family residence  
Year Built: c1914  
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, and National Register listed, and located within the Montvale Local Historic District, fka the Edwin Seward House  
Petition Purpose:

- Remove underground tank and repave driveway

Susan Whittemore, owner, appeared on behalf of the application.

Ms. Whittemore stated that she recently discovered that there is a defunct oil tank located underneath her driveway and the ground is beginning to dip where the tank is. The current driveway surface, which is concrete, is cracked and failing and has been patched with asphalt in areas. She would like to redo the driveway using concrete, but doesn't have quotes yet and is concerned the price will be too high, in which case she'd like to use asphalt.

No public comment.

*Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 to close the hearing.*

*Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed change at 22 Whitman Road, consisting of the resurfacing of the driveway with asphalt or concrete, is appropriate to the Montvale Local Historic District, and approved the Certificate of Appropriateness.*

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated August 2, 2018 and received August 3, 2018.

---

## **6. 80 Chatham Street – HC-2018-062 (MBL 03-026-0030A)**

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver & Certificate of Appropriateness  
Petitioner: Michael Miller  
Present Use: Multi-family residence  
Year Built: 1879  
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, and located within the Crown Hill Local Historic District, fka the Amasa Ballou Tenant House

### Petition Purpose:

- Replace vinyl siding in-kind
- Replace asphalt and slate roof

Michael Miller, owner, and Tim Wormer, On Top Contracting, appeared on behalf of the application.

Mr. Wormer stated that the scope of work has diminished since the application was submitted. The upper part of the roof that is currently asphalt will be replaced in kind, but they've decided to retain the slate along the lower portion of the mansard. They'd also like to replace the vinyl siding in kind in a similar color. Ms. Arena asked about the lower edge of the roof where it appeared slate was missing and flashing is visible. Mr. Wormer replied that they've thought about that and would like to make it consistent throughout the house by making the flashing visible, which would also free up slate for repairs in other areas.

They'd like to repaint the trim in a similar burgundy color and paint the flashing to match. For the siding they'd like to stay with a pale grey similar to the existing color.

No public comment.

*Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 to close the hearing.*

*Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed changes at 80 Chatham Street, consisting of repainting trim and flashing to match the existing color and replace the vinyl siding with a color in the same tonal range at the existing*

*light bluish grey, are appropriate to the Crown Hill Local Historic District, and approved the Certificate of Appropriateness.*

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated July 31, 2018 and received August 8, 2018.

---

**7. 190 Salisbury Street – HC-2018-063 (MBL 20-007-00013)**

Petition: Certificate of Appropriateness  
Petitioner: National Grid  
Present Use: Museum/office building  
Year Built: 1905  
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, National Register listed, and located within the Montvale Local Historic District, fka the Harry Goddard House

Petition Purpose:

- Install a pad mounted generator, switchgear, and bollards, and complete related site work for electrical service

Andrew Cariglia, American Antiquarian Society, and Andrew Cardoza, National Grid, appeared on behalf of the application.

Mr. Cardoza stated that in order to upgrade the electrical service to the neighborhood it is necessary to install a switchgear on the lawn near the Park Ave edge of the property and a transformer on the south side of the parking lot partially hidden by existing vegetation. Both elements are required by National Grid standards to be surrounded by concrete bollards for safety. The standard color of these is yellow; staff and Mr. Cariglia requested that they be painted green instead. The Commission concurred that this would be preferred. Another National Grid representative approached the table and stated that they can do green, which all parties agreed to.

Chair Shveda asked for clarification that wherever hardscape is encountered by trenching they will tunnel underneath the element. If any walkways are disrupted they will be relaid to match. Mr. Cariglia confirmed that this was correct.

No public comment.

*Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 to close the hearing.*

*Upon a motion by Commissioner Wambach and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed changes at 190 Salisbury Street are appropriate to the Montvale Local Historic District, and approved the Certificate of Appropriateness.*

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated July 27, 2018 and received August 8, 2018.

---

**8. 75 Chatham (aka 18 Crown) Street – HC-2018-064 (MBL 03-024-00020)**

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver & Certificate of Appropriateness  
Petitioner: Michael Kline  
Present Use: Multi-family residence  
Year Built: c1850  
Historic Status: MACRIS listed, National Register listed, and located within the Crown Hill Local Historic District, fka the Martin Stowe – Thomas B Eaton House

Petition Purpose:

- Replace asphalt and slate roof (partially retroactive)

Michael Kline, owner, Justin Raphaelson, attorney, Journey Oliveira and Tai Cheng, contractors, appeared on behalf of the application.

