

**MINUTES OF THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE
HISTORICAL COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WORCESTER**

April 30, 2015

LEVI LINCOLN CHAMBER – CITY HALL

Commission Members Present: Kevin Provencher, Chair
Andrew Shveda, Vice-Chair
Timothy McCann, Clerk
Randolph Bloom
Robyn Conroy
Karl Bjork

Commission Members Absent: None

Staff Members Present: Deborah Steele, Division of Planning & Regulatory Services

Approval of the Minutes: 4/16/2015 - Held

OLD BUSINESS

1. 5-7 Ashland Street (HC-2015-00)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver & Certificate of Appropriateness
Petitioner: Bullard Properties
Present Use: Multi Family Building
Year Built: Circa 1872
Historic Status: MACRIS-listed, NRDIS (National Register District),
NRMRA (National Register Multiple Resource Area)
and located in the Crown Hill Local Historic District.
Petition Purpose: Retroactive approval to replace front step railings and
supporting pillars

Attorney Jonathan Finkelstein and Clealand Blair appeared on behalf of the item.

Mr. Blair stated that his architect will do an exact replica of what was there prior but the only exception is he would like to make the railings out of plastic as it is much easier to bend.

Mr. Blair stated that the baluster will remain the same size and will be wood and be exact as before.

Chair Provencher stated that he would not have issue would that.

Chair Provencher asked about the turnings that support the canopy over the stairs and other version which is sort of a half post which is applied to the face of the building and showed on photo area he was talking about and asked if Mr. Blair if he would do custom turnings to match the original profile. Mr. Blair stated he would.

The Commission expressed their appreciation that the applicant had taken the time to do the project right.

Upon a motion by Secretary McCann and seconded by Vice-Chair Shveda, the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed Building Demolition Delay Waiver is not detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the City. The motion passed and the Building Demolition Delay Waiver petition was approved.

Upon a motion by Secretary McCann and seconded by Vice-Chair Shveda, the Commission voted 6-0 that the petition was appropriate for the district. The motion passed and the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved.

Exhibit A: Application for Building Demolition Delay Waiver & Certificate of Appropriateness received December 23, 2014 and dated December 23, 2014

Exhibit B: Request to postpone form dated February 26, 2015 and received February 26, 2015.

Exhibit C: Request to continue form dated April 8, 2015 and received April 8, 2015.

2. 12 Freeland Street (HC-2015-015)

Petition:	Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner:	City of Worcester
Present Use:	School Building
Year Built:	1885
Historic Status:	MACRIS-listed, NRIND (National Register Individual District), NRMRA (National Register Multiple Resource Area)
Petition Purpose:	Installation of a fume hood vent with a double wall stainless steel pipe chimney running up the back exterior wall of the science lab, through the overhanging soffit and extending to a point about the roofline

Carl Burwick from the City of Worcester appeared on behalf of the item.

Mr. Burwick stated that this was for the University Park School and they went back and

looked at the options and they have found it is very feasible to use the unused air shaft that is part of the existing chimney which would conceal it entirely inside and they have worked with their engineers on best way to do it and the only thing visible will be the weather cap and they will paint it to minimize the appearance of it.

Commissioner Bloom stated that he was pleased with the changes.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Conroy and seconded by Vice-Chair Shveda, the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed Building Demolition Delay Waiver is not detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the City. The motion passed and the Building Demolition Delay Waiver petition was approved.

Exhibit A: Application for Building Demolition Delay Waiver received February 23, 2015 and dated February 23, 2015.

Exhibit B: Request to postpone form dated March 31, 2015 and received March 31, 2015.

3. 155 Ararat Street (HC-2015-021)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: White Picket Fence LLC
Present Use: School Building
Year Built: Circa 1925
Historic Status: MACRIS-listed, fka Indian Hill Schoolhouse
Petition Purpose:

- New roof on the rear of the building
- New gable roof ends will be installed on the sides and rear of building
- Skylights will be installed in sloped sections of roof

Daniel Stroe, Barry Ganett and Walter Barnard appeared on behalf of the application.

Mr. Ganett stated that they have come before Commission with alternate proposal for the skylight and Mr. Ganett provided a sample skylight and on the roofing submission provided elevations and renderings and stated that they have reduced the number of skylights by half by using a single larger skylight and overall the glass is reduced by 30% and makes the roof look much more solid.

Chair Provencher stated that this was a successful result and Commission is happy with the changes.

Commissioner Bloom asked if the cost data for the difference between asphalt shingles and restoring and repairing shingles had been provided.

Mr. Barnard stated that he felt it would be uneconomical to remove all slate.