Mr. Oliveira stated that the error was his fault because the owner told him the house was historic. He stated that they applied for a building permit but submitted it under the wrong address, using 18 Crown Street instead of 75 Chatham Street, since the property goes by two identifiers. Ms. Arena stated that according to her conversation with Inspectional Services no permit application was received until August 13, several days after the stop work order was issued.

Mr. Kline stated that the roof had been leaking and was getting continually worse and he just wanted to replace it. His attorney stated that there have been significant issues with leaking, and damage to the tenant space directly below the roof. Chair Shveda asked how long Mr. Kline has owned the property, to which he replied, about 10 years. According to the owner and contractors portions of the roof were asphalt and the remaining portions were slate.

Chair Shveda read into the record a letter submitted by an abutter, stating that to the best of his knowledge the roof has always been slate.

Mr. Raphaelson stated that none of this work was done with malice and there is a safety issue at hand. He also stated that there is a hardship should the owner be forced to replace the entire roof with slate. Chair Shveda stated that the question at hand is whether the Commission would have approved the removal of the roof had the proper procedure been followed. Since work has already occurred it makes for a more difficult assessment since they have no knowledge of the condition of the slate prior to demolition. Without documentation Chair Shveda said they'd have to assume the roof was serviceable and could have been repaired.

Mr. Raphaelson stated that when a tenant's space is made uninhabitable it constitutes an emergency. Mr. Kline added that after the last storm there was so much damage that he had to pay for a new mattress for his tenant. Chair Shveda responded that the applicant has already stated that the leaking has been going on for several years. Commissioner Wambach added that this has been a cumulative problem that could have been addressed sooner and using the proper process.

Mr. Oliveira stated that they'd like to replace the entire roof using asphalt shingles, but did not have product information or sample available. Chair Shveda asked what the contract amount was for this proposal. The contractors replied, approximately \$14,000. Commissioner Long asked what percentage of the roof was still slate and during the last storm, did the leaks occur more where the slate was or where the asphalt was. Mr. Kline replied that it was about 50%. Mr. Cheng replied that the leaks were more in the areas where there was slate, that the roof had been patched several times.

In order to make a judgement based on hardship and appropriateness regarding the replacement of the roof the Commission requested that the applicants return with at least three quotes, one each for slate, synthetic slate, and asphalt. Samples, including color, would be welcome as well. Chair Shveda noted that a product that closely resembles slate in size, pattern, and color would be more appropriate. Commissioner Long asked if they had any pieces of the slate that was removed. They replied yes and the Commission suggested they bring a piece for comparison.

No public comment.

*Upon a motion by Commissioner Wamback and seconded by Commissioner Theerman, the Commission voted 6-0 to continue the item to the September 13, 2018 meeting.*

Exhibit A: Building Demolition Delay Waiver Application dated August 8, 2018 and received August 13, 2018.

Exhibit B: Letter submitted by Gerald Scher dated August 26, 2018 and received August 27, 2018.

---

### **Communications**

- a. \*Request for CLG Opinion from VHB re: J.R. Torrey Razor and Strop Company, 126 and 128 Chandler Street – received via phone August 8, 2018.

*Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Kurtz, the Commission voted 6-0 to concur with the opinion of staff and find 126 and 128 Chandler Street eligible for the National Register of Historic Places.*

- b. Communication from CBRE re: Section 106 Public Outreach for 100 Front Street – dated August 15, 2018 and received August 16, 2018.

*No comment.*

- c. Communication from MHC re: Patch Reservoir Dam Rehabilitation – dated August 16, 2018 and received August 20, 2018.

*No comment.*

- d. Communication from Nover-Armstrong Associates Inc. re: Notice of Project Change, Worcester Biomanufacturing Campus – dated August 17, 2018 and received August 20, 2018.

*No comment.*

- e. \*Request for updated Letter of Support from VHB re: Tax credit application for Indian Hill School, 155 Ararat Street – received electronically August 8, 2018.

*Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Wamback, the Commission voted 6-0 to provide an updated letter of support for Indian Hill School, 155 Ararat Street.*

### **Adjournment**

Upon a motion by Chair Shveda and seconded by Commissioner Wamback, the Commission voted 6-0 to adjourn the meeting at 8:35p.m.