Chair Provencher asked what would be the budget for the asphalt shingles. Mr. Stroe stated \$56,000.

Vice-Chair Shveda stated then 22% of the cost of project would be roofing.

Commissioner Bloom stated that it is now easier to make a decision as opposed to the last meeting.

Upon a motion by Secretary McCann and seconded by Vice-Chair Shveda, the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed work relative to proposed construction of a new roof and construction of skylights in roof would not be detrimental to the historical or architectural heritage or resources of the City of Worcester. The motion passed and the Building Demolition Delay Waiver petition was approved.

Upon a motion by Secretary McCann and seconded by Vice-Chair Shveda, the Commission voted 0-6 that the proposed removal of slate would be detrimental to the historical or architectural heritage or resources of the City of Worcester. The motion failed and the Commission considered economic hardship.

Upon a motion by Secretary McCann and seconded by Vice-Chair Shveda, the Commission found that the issuance of a demolition approval is necessary to avoid an undue economic hardship to the property owner and approved the Building Demolition Delay Waiver 6-0 for the removal of the slate.

Exhibit A: Application for Building Demolition Delay Waiver received March 25, 2015 and dated March 19, 2015.

NEW BUSINESS

4. 3 Decatur Street (HC-2015-024)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: Stephen Rapa
Present Use: Three Family residence
Year Built: Circa 1926
Historic Status: MACRIS-listed, fka Frank K. Gallagher Three Decker
Petition Purpose:

- Repair fascia wrap
- Remove two layers of shingles and install new estate gray asphalt shingles

Stephen Rapa along with his son appeared on behalf of the application.

Mr. Rapa stated that he would like to repair the fascia and remove two layers of shingles and install new asphalt shingles. He stated that the roof line is hard to see from the street.

Chair Provencher asked if the fascia was damaged. Mr. Rapa stated it was rotted.

Chair Provencher asked how would it be repaired. Mr. Rapa stated that it would be wrapped.

Chair Provencher stated that there is a nice bracket underneath the curve of the roof and asked if that would be wrapped as well. Mr. Rapa stated that he was not sure what the contractor planned to do but believed it would be wrapped or enclosed but wasn't sure.

Chair Provencher stated that is a distinct feature of the house and would not support removal and typically they would not support removal of those details and understands Mr. Rapa needs to repair roof and control the cost of doing that and what they typically do is impose a restriction on removal the brackets and asked the Commission consider that when they vote on item.

Commissioner Bloom asked if that by wrapping will it jeopardize the condition.

Vice-Chair Shveda stated it would be vented but problem if covered is you can't tell condition of the brackets.

Commissioner Bloom stated that it will still alter the appearance of the house. Chair Provencher stated that no historic material is being removed.

Upon a motion by Secretary McCann and seconded by Vice-Chair Shveda, the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed Building Demolition Delay Waiver is not detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the City with the condition that the covering of but not removal of the brackets around the soffits is allowed. The motion passed and the Building Demolition Delay Waiver petition was approved.

Exhibit A: Application for Building Demolition Delay Waiver received April 2, 2015 and dated April 3, 2015.

5. **321 West Boylston Street (HC-2015-025)**

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: Jane Zottoli
Present Use: Restaurant
Year Built: Circa 1938
Historic Status: MACRIS-listed, fka the West Boylston Street Socony Station
Petition Purpose:

- Reface front columns with stone
- Install wood siding in front of the building over brick
- Install a new awning over front door

- Paint vinyl siding on three sides of building

Nicholas Norton and Andrew Norton appeared on behalf of the application.

Mr. Norton stated there are two columns in front covered in tile and tile will be removed and refaced with ledgerstone and inside the columns will be wood.

Chair Provencher stated that the looking at the MACRIS form that is very clear that the renovations proposed is actually an addition and is not original to the building. Vice-Chair Shevda stated he would agree with that.

Upon a motion by Vice-Chair Shveda and seconded by Secretary McCann the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed Building Demolition Delay Waiver is not detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the City. The motion passed and the Building Demolition Delay Waiver petition was approved.

Exhibit A: Application for Building Demolition Delay Waiver received April 3, 2015 and dated April 3, 2015.

6. 1 Kelley Square (aka 156 Green Street & 240 Harding Street) (HC-2015-023)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: Bay State Investment Fund, LLC
Present Use: Mix used building
Year Built: Circa 1916
Historic Status: MACRIS-listed, fka West Vernon Theatre Block

Petition Purpose:

- Remove Salty Dog signage, metal sign, sign wrap and sign lights
- Remove garage doors and replace with store fronts
- Replace existing door on corner of Water Street & Harding Street
- Remove and replace boarded up storefronts
- Remove plywood to reveal boarded up arched windows and replace broken, unsafe or rotted windows
- Install signage
- Repaint metal detail on three sides of the building
- Replace existing windows on Harding Street with storefront windows

Ed Murphy appeared on behalf of the application. He stated he would like to create a uniform look to the building and reviewed the scope of the work he would like to do.

Mr. Murphy stated that there are arched windows on Water Street, Harding Street and Kelley square and that are covered up and he would like to uncover and if they are found to be broken,

unsafe or rotted he would replace the windows with the same look and feel to match the rest of the arched windows.

Mr. Murphy stated that he would like to replace existing window on Harding Street with storefront windows to match the look and feel of the rest of building.

Chair Provencher asked what type of window is there now and if it was double hung window. Mr. Murphy stated that he was not sure of the type. Chair Provencher stated he can't tell what type of window is behind a due to being covered and Mr. Murphy showed a photo on his cell phone and Chair Provencher stated that it looks like they were double hung 1/1 windows.

Chair Provencher asked on Kelly Square what happens to windows there. Mr. Murphy stated there are garage doors there now and they will remove and replace with storefronts that match storefronts in Kelley Square.

Chair Provencher stated that he sees very little historic material being proposed to be removed but his concern would be the half round windows on the third level that are currently covered and doesn't have problem with plywood being removed but not information has been provided on what they will be replaced and if Mr. Murphy finds out after he has started work that the windows do need to be replaced he would need to come back with proposal on the window replacement to present to the Commission. Mr. Murphy stated that he was okay with that.

Chair Provencher stated that the other issue would be the windows on Harding Street and Mr. Murphy stated Subway wants to put in same type of aluminum storefront and has issue with that as it hard to tell from photographs to tell whether the windows are original and would have issue if they were original and were going to come out.

Mr. Murphy stated that they appear to be a lot newer.

Chair Provencher asked if there was any proposal to modify the masonry opening. Mr. Murphy stated they did want to make it two feet longer than the current window so that it would be closer to the ground.

Secretary McCann asked for what purpose. Mr. Murphy stated that it is the way Subway is now designing their buildings now.

Vice-Chair Shveda stated that he would have a problem with changing the masonry opening as he doesn't think it is something truly needed. Chair Provencher stated that he would agree with that.

Chair Provencher stated that there is extensive storefront work proposed and he is little uncomfortable with some of work proposed as a lot of its covered and they can't tell what is behind it and once material is removed there could be original material in there. Mr. Murphy stated that the could show them on his phone the interior view.

Commissioner Conroy stated that based on photos she had seen in past for theatres of that era they did not have windows at the bottom.

Chair Provencher stated that if the windows were cut in after the wall was built you see some difference in the mortar but this looks like a pretty good match.

Commissioner Bjork stated that what they were speculating was whether there was original material that there could conceivably original material on Water Street side. Chair Provencher stated that there might be and they like to review the photos Mr. Murphy has on his cell phone.

Mr. Murphy stated that when the previous bar was there they just took everything out and on Harding Street side there is plywood and they will remove and on old photos he has seen it does show it was a storefront.

Vice-Chair Shveda asked Commissioner Conroy what the building was originally used for. Commissioner Conroy stated that it was a theatre.

Chair Provencher asked where the signs would be applied. Mr. Murphy reviewed on the elevations where the signs would be placed and would be mounted onto the brick.

Secretary McCann stated that if possible any sign should be affixed to mortar joints and not to masonry.

Chair Provencher stated that the Commission has reviewed application and they will support most of application but applicant will need to come back with separate application if he needs to replace windows and if he has to enlarge the masonry opening on Harding Street storefront. Mr. Murphy asked if he could keep them the same size and put a store front window in just for security.

Chair Provencher asked if they were wood. Mr. Murphy stated they did look wood but not as dated as others in building.

Vice-Chair Shveda stated the windows don't worry him it is the opening itself.

Chair Provencher stated that having consistency of storefront and overall the proposal would unify things and make it more attractive.

Secretary McCann agreed stating that consistency of design was more important right now as Mr. Murphy is trying to bring back to original look and if the means to doing that is to add some updated storefront style glazing to two of the openings to keep a more consistent design across the storefronts he would support that.

6:55 p.m. – Commission took a recess

6:56 p.m. – Commission came back into regular session

Upon a motion by Vice-Chair Shveda and seconded by Secretary McCann the Commission voted 6-0 that the proposed Building Demolition Delay Waiver is not detrimental to the historical or architectural resources of the City. The motion passed and the Building Demolition Delay Waiver petition was approved.

Exhibit A: Application for Building Demolition Delay Waiver received April 2, 2015 and dated April 2, 2015.

7. 35 Hermon Street (HC-2015-022)

Petition: Building Demolition Delay Waiver
Petitioner: 35 Hermon Street, LLC
Present Use: Commercial Building
Year Built: Circa 1888
Historic Status: MACRIS-listed, NRD (National Register District), NRMRA (National Register Multiple Resource Area), fka Junction Shops and Hermon Street
Petition Purpose:

- Demolish 35 Hermon Street including the main block and circa 1950 addition

Doug Kelleher from Epsilon Associates, Inc. appeared on behalf of the application.

Mr. Kelleher stated that they are looking to demolish the building at 35 Hermon Street as the building is in poor condition and rehabilitation is economically unfeasible.

Chair Provencher asked would be intended use if torn down. Mr. Kellehr stated that the property owner proposes to construct a surface parking lot.

Chair Provencher asked for how many cars. Mr. Kelleher stated he was not sure. Commissioner Shveda stated reviewing the plans he didn't think more than 15 vehicles could be parked on the site.

Chair Provencher stated that he did not feel he could support the request as the loss of the building would be a loss for the city and he has seen buildings in worse conditions that could be rehabilitated.

Vice-Chair Shveda stated he would agree with the Chair.

Mr. Kelleher stated that a structural engineer had done some investigation into the building's structural integrity and the engineer believes it is structurally unsound and should be torn down. He stated that there are areas of rotted wood decking as well as a fair amount of ponding in the lower levels from that that had infiltrated through the roof.

Mr. Kelleher stated that an environmental engineer may have also uncovered some problems and provided a letter.

The Commission reviewed the material presented but felt that an actual report from the environmental engineer would give them a clearer picture of what is going on at the site. Mr. Kelleher stated he would probably have that report in a week or so.

Secretary McCann stated that if the building was in such poor structural condition and had serious environmental issues he believes the city would have stepped in to condemn the building.

All Commission members agree that they did not feel that tearing down the building just to add a few parking spaces would not be something they could support. They also did not feel enough detail had been presented and felt a site view of the property would be appropriate as that would also give Mr. Kelleher time to submit the more detailed environmental report.

Upon a motion by Chair Provencher and seconded by Secretary McCann the Commission voted 6-0 to continue the item until the May 14, 2015 Historical Commission meeting and to extend the constructive grant deadline until June 2, 2015.

Chair Provencher stated that Ms. Steele would coordinate with Mr. Kelleher on a site view time and requested that Mr. Kelleher submit the environmental report to Ms. Steele by May 11, 2015 in order that it can be emailed to Commission members for their review.

Exhibit A: Application for Building Demolition Delay Waiver received April 2, 2015 and dated March 27, 2015.

OTHER BUSINESS

8. Request for Letter of Support for television monitor first floor of City Hall
9. Request for Letter of Support for art work placement first floor of City Hall

Items #8, #9 were taken contemporaneously.

Che Anderson & Hung Nguyen from the Office of the City Manager's Office upon behalf of the items.

Mr. Nguyen stated that they are looking to place a television monitor at the information booth on the first floor of City Hall that would scroll information such as meeting schedules, trash pick up days, snow bans, etc.

The Commission agreed they all like the idea but thought that the monitor being presented was too big. Mr. Nguyen stated that they have contact the vendor and a smaller version is available. The Commission that the Mr. Nguyen should check that were monitor is placed doesn't impede any access and provided feedback on where they would like monitor to be placed.

Mr. Anderson stated that the art work proposal is for the first floor of City Hall and will give opportunity to the youth to display their art in City Hall and four pieces will be selected each year.

Upon a motion by Chair Provencher and seconded by Secretary McCann the Commission voted 6-0 to issue a letter of support.

10. Communications Received:

- a. Letter from Massachusetts Historical Commission; re: Worcester Common Oval dated April 13, 2015 and received April 16, 2015.

Ms. Steele stated that the Commissioner of the Parks Department would be attending a meeting in next few months and providing an overview of the scope of the project.

- b.** Letter from MacRostie Historic Advisors requesting Letter of Support for Osgood Bradley Building, 18 Grafton Street received via email on April 16, 2015.

Upon a motion by Chair Provencer and seconded by Commissioner Bjork the Commission voted 6-0 to issue a Letter of Support.

- c.** Letter from Tremont Preservation Services, LLC requesting a Letter of Support for Royal Worcester Corset Company, 30 Wyman Street received via email April 14, 2015.

Upon a motion by Chair Provencer and seconded by Commissioner Bjork the Commission voted 6-0 to issue a Letter of Support.

ADJOURNMENT

Upon a motion the Commission adjourned the meeting at 8:00 p.m